Bachelor Thesis in Peace and Development Studies

Non-governmental organizations
From being a bystander to becoming a resourceful force with regards to World Bank projects.

Author: Ebba Tufvesson
Tutor: Lennart Wohlgemuth
Examinator: Christopher High
Department: Peace and Development
Semester: Autumn 2017
Course Code: 2FU33E
Abstract

A number of NGOs follow the international development debate and are active in trying to influence important actors in the field. The impact of NGOs on large international actors such as the World Bank has for example been an important topic of discussion. The continuance of research on the development of NGOs in the World Bank is important for future work in the sector, both for NGOs and for the civil society.

As important representatives of the civil society, NGOs have been the force to rely on and confine to. When examining NGOs impact on the World Bank, there are two levels to the research. Most previous research on NGOs as influencers in the World Bank has dealt with the overall impact of NGOs on the World Bank on policy level. This research sets out to investigate the second level of impact that NGOs have on the World Bank on project level to a major extent it relates to NGOs in the partner states. The study uses qualitative methods and an abductive approach in a desk study as the chosen method for collecting and assessing data. It takes its basis in Gramsci’s theory on civil society when examining existing work and uses as the theoretical framework.

From the findings of the study it can be deduced that that NGOs impact on the World Bank projects can be essential for the success of the Bank. Starting from a small platform where NGOs were only invited on occasion to play ‘roles’ as a favor to the Bank, the NGOs are today recognized for their efficiency in Bank-financed projects where a good cooperation with locals is seen as important for the success of the project.

Keywords: NGO, international actors, the World Bank, impact, projects.
# Table of Contents

ABSTRACT ......................................................................................................................... 1
TABLE OF CONTENTS ....................................................................................................... 2
LIST OF FIGURES ............................................................................................................. 3
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS ............................................................................................... 3
1. INTRODUCTION ............................................................................................................. 4
  1.1 Research Problems and Relevance ............................................................................ 4
  1.2 Objective ..................................................................................................................... 6
  1.3 Research Questions .................................................................................................... 7
  1.4 Structure of the Thesis .............................................................................................. 7
2. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK ....................................................................................... 8
  2.1 Gramsci’s Civil Society Theory ................................................................................... 8
  2.2 Review of Existing Literature ................................................................................. 12
3. METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK ............................................................................ 13
  3.1 Critical Analysis of Sources .................................................................................... 15
  3.2 Primary and Secondary Sources ............................................................................. 16
  3.3 Limitations and Delimitations .................................................................................. 16
  3.4 Ethical Considerations ............................................................................................. 17
4. DEFINING NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS ............................................ 17
5. PRESENTATION OF RESEARCH RESULTS ............................................................... 19
  5.1 Previous Work .......................................................................................................... 19
  5.2 The World Bank and NGOs ....................................................................................... 24
  5.3 NGO Development and Projects ............................................................................. 30
6. ANALYSIS .................................................................................................................... 32
  6.1 Gramsci .................................................................................................................... 32
  6.2 Cooperation .............................................................................................................. 34
7. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS ............................................................. 37
  7.1 Research Questions .................................................................................................. 38
8. REFERENCES ................................................................................................................. 41
  8.1 Bibliography ............................................................................................................ 41
  8.2 Journals ................................................................................................................... 41
List of Figures

Figure 5.1.1 ........................................................................................................23
Figure 5.1.2 ........................................................................................................27

List of abbreviations

ACF - Action Contre la Faim
CDF - Community Development Fund
CODE - Committee on Development Effectiveness
EFSA - Emergency Food Security Assessment
FAO - Food and Agriculture Organization
INGO - International Non-Governmental Organization
LDIF - Livestock Development Investment Fund
ILPM - Integrated Lean Project Management
NGO - Non-Governmental Organization
OD - Operational Directive
OED - Operations Evaluation Department
OPN - Operational Policy Note
PCU - Project Coordination Unit
RSDU - Resident Missions and Regional Social Development Unit
UN - United Nations
UNICEF - United Nations Children’s Fund
WFP - World Food Programme
1. Introduction

1.1 Research Problems and Relevance

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) have long acted the voices of the people in societies. Starting out small only engaging in societies on a restricted level, NGOs today are involved at macro level, including the large international corporations that are working on international level. In order to create a foundation for this research paper, some focus will lie on the history and development of non-governmental organizations in order to provide information on the evolution of their impact. NGOs have long been carrying the voices of the people to governments and large institutions, making the small man a strong voice to be accounted for. NGOs started off small, some NGOs are still small and they are all working on different levels towards separate goals. What the NGOs around the world have in common is their desire for change and development of policies.

The commitment and dedication from NGOs has developed throughout decades regarding international questions and policies, and with this desire to develop they have become a resourceful force for the people. Engaging in large corporations has helped NGOs push the societies’ questions forward, but also enabled them to be part of the ongoing projects of large international corporations. NGOs have been recognized for their expertise in previous projects that the World Bank later supported as a result of success in projects that were deemed impossible by governments.

The topic of NGOs and their true impact on society has been highlighted by some researches in the past, as to present the nature of their work. For example, F. I. Shihata examines NGO development within the World Bank in his symposium World Bank and Non-Governmental Organizations from 1992, which will be further explained in the findings chapter. NGOs have experiences press in the way they chose to get involved in large questions and projects. The press that has been directed towards NGOs in the past is that their strong desire to be part of the large corporations might hinder their critical thinking towards being exploited. The World Bank has also had their fair share of press, both in critique, as the one of James A. Paul, which will be mentioned in chapter 2.2, where he claims that the World Bank tried to
legitimize their projects from the inside. In previous research, the main focus has lied in the international policies of the World Bank. However, it is of utmost importance that the work of the NGOs in projects by the World Bank is recognized and brought into the light as their power in society increases. The impact of NGOs on the World Bank must be examined in order to present a true picture of the work that powerful organizations have, and to what extent they rely on and help each other. In addition, the research hopes to clarify debates that have surfaced during the years regarding the true intentions of the World Bank when cooperating with NGOs.

One actor that has over time largely been investing in the cooperation between NGOs and large international actors is the World Bank. The World Bank has existed since 1944 is today being driven by two major goals, to “end extreme poverty within a generation” and “boost shared prosperity” by 2030 (The World Bank, 2017). The impact of NGOs on the World Bank can be divided into two levels. Firstly, there is the overall observation of NGOs impact on the international policies provided by the World Bank. For example, NGOs being invited to large meetings or affecting decisions by protesting. Secondly, there is the level of NGOs impact on projects by the World Bank, the inclusion of NGOs in different countries where their expertise is essential for the cooperation between local people and the World Bank. This research will focus on the second level and examine the work and impact of NGOs on World Bank-financed projects as well as the development NGOs have made in regards to their role in designing projects.

The focus of this research lies in the impact of NGOs on the World Bank projects where they have been involved. The study of NGOs impact on the World Bank could provide future researchers with data to keep the update on their development going. This gap in the research from the beginning of NGOs to their involvement in projects in present time leaves much to be interpreted by researchers. This study hopes to provide some clarity and lessen the gap of the previous collected data.

Without continued updates of the development of NGOs, tracking the change that is happening in the world of NGOs and larger organizations is impossible. The impact of NGOs on large organizations and the cooperation between the two is not only the works of an
organization, but the representation of the small societies in the major sectors such as the World Bank. The evaluations made within the World Bank are not sufficient, the proof of a better world is the ultimate evaluation of work. Previous debates on the subject include the actual intentions of the World Bank when including NGOs in projects, whether it could be for personal benefits or not.

This research is relevant for the future as the impact of NGOs on large international actors can determine the development of NGOs in the power of their drive and involvement in large international actors missions around the world. If the research shows that the impact NGOs have on the World Bank is limited to the power that the international organizations have over NGOs, future research can be made in order to change and further the work of the NGOs.

With this research, it is the hope that evidence of data will provide a clear picture of NGO involvement and interaction in the World Bank projects throughout time. The aim is to lessen the gap between previous research on the subject while at the same time provide a nuanced view on the work of NGOs in the World Bank. The research intends to highlight the work of NGOs and the journey which they have taken to establish respect and trust within the Bank.

1.2 Objective
The objective of this research is to provide a view on NGOs power on large international actors with a focus on the World Bank projects. Since research in the past has focused mainly on one of either side with civil society or large international actors, the lack of a comparing study of the two leading factors of change in the global sense is eminent. The outcome of the research is to present a view in which the impact of NGOs is highlighted. If the result proves a lack in impact of NGOs on the World Bank, the hope for the future is that this research can provide knowledge towards solutions in order to increasing the impact NGOs have on the World Bank.
1.3 Research questions

The research aims to provide a clear view of NGOs impact on the World Bank and if changes that have been made in the World Bank could be related to the effects of civil society. If the World Bank has made changes because of NGOs, the way NGOs have made the World Bank change is of great importance. In order to conclude the aim of this research, the following questions are being formulated:

- What impact does NGOs have on the World Bank?
- Has the efforts made by NGOs over time increased their impact on the World Bank?
- Are NGOs becoming more influential over time?

1.4 Structure of the thesis

This study is divided into seven chapters. The first chapter is the introduction and includes the research problem, objective, existing literature, relevance and research questions. In this chapter the research problem, the lack in existing research on the study, will be discussed in depth. It will in addition mention the objective of this research in order to present the reader with an understanding to what this research aim is. As a final remark, the research questions will be presented for the reader to understand the perspective of the study.

The second chapter presents the Theoretical framework where the theory used is presented as well as a review of existing literature. In this chapter, the theory by Antonio Gramsci presented and explained in detail. The theory will be used as a framework throughout the study when reading and assessing the future findings. Further, the chapter presents a review of existing literature.

The third chapter is the Methodological framework which presents the methods used when conducting the research, the questions used based on the theory, primary and secondary sources, critical analysis of sources, limitations and ethical considerations. In this chapter, the
questions posed from Antonio Gramsci’s theory on Civil Society is presented. The questions are used when examining findings and are presented in order to provide a clear frame of reference.

Chapter four, *Defining non-governmental organizations*, presents the definition of the use of NGOs in this study. As the definition of NGOs can differ from organizations and private persons, a chapter on the definition used on NGOs in this study prevents any confusion.

The fifth chapter is *Presentation of research results* which presents the results that has been collected from previous work on the subject. Here the existing research on the topic is presented in the order of previous work, the world bank and NGOs and finally NGO development and projects.

In chapter six, *analysis*, the findings are analyzed based on Antonio Gramsci’s theory where the concepts presented earlier are connected to the findings and the cooperation between NGOs and the World Bank is examined from previous research and own ideas are incorporated in the text based on the findings.

Chapter seven, *conclusion*, the results are highlighted from the analysis chapter. The text is tied to the introduction where the research problem was posed as well as the findings that the research has presented. The conclusion is a concise wrap-up on the analysis where a wider context of the findings is presented.

### 2. Theoretical Framework

#### 2.1 Gramsci’s civil society theory

The importance of Civil Society has long been of importance, however, the concept increased momentum in the last decades. The idea of Civil Society can be interpreted in different ways depending on the person. Antonio Gramsci’s thoughts on Civil Society is unique in the dimensions he presents regarding the subject and introduced new ways of thinking, ways that
had not been discussed previously. The idea of hegemony by Gramsci is the most popular idea presented as he examines the way states incorporate cultural institutions in order to “maintain power in capitalist societies” (Chakraborty, 2016:1).

Antonio Gramsci was an Italian journalist who took part in creating the Italian Communist party in 1921. The work on civil society by Gramsci, produced in his “Prison Notebooks”, have been acclaimed as “the most original and important features of the political theory” (Buttigieg, 1995). Gramsci presented nuanced dimensions to the idea of civil society through his notebooks from prison and his theory of cultural hegemony is one of the aspects that makes his work stand out (Chakraborty, 2016:1).

During his time in prison, Gramsci wrote the “Prison Notebooks”. Although the works of Gramsci produced in prison were never meant for publications, they have received praise within the academic circle as his greatest work. However, because the writings never were thought to be published, his work leaves much room for interpretations and at times his writing can prove difficult to understand (Chakraborty, 2016:1).

Gramsci’s concept of civil society is not defined in one sentence. Civil society in the eyes of Gramsci was not considered harmful for the state, but instead is “its most resilient constitutive element” although on first appearance, the state could be seen as a political society (Buttigieg, 1995:4). The complex relationship between political society and civil society is pointed out by Gramsci as he is convinced that their relationship contributes important strata of dominance, and also to maintain the intricate lower levels of alternative strata. The maintenance of a subordinate strata level is well highlighted in the work of Gramsci as the strata from the relationship between political society and civil society helps remain the order of the state (Buttigieg, 1995:4).

The marxist thinking of Benedetto Croce influenced Gramsci in Croce’s way of perceiving the state as an “ethical state” or “cultural state”, whose goal was to build the population up toward a specific cultural level. The school is highlighted by Gramsci and seen as an important factor when building the population up, meanwhile the court is described as a negative factor. Gramsci did not identify the state as simply an “apparatus of government”
but also included the “private” apparatus of “hegemony” or “civil society”. Gramsci recognizes that the idea of civil society and state varies from situation to situation as well as state to state and especially recognizes the difference between West and East when speaking of state and civil society (Chakraborty, 2016:24).

Gramsci has several ways of describing the States relationship with civil society. In his notebooks he described the State in the West as “an outer ditch, behind which there stand a powerful system of fortresses and earthworks”. In other passages he highlights the balance between political society and civil society, and has also been described as being the mathematical form of “political society + civil society”. That “civil society and State are one and the same” has also been a main point presented by Gramsci (Hoare & Smith, 2005:207-208).

The concept of hegemony was not unknown before Gramsci, although the expansion of hegemony as an “essential element” which enabled the ruling class to remain an authoritarian power was originated by Gramsci. Before Gramsci, both Plekhanov with other Russian Marxists of the 1880s are believed to have first used the term “hegemony”, according to Perry Anderson. Although the term had been used before and were interpreted as the working class gaining power, Gramsci identified meaning of “hegemony” as not only being only about gaining power, but maintaining that power. The idea of hegemony to Gramsci was therefore more than a way to obtain power for the majority, he saw past the access to power and instead focused on maintaining what had been created. While Gramsci’s theory has aspects of Marxism in the ideology, Gramsci identified hegemony as a strategy and not a way to establish dominance (Chakraborty, 2016:23-24).

Gramsci wanted subaltern classes to understand and see the socio-economic ways of the society. If the subaltern classes would see the structures they were submerged in by society, Gramsci believed it would lead to them creating their own class of intellectuals, a major factor in overthrowing the capitalist hegemony. When the ruling class was subdued to its own hegemony, Gramsci found it to be impossible for them to revolt by the proletariat. He also believed that the working class should participate in creating a counter hegemony and exit the narrow class interest they were in. When understanding Gramsci’s idea of hegemony, the
correlation between state and its institutions is of great importance because of the
observations made by Gramsci on institutions who helped propagate the idea of the state in
order for it to maintain its hegemony (Chakraborty, 2016:23).

The variations of topics analyzed by Gramsci bolstered his perception of civil society.
Gramsci coined the theory on civil society which centered around hegemony in order to
deﬁne political domination that derives from ideological domination. The superstructure of
society is where Gramsci believes that civil society is located, referring to institutions, forms
of consciousness and political and cultural practices (Chakraborty, 2016:25).

Gramsci draws the idea of hegemony from Marxism’s “false consciousness”, a state in which
the dominated classes of a society are in a befuddled state of consciousness to their
subordinate position to the ideological ruling of the ruling class. (Katz, 2010:2) The
complexity of the civil society and hegemony relationship is central to Gramsci’s theory of
civil society (Katz, 2010:8). According to Gramsci, subaltern classes will beneﬁt from civil
society in their growth as they realize their true potential and develop towards a leading actor
(Chakraborty, 2016:25).

Hegemony according to Gramsci is based mainly on power obtained by the combination of
force and consent. The majority, accounted for in the organs of public opinion, for example
newspapers and associations, is always the aim of appearance from the powerful forces
(Hoare & Smith, 2005:80). A class is dominant by being ‘leading’ and ‘dominant’, using
leadership within the classes of allies and ‘dominance’ towards enemies (Hoare & Smith,
2005:57).

To truly understand Gramsci’s idea of civil society, Chakraborty believes that it is important
to include his early writings when examining his ideas. The ideological transformation is
noticeable when looking into the early thoughts of Gramsci. One example is the new
dimension he presented on the role of the Party in revolution presented by Marx and Lenin.
Gramsci here highlighted the manipulation by the Fascists as a strategy for the working class
in order to gain the support from the class. Education of culture was here emphasised as a
way of informing the people and thereby invoke a counter hegemony which would ultimately topple existing domination (Chakraborty, 2016:26).

Today, the state uses civil society organizations to expand their influence. Gramsci’s theory on civil society pointed this out while being on the side of civil society as he preferred the ideological hegemony that civil society stood for and not the brutality the state uses to increase power (Chakraborty, 2016:26).

2.2 Review of existing literature

When researching the topic, the literature incorporated in the research will be of previous research and projects as the data and development through time will be most evident when looking at the past. The research will incorporate the past of NGOs and the World Bank, both in terms of previous reviews of work as well as their history from small organizations to multidimensional forces of power towards a sustainable future.

Previous existing literature on the topic of NGOs impact on the World Bank can be found in a majority on the overall international impact level, however when analyzing the part NGOs play in projects, the previous research is slim. The OED (Operations Evaluation Department) presents several points of data on collaborations with the NGOs and the World Bank, one example is the Précis that was released in 1999 examining the true outcomes of a NGO-Bank collaboration which will be examined later in the text.

By firstly presenting previous research on NGOs development with the World Bank, a foundation can be laid in order to further present past projects made by the World Bank where NGOs have been incorporated. The research will in addition incorporate books written by the World Bank OED department of their development and their view on the NGO cooperation. By using the method of presenting the development of NGOs in the World Bank and later comparing this to projects closer in time, the research hopes to provide a clear picture of the development of NGOs as seen from rapports from a large international corporation.
Previous articles and papers that can be found on the subject of NGOs impact on the World Bank focus on the work of the World Bank and how they incorporate selected NGOs into their work around the world. An example of this is the symposium *The world bank and non-governmental organizations* by Ibrahim F.I Shihata from 1992. Other writings focus on the economic factor of the NGOs cooperation with the World Bank and some articles talk about the limitations in the work of the NGOs, for example the paper *Corporate Social Responsibility, Public Policy, and NGO Activism in Europe and the United States: An Institutional-Stakeholder Perspective* by Jonathan P. Doh and Terrence R. Guay from 2006 where they incorporate the phenomenon of Corporate Social Responsibility into the critique against NGOs. The research for this paper, however, will explore the impact of NGOs on the World Bank on project level and how the work of the NGOs have affected the World Bank in the past as well as the future possible outcomes as a result from what have been done in the past.

The World Bank has been criticised by James A. Paul, Executive director on the Global Policy Forum in 1996 for being able to “buy small grassroots NGOs in the South”, this in order to legitimize their projects from the inside. (Paul, 1996). The critique raised against the World Bank will be incorporated in the analysis below to see if the World Bank follows civil society requests from NGOs they are financially benefiting from.

### 3. Methodological framework

This study will be comprised of an abductive process as a qualitative desk study through an analytical framework. The study hopes to fill the gap between recent work and the present time. The previous research has been outdated and an update in the field of NGO-Bank cooperation was considered to be well past due. The key stakeholder of this study will be the NGO-Bank cooperation with a focus on NGOs role in projects. The findings on the NGO role in Bank-financed projects will be studied in the light of the theory by Antonio Gramsci in order to critically assess civil society's role with large international corporations.
When applying the abductive reasoning to the research, the start of the research is comprised of incomplete observations that would lead to the author towards the most likely answer and conclusion. The abductive reasoning helps the author on the journey from presumed conclusions of observations to actual facts of the reality (Bryman, 2012:401).

A theoretical framework will be applied to the research of the paper in order to properly examine the findings and evolution of NGOs impact on the World Bank. The analytical framework includes the Civil Society theory by Antonio Gramsci. Questions will be conducted in order to critically assess the research findings and compare to the theory. In this research, the observations made will be filtered through questions using Antonio Gramsci’s theory on civil society. The idea of false consciousness will help to examine the work collected from the World Bank to understand the view of NGOs from the World Bank. Taking that into consideration when reading the collected data and texts incorporated in this research, the following questions will help critically examine the findings from Gramsci’s theory; (a) Are large corporations (the World Bank) using “false consciousness” when incorporating NGOs in decisions?; (b) Are NGOs rising from being a “dominated class” to becoming part of the leading actors such as the World Bank?; (c) To what extent is the World Bank working together with NGOs?; (d) How did NGOs become leading actors in the decision making of the World Bank?

A desk study will be conducted where previous studies will be examined together with the work of non-governmental organizations when that work is correlated to some of the work of the World Bank. As the topic has been researched before to some extent, a field study was not deemed necessary in order to collect sufficient data on the subject. A desk study was considered the best option in order to collect and compare previous data that has been written.

A field study was not considered to be the ultimate method for this study even though the material was limited. A major reason for this is the limited time allotted to this research. The idea of critically comparing and analyzing existing data was decided to be the best method in order to answer the research questions that had been posed. An attempt to find information
interviews at the end of the study was made but had to be reconsidered as time presented as an issue for both the author and the interviewees.

3.1 Critical analysis of sources

The sources chosen for this research are based on the level of evaluation they pose. Critical texts posted by the World Bank have been prioritized in order to present the picture of NGOs journey through the eyes of a large international actor. Project rapports from the World Bank website have been incorporated in the text as they pose reliable sources for correct data and can therefore help provide a clear picture of the NGOs involvement in projects. A book highlighting the first 30 years of the World Bank helped provide information about the development of the organization from the views of previous employees and presidents. In addition, previous work on the subject were chosen for the representation of earlier research. By incorporating previous research in the findings section, the text could later critically assess what has been done before and what could be lacking. It is also important to include other views on the subject to highlight the new ways of studying the subject.

The four major sources used to conduct this study are Ibrahim F. I. Shihata’s symposium called World Bank and Non-Governmental Organizations, Robert E. Kelly’s research Assessing the Impact of NGOs on IGOs: The World Bank and International Monetary Fund, The book World Bank Operations Evaluation Department : The First 30 Years by Grasso, Wasty & Weaving and a Précis released by World Bank Operations Evaluation Department.

Both Shihata and Kelly have conducted previous research on the subject of NGOs impact on the World Bank and were therefore seen as valuable resources for the comparison of existing work to the aim of the research. Both authors presented valid points and observations to their research that fit the frame for the aim of this study as well as posed questions that could help bring out new ideas on the subject. When implementing the work of Kelly and Shihata, the importance of staying unbiased is highlighted. As the research could be seen as biased from the authors perspective and the findings may be concluded from a point of view from the
authors intentions of the text, reading the studies critically is emphasised in order to present the findings to this study in a neutral way.

The two other main sources of this text are both conducted by the World Bank, here it is also important to critically assess the texts before including them in the study. As the World Bank has written the texts, a biased tone can be detected or they may not present negative data. In order to gain a while perspective of the data presented, it is important to include other relevant sources in a triangulation method.

3.2 Primary and Secondary sources

As the research is a desk study, the sources used are secondary sources, mainly such that are conducted by the NGOs and the World Bank or employees of the two actors of this research. By using secondary sources, the research will have solid foundation presented from the sight of the two sources being analyzed as well as data presented from critically conducted previous researches.

3.3 Limitations and Delimitations

The civil society impact on large international actors is a field to study in consideration with endless perspectives that could be applied to the research. In order to be able to present a clear endpoint to the research, the paper was decided to become delimited down to NGOs impact on the World Bank. The key stakeholder of the study is NGOs that have been used as the base for the research and comparison to the World Bank.

The limitations presented with this research is the reliance on others work as part of the study. When conducting a desk study, the sources used are from publications that have the risk of being biased and must therefore be viewed from a sceptical perspective. In order to properly use written sources, a triangulation method will be used to test statements with other writings and thereafter conclude if the stated fact is indeed reliable or not.
An additional delimitation is the focus range, as there has been much written on the general idea of NGOs and their impact on the World Bank, this research intends to delimitate to the projects of the World Bank and not the overall impact on the world Bank. The research will be delimited to projects by the World Bank where NGOs have been involved. As interviews, mainly informational interviews, were deemed to take up too much time, the desk study is delimited to only existing literature such as researches and journals.

3.4 Ethical considerations

The ethical considerations to take into account are limited in this research. As the use of a desk study will be applied to the study, the lack of interaction with people leaves little to be considered in terms of questions to be asked and sensitive subjects to avoid.

The research intends to keep an unbiased tone throughout the whole text when analyzing and presenting previous data. However, some previous data or projects could have a bias tone and therefore presents an issue if the collected information is not properly examined and presented through a triangulation method.

To keep a neutral tone throughout the entire research is a challenge as findings may convince the reader to adapt to beliefs of the author. In order to stay unbiased and present a clear picture of both sides of a story, keeping to the chosen framework and analytical tools will lead to a proper presentation of results.

4. Defining Non-governmental organizations

If the term “non-governmental organization” was to be taken literally, the descriptions are endless. The definitions could range from educational institutions such as Yale or Harvard, even for-profit firms like Walmart or organizations such as Mensa (Werker & Faisal, 2007:2-3).
As the term “Non-governmental organizations” (NGOs) will be used in the text, NGOs that will be included are those who fall under the definition of being a non-profit organization run by voluntary groups of people. Raising the voices of citizens to Governments is one of many services NGOs perform as their humanitarian functions. Working with poor people in poor countries is an additional part of NGOs. The work carried out by NGOs can be both bilateral aid agencies as well as independently. The sizes of NGOs range from working at headquarters, complex organizations or as individuals all over the world. As NGOs have developed throughout the years, they have become more known as civil society organizations because of the work they do. In addition, NGOs also provide information of political participation as well as monitor policies. The level of the NGOs are both local, national and international, however, international non-governmental organizations (INGOS) will be referred to as INGOS (Werker & Faisal, 2007:4-7).

Texts presented from the World Bank will be included in the text where the NGOs will be mentioned as per the Bank’s definition. The Bank defines NGOs as “private organizations that pursue activities to relieve suffering, promote the interests of the poor, protect the environment, and stimulate community development” (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:1). According to their Operational Note 14.70, the Bank describes non-governmental organizations as “characterized primarily by humanitarian or cooperative, rather than commercial, objectives... that pursue activities to relieve suffering, promote the interests of the poor, protect the environment, provide basic social services, or undertake community development” (Werker & Faisal, 2007:3). The use of the Bank’s definition of NGOs in their texts is in compliance to the definition by the author of this thesis and therefore the project texts and investigations by the World Bank can be incorporated in the thesis.
5. Presentation of research results

This chapter presents findings on existing research. Firstly, the previous work on similar research will be presented in order to provide background on the presented issue of outdated work mentioned in the introduction chapter. Secondly, the relationship between NGOs and the World Bank is presented. Finally, a part on NGO development and projects is presented to provide background as well as present research in order to provide sufficient data for the analysis chapter.

5.1 Previous work

The relevance and contributing factor the NGOs had on Bank activities became more prominent in the early 1980’s according to a research conducted by Ibrahim F. I. Shihata in the symposium named World Bank and Non-Governmental Organizations. Shihata mentions that before 1981, NGOs related to the World Bank mainly by receiving periodically invitations to play roles in Bank-financed activities. This involvement later developed into the NGOs being part of adopting guidelines in the development of a framework where NGOs came of use in Bank-financed projects. An Operational Policy Note (OPN) 10.05 was issued by the Bank to specify the roles NGOs, as well as the policies of other development institutions, would have in Bank-financed projects. According to Shihata, the increasing access to those who benefit from the Bank projects was one of several benefits presented as a result of OPN 10.05, for example the risk of hostile confrontations and uncooperative groups decreased with the assistance of local NGOs in the Philippines Urban Projects (Shihata, 1992:624-25).

A long goal for the World Bank had been to implement NGOs in their work, according to Shihata. It was the growing importance and influence the NGOs showed in the World Bank related issues regarding development that the relationship between NGOs and the Bank developed. Interaction with NGOs increased, particularly in social issues and environmental questions as NGOs grew past the project financing interactions since 1988 (Shihata, 1992:623).
With the help of OPN 10.05, Shihata writes that NGOs now faced the possibility of being involved in all stages of Bank-financed projects for the first time, such as appraisal/financing, implementation, project identification and evaluation. In September 1988, the newly appointed president Barber Conable, in an address to the Bank/Fund Annual Meeting, spoke up for the collaboration with NGOs saying “NGOs in many developing countries have enormous potential for flexible and effective action. I have encouraged Bank staff to initiate a broadened dialogue with NGOs … [, and] I hope and fully expect that this collaboration will continue and flourish.” (Shihata, 1992:625).

The work of NGOs was greatly appreciated by the Bank as a prominent improvement in the noticeable gaps in state and market failures was made together with an increase in public participation within projects. The World Bank learned that assistance from local NGOs in borrowing countries helped foster national development. Bank-NGO cooperation saw more benefits than expected problems with a difference of priorities from the NGO side (Shihata, 1992:625).

The increased involvement of NGOs in the Bank led to an adoption of the Operational Directive (OD) 14.70 in 1989. The idea of the Operational Directive was for it to function as a guide in the collaboration with NGOs by adapting guidelines from OPN 10.05 and lessons learned from more than 200 Bank-financed projects, Shihata writes. The influence of NGOs lies in the fact that an intergovernmental organization, such as the World Bank, works with member governments when working in operations of loans (Shihata, 1992:626).

In 1991, the most common place for NGOs to be involved were in project implementation however there was an interesting development towards involvement in co-financing, design and monitoring and evaluation. This year, the involvement of NGOs showed 20% in involved projects, 19% contribution of project design, 11% co-finance, provided 8% of the monitoring and evaluation of Bank-financed projects and 43% in implementation. The work of the NGOs has been most prominent in the environment sector when assisting governments develop sector-wide strategies (Shihata, 1992:628).
NGO representatives were employed by the Bank by the same guidelines as consultants. The Bank benefits from these collaborations by accessing the knowledge of local institutional, technological and socio-cultural environments that the NGOs possess. Aga Khan Foundation, World Wildlife Fund and the World Conservation Union are all NGOs that have helped co-finance specific components in Bank-financed projects (Shihata, 1992:629).

NGO involvement has been critiqued for possibly being “window dressing” by the Bank and some commentators expressed their scepticism against the Bank projects. Five steps are highlighted in order for the continuance of successful interactions with NGOs. Firstly, the active pursuit of NGO involvement in Bank-finance projects must be made in a way that benefits are prominent. The second step highlights OD 14.70, stating that when Bank-financed projects are designed, the early stages must include local NGOs. Thirdly, a two-way dialogue must be prominent in shared concerns, on all levels and not only in NGO-World Bank issues. Fourth, continued updates on previous projects in order to review and strengthen the relationship. Fifth and final, openness regarding policies and operations by the Bank are made available for both NGOs as well as the public in order to reach total transparency which has been highlighted by borrowing member countries (Shihata, 1992:641).

Additional research on the effects of NGOs is the research by Robert E. Kelly, on IGOs such as the World Bank as well as the International Monetary Fund as the focus, examining in the text the impact that NGOs have on engagements in the World Bank. The research question presented by Kelly reads “We know that nongovernmental organizations (NGOs) mobilize heavily around intergovernmental organizations (IGOs), but do they actually impact them? If so, why, and if not, why not?” To answer these questions, three hypotheses were presented:

_Hypothesis 1 (H1). If NGO activity jeopardizes the IGOs continued existence, or the maintenance/expansion of its budget and/or issue briefs, then an IGO will mildly adapt its practices to include NGOs in nonbinding ways._ With the increase of funding in both the World Bank and the International Monetary Fund, the organizations has seen additional criticism as well. The first response is usually cynical or defensive, opting towards the “buying off” of NGO critics. (Kelly, 2011:1)
Hypothesis 2 (H2). If NGO participation improves the mission effectiveness of an IGO is operations, then an IGO will willingly adapt its practices to utilize NGO expertise. It is often a requirement of bureaucracies to reach goals. NGOs may have the potential of benefitting IGOs, it fosters the business-like relationship, making the NGOs “service providers” and IGOs to act as “superiors.”

Hypothesis 3 (H3). If NGOs shift the IGO’s sense of identity to include accountability to non-state actors, then the IGO will accord political space to NGOs as an appropriate entitlement. NGOs go beyond the simple bargaining with Bank “over placement of a dam, and also focus on identifying politics, also called ‘norm entrepreneurship’ against institutions like the World Bank. In order to be represented as a democratic entitlement instead of a privileged interest group that won hard bargaining, NGOs call the practice “civil society” representatives. The shifts of identities happen on a value-level instead of an operational level. The debates raised over the identity of NGOs could rise amongst IGO staff. Instead of being “pressure groups” or “contractors”, NGOs will be seen as “constituents” or “representatives”. (Kelly, 2011:1-2)

The hypotheses are behaviors that can be seen in IGOs. Six indicators are presented in order to provide a formalization of the institutions into “observable empirical implications” to represent the hypotheses. In order to test these hypotheses, the empirical variables were compared with Specific Changes at the IGO Traceable to NGO Pressure together with the hypotheses stated above (see figure 5.1.1) (Kelly, 2011:2).
Kelly states that “empirical data on IGO-NGO interaction” is rare and that formal records of the World Bank and NGO interaction and engagements is only marginally better than the one scarce records of the International Monetary Fund. Kelly used as much quantitative measurements although had to incorporate qualitative methods as they were deemed necessary. In order to collect sufficient data, Kelly had to mix both pre-existing numeric data with field work and add surveys to match the gaps presented in data. There were three ways of collecting data; analyzation of Bank and Fund documents in Annual Reports, conducting a questionnaire that ended in 70 NGO surveys and 39 Bank and Fund staff interviews and finally observing the Spring and Annual Meetings as a participant (Kelly, 2011:4).
The result of the study which was collected through both quantitative and qualitative data, showed that hypothesis number 2, “If NGO participation improves the mission effectiveness of an IGOs operations, then an IGO will willingly adapt its practices to utilize NGO expertise” fit the Bank “very well”. In interviews from the qualitative feedback, the majority of internal informants believed that “the Bank had moved on from defensive positioning (H1) years ago”. Kelly went on to explain that the results from the quantitative questionnaire versus the qualitative differed in responses. From the quantitative, NGOs were divided evenly between H1 and H2 while evidence from the qualitative a higher awareness from the NGOs than admitted about Bank change, quoting it is because “it will give the Bank a win” (Kelly, 2011:5-6).

In the concluding remarks, Kelly writes that NGOs are exploited as “useful vendors” by the World Bank as the Bank responses to NGOs are functional and the research had, in Kelly’s words “worked reasonably well”. The hypotheses proposed in the beginning were assessed and hypotheses 2, the utilitarian approach, was described as posing programmatic change when evaluated and suggested by NGOs for NGO usefulness. As a final assertion, Kelly states that in order to interpret the responses of the findings, more investigation is deemed necessary (Kelly 2011: 8).

5.2 The World Bank and NGOs

The Operations Evaluation Department (OED) is a department within the World Bank that started out as an experimental programme and later developed to become an established department (Grasso, Wasty & Weaving, 2003). The book World Bank Operations Evaluation Department : The First 30 Years is a volume of stories from previous employees and experiences of the World Bank from 1969 to 2002 and the journey that the OED has made from experimental to exceptional. The work in the book describes OED’s work, events as well as seminars and workshops throughout the years and mentions the work NGOs have been incorporated in and the part they have grown into in the development of the department and its work with the World Bank (Grasso, et al., 2003:vii).
A focus on the development factor was expected be prominent in the years after the book was released. Effectivizing development lies deep within the objectives of the Bank and management. The Book mentions in the forewords that the recommendations made by the OED helps the World Bank easier evaluate their strengths and weaknesses in need of work. Identifying gaps within the Bank has helped the progress towards the development effectiveness, although the recognition of Robert Picciottos words on the “lack of adequate database” is mentioned at the end of progresses already made. In the Foreword, James D. Wolfensohn, president between 1995-2005 states that development is the biggest assent as well as concern for the World Bank. He both praises the large development the organization has made since the beginning as well as the many areas that still have much room for improvement. The Millenium Development Goals were a new way in which the organization had to measure their successful track record and the question “Did your project or program do satisfactory?” is changed to “How did it affect the achievement of the Millenium Goals?” (Grasso, et al., 2003:vii).

The OED was first established in 1970, however, it would take 20 years before change in the organization actually began. Jim Wolfensohn the President of the World Bank between 1995-2005 embraced the change that was originally sought by the department to achieve and made the Bank, according to the book, “more oriented to learning and knowledge; more focused on quality; more responsive to its owners, borrowers, staff, and development partners in the private sector and the civil society, and more concerned with governance and institutions” (Grasso, et al., 2003:64).

With the development of the department within the organization change, NGOs were allowed to become a stronger force and part of change. They were especially accounted for in order to evaluate effectiveness within projects of the World Bank. The OED released a Précis in the Spring of 1999 named “Nongovernmental Organizations in World Bank-Supported Projects: A Review” in which the OED had conducted fieldwork in Bolivia, Brazil, India, Kenya and Mali to investigate the true meaning of NGOs involvement to successes in projects. This research provided data on the successes of NGOs in the involvements, which proved to “exceed the reality” according to the OED (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:1).
In the Précis, NGOs are described as “reaching poor communities and remote areas” as well as being a helping hand for local needs and provide services. NGOs had at this time been part of the World Bank projects for two decades, described as being because of the experience brought by the NGOs in both emergency relief and participatory development. The adaptation of ODs is also mentioned and as a result of the OD adapted by the World Bank, NGO involvement was included in half of the projects that were approved by the Bank each year. The introduction by the OED, however, ends it appraisal in the beginning by describing the collaboration between the World Bank and NGOs as “uneven” in both quality and depth. The involvement of OED in the field work of Bolivia, Brazil, India, Keya and Mali presented project succes, however this form of involvement is not the norm (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:1).

Results that were examined proved difficult to determine as the work of NGOs lack precision and definition. “Involvement” has endless possible interpretations, leaving the OED analysis to find it has “little meaning”. The Bank did not take advantage of qualified partners such as bilateral organizations and foundations, proving to be a weakness from the Bank as they missed out on help from people who have had long-term field experience. Although NGOs are a valuable source with their years of experience, the Bank did not take advantage of qualified partners in an efficient way (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:2).

The way of tracking the work of NGOs was not official, for example there were no project files and the involvement from NGOs was tracked in managers’ heads. Monitoring of NGO involvement was seldom conducted and the frustration from small, non-profit groups was observed as the funding from government was described as being “slow and erratic”. The OED stated that in order for projects to succeed, ”several things have to be done well by all the partners”. NGOs are encouraged to be involved when they are in a supportive environment as well as encouraged to work from their existing experience (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:2).
Robert Picciotto, Director-General at the Operations Evaluation Department (1992-2002) addressed the subject of the long process organizational change. Picciotto believed that the issues of introducing new processes and changing agendas did not lie in lack of ideas and people, but time was the factor working against change (Grasso, et al., 2003:64).

The director of the Operations Evaluation Department from 1990-1995, H. Eberhard Köpp, said “from my experience over 26 years in the Bank, I always found that any structure could work if you choose the right people and they chose to make it work” (Grasso, et al., 2003:56).

A $250 million Strategic Compact strategic was introduced by former president James Wolfensohn in 1997 in order to address the critique as well as produce a “quicker, less bureaucratic and more responsive to client demands and global development opportunities” way of the Bank (Grasso, et al., 2003).

In the Précis carried out by the OED in spring 1999, the main questions of the review were (a) Do NGOs increase the effectiveness of bank-supported projects?; (b) What supports-or hinders-successful NGO involvement?; (c) Are there cases where NGO involvement is counterproductive?

The results showed unsatisfactory reports in 19 of total 37 projects of NGO involvement, as can be seen in Table 1. In addition, the data shows that while some projects were marked as unsatisfactory, 12 of the projects were seen as satisfactory and 6 as highly satisfactory (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:2).

Figure 5.2.1

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All Projects</th>
<th>Post-1995 Projects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highly satisfactory</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsatisfactory</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
What could be learned from the data presented in figure 4.2.1 was that in projects where NGOs were involved early and treated as partners positive outcomes were presented. The analysis also states that involvement that were considered successful “often depends on individual Bank or government staff who understand the organizations and take direct action.” (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:2).

The OED presented in the Précis examples that would encourage NGO involvement. These examples included “Providing a supportive environment for NGOs; bringing beneficiaries into the project by encouraging NGOs to act as intermediaries; and evaluating projects and results and communicating effectively to improve working relationships and solve problems.” amongst others. As opposed to the previously mentioned list of encouraging success of projects, the Précis mentioned that in order for a partnership with an NGO to be a failure is not dependent on large issues, rather, the review says “only a few things” can ruin the result of a partnership. The list includes “lack of familiarity among borrowers with the NGO community; nonparticipation by NGOs which leads to weak local ownership; lack of critical details in the specifications for an NGO’s role; poor channels of communications; and provision of insufficient informations to NGOs about how projects will operate.” (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:2-3).

From the review, the OED gave recommendations to the Bank that would improve the statistics for success. These included the development of strategic partnerships, encouragement of governments to enable environments for NGOs as well as create a policy dialogue with borrowers in order to promote good practice in country laws that regulate NGOs, support partnerships by providing proper information about both the Bank and NGOs, preparation of projects to plan for NGO involvement, proper monitoring of NGO participation by the Bank as well as develop a database for NGO tracking of results and resources (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:3).

Management responded to the recommendations with agreements on the conclusions made by the OED. Management acknowledged the changes that had to be made and started by addressing the Good Practice 14.70 use, which emphasises the guidance on dealing with NGOs. Additional recommendations that were met included creating a greater role for The
Resident Missions and Regional Social Development Unit (RSDU) in collaboration with the Bank’s NGO Unit that will monitor and inform of dissemination (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:3).

The Committee on Development Effectiveness (CODE) of the Bank’s Board of Executive Director reviewed the recommendations made by the OED and recognized the response from management. The Committee believed that the Bank should comply to the stressed issue of borrowers understanding and appreciating NGOs value in the work they do around the world as well as supporting governments in updating the regulatory frameworks for NGOs (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:4).

Already two years after the study on NGO projects were made by the OED, management could declare that the reviewed projects were outdated and therefore did not reflect the true current development in Bank-NGO collaboration. NGO-specialist staff had been employed to foster collaboration between NGOs, the Bank and governments and outreach programs introduced to provide knowledge of the Bank and the business practices it provides. Field-level reviews were emphasised by the Bank after the recommendations made by the OED as it had been stated that “projects with NGO involvement” did not identify properly the actual involvement of NGOs (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:4).

A strong collaboration between NGOs and the Bank mentioned in the Précis is the Sodic Lands Reclamation Project in Uttar Pradesh, India. Attempts to improve the ruined soil of Uttar Pradesh had been unsuccessful, even by the government and 1.2 million hectares of farmland were described as having dense, white and highly alkaline soil. In 1980, a local NGO called Sarvodaya Ashram decided to get invested in the project and gathered local farmers to reclaim the land that belonged to them. As the result of this local NGOs attempts to save the soil were successful, a project was approved by the World Bank in 1993 called the Sodic Lands Reclamation Project. The experiences from Sarvodaya Ashram were directly incorporated in the project and the project worked with NGOs. The government-NGO collaboration was hostilely met, however, the record of the project is impressive with the results of helping farmers located in the poorest regions of the state (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:4).
The government-NGO collaboration was made possible because of five factors. The staff and project motivation drove the collaboration forward as the people involved were interested in the continued learning process. In addition, the mediation by participatory project management unit helped the relationship between government and NGOs. The division of roles and responsibilities for the people involved also helped foster the relationship of government and NGOs. The regularity and transparency of information helped all partners keep a positive attitude and was an important factor in the success. Lastly, the monitoring and evaluation on the independent level was made in a professional fashion and therefore fostered the relationship, and success, of the project (World Bank Operations Evaluation Department, 1999:4).

5.3 NGO Development and projects

Non-governmental organizations have since their origin pushed for sustainable development on an international level, according to the International Institute for Sustainable Development. The sights have been set higher for NGOs as they have developed throughout the years, going from state-focus to impacting larger corporations. The impact of NGOs on large international actors has become greater over the years as some NGOs have come to present themselves as partners to the large international actors instead of simply a spokesperson for the society (International Institute for Sustainable Development, 2013).

Several previous projects by the World Bank have been implemented in interaction with NGOs and INGOs. In the project “Improving Livestock Production and Marketing Project - A Pilot”, the focus was on improving the marketing and production of livestock in Central and Eastern Sudan in rainfield areas. From the project outcomes, the Final Project Proposal Results Framework included: (i) Livestock productivity enhanced (reduced mortality, increased weight, and lambing/calving rate); (ii) Increased number of animals traded in target markets rehabilitated by the project by 20 percent by Year 5; (iii) Approaches to mitigate natural resource-based conflicts elucidated; (iv) Producer share of final price (domestic or export) for sheep; and (v) Reliable markets prices available to producers in remote areas (World Bank, 2012:2).
NGOs were initially sought out to be collaborate in the project in order to train owner and trader groups on market price analysis, animal health requirements and group marketing (World Bank, 2012:5). The project report later presented failure of the implementations proposed by the Livestock Development Investment Fund (LDIF) of the NGO recruitment process. The Project Coordination Unit and the Bank conducted, as a result, a mechanism for Local Implementation Unit staff to become engaged in “community mobilization, project design and formulation” and the Community Development Fund provided ILPM staff with necessary training (World Bank, 2012:10).

The recruitment and identification of NGOs that would execute the community mobilization for the LDIF implementation were seen as a failure after several efforts made by the PCU. Despite efforts to advertise the service contract and creating a committee, only one international and two national NGOs were presented for approval. In the end, however, a proposal for request had only been sent in by one NGO that however later did not engage in the assignment. (World Bank, 2012:29) As a result of the lack of involvement by the NGOs, CDF later had to take over and conduct the training (World Bank, 2012:73).

The objective of the Emergency Food Crisis Response and Agricultural Re-Launch Project in the Central African Republic conducted between 2014-2016 was to “protect and rebuild livelihoods, human capital, particularly of children, and to re-launch the productivity of the agriculture sector” (World Bank, 2014:vii).

International NGOs were part of developing the Emergency Food Security Assessment (EFSA) which was used in this project (World Bank, 2014:8). In addition, NGOs took part in developing tools for the monitoring and evaluation (M&E) system in order to establish integration and coherence together with UN agencies and Government Technical Ministries. Partner NGOs would also monitor food security, market and nutrition indicators by using a multi-sectoral surveillance system by Action Contre la Faim (ACF) in areas inaccessible to staff through third-party monitoring (World Bank, 2014:9).
A third project that is still ongoing project in South Sudan called the Emergency Food Crisis Response Project focuses on . The project involves NGOs and relies on the collaboration between NGOs and UN agencies for health and education in the project (World Bank, 2016:34). NGOs are also included as service providers, (World Bank, 2016:41) working on communication and analyzing both environmental and social aspects in order to fill out sub-project applications and proposals. and the MAF recognized the risks of already existing NGOs and Development agency finance projects to feel threatened if they are not included in the process. (World Bank, 2016:41) NGOs will in addition have large responsibility, provide inputs and prepare the end phases for the project (World Bank, 2016:52).

6. Analysis

The beginning of the cooperation between NGOs and the Bank could be seen as a dependent relationship where NGOs were simply incorporated in the Bank’s projects as a favor to the Bank, asking NGOs to ‘play roles’ in “Bank-financed activities”. The relationship evolved when OPN 10.05 were introduced by the Bank that would later strengthen and specify the involvement of NGOs in the World Bank projects (Shihata, 1992:624-625), a move from the Bank that would later produce a domino-effect for the possibilities of NGOs in Bank-financed projects. As NGOs became part of the OPN 10.05, the Bank started treating NGOs as a valuable resource in interaction and projects in countries. The move from the Bank to invest in incorporating NGOs in their projects turned out to be highly beneficial for the Bank and gave NGOs a big opportunity to become part of a larger market with their influences.

6.1 Gramsci

The idea of false consciousness as proposed by Antonio Gramsci, where he discusses the dominated classes of society as being led by the ruling class, could be resembled to the way NGOs were treated by the Bank before 1981. NGOs were only invited on occasion, meaning that the Bank decided when NGOs were invited to be part of their Bank-financed projects and when they were not. These invitations did lead to the growth of NGOs involvement in the Bank, however, during that time the Bank acted as a ruling class and left the NGOs in a false
consciousness of their importance or “subordinate position”. NGOs, however, received over time however a more important position within the Bank and developed towards becoming a leading actor. When comparing this to Gramsci’s theory, this growth could be because of how civil society highlighted NGOs true potential.

The relationship between NGOs and the World Bank has undoubtedly developed throughout decades of interaction and cooperation. Throughout recent projects the struggle of the Bank working with NGOs is still eminent with regard to the issues that evolve when defining what the actual involvement entails. From the project report by the Bank, the lack of NGO recruitment was one issue of the Improving Livestock Production and Marketing Project - A Pilot from 2012. The report states that ultimately, the NGO that had sent a request did not engage in the assignment and the “lack of involvement” by the NGOs was greatly deplored in the report from the Bank. This report comes ten years after the Précis from OED criticising the Bank on several occasions in an assessment of the NGO impact on a project. The Bank was told to create supportive environments for NGOs as well as encourage NGOs to act as intermediaries (The World Bank, 2012).

These rapports from the Bank can be linked to Gramsci talking about the state using civil society organizations to expand their influence. When observing rapports, often presented from the Bank or an organization within the Bank, one cannot help but compare the findings with Gramsci’s critique towards the state. Gramsci referred to the state as “brutal” in the way it gains power, noting that civil society organizations are part of gaining power and “expand influence”. In the rapports published by the Bank, whether they are critique from within their own organization or from projects, they are never truly blamed. Often the end remark is a positive highlight, or as in the example from the Improving Livestock Production and Marketing Project, blaming the lack of engagement from NGOs.

Antonio Gramsci presented a complicated relationship between the state and civil society in his theory. This relationship is clearly displayed when examining NGOs role in the World Bank projects. The development of NGOs could be resembled to the previously mentioned “false consciousness” presented by Gramsci, as NGOs would be in the subordinate position to the ruling class, the World Bank, and later understanding their potential as a leading actor.
This form of “false consciousness” is potentially what drove the NGOs to realize their potential, but most importantly, made the World Bank understand the benefits the collaboration with NGOs would bring.

6.2 Cooperation

Speaking generally of NGOs, the Bank often praises the cooperation with NGOs. When evaluating the first 30 years of the Bank, NGOs were spoken of as being strong and forceful part of change. (Institutional Changes for Independent Evaluation at the World Bank 1970-2002). During their beginning from occasionally being invited to “play roles”, NGOs are today invited to seasonal meetings with the World Bank in order to evaluate and give remarks on the work carried out by the World Bank in cooperation with the NGOs.

Shihata speaks of the development of NGOs before 1992. The 1990s were a starting time for NGOs, however, already when Shihata was composing his study, NGOs had started to bloom. They were beginning to be incorporated in the processes of the Bank when dealing with projects, both financially and in design. Their major place of development during this time was in project implementation, being part of a total of 43%. Shihata mentions that the environmental factor was where the NGOs were most prominent, having part in sector-wide strategies. Being part of the environmental factor for so long could, according to the findings, be part of why the implementation of NGOs is so successful in environmental projects. One environmental project where NGOs were highly successful was one conducted in 2014 in the Emergency Food Crisis Response where NGOs experienced being part of major preparations as well as monitoring for the World Bank.

Looking at the research by Shihata from 1992, the critique posted against the collaboration of NGOs and the World Bank were the fear of exploitation by the World Bank on NGO knowledge. Even though NGOs were at occasion hired with the same rights as consultants. Today, the focus continued to lie somewhat in the question if the World Bank are using NGOs for their work. The World Bank was criticised by James A. Paul in 1996 for buying small “grassroot” NGOs and thereby in a way, buy the approval from the NGOs.
The work of Robert E. Kelly, although not fully conclusive, proved that NGO interaction benefited the World Bank. The NGOs were even described as “useful vendors” in terms of their usage from the World Bank. When NGOs were incorporated in Bank-financed projects, the hypothesis of Kelly claiming “If NGO participation improves the mission effectiveness of an IGOs operations, then an IGO will willingly adapt its practices to utilize NGO expertise”. This study by Kelly then proved that when NGOs are seen as profitable by the Bank, adapting new guidelines is seen as no problem (Kelly, 2011:4). This can also be seen previously in the different OPN adapted by the Bank after they included NGOs on a greater level after 1981 and discovered their effectiveness within projects.

From the Précis presented by the World Bank, it was noticed that when governments and the Bank had understanding for the organizations that were part of the project, the outcomes were positive. In order for the projects to be deemed successful, action in the early stages of the projects were essential for the outcome to be satisfactory. The environment in which the NGOs were presented would then encourage NGO cooperation and thereby increase the outcomes that were labeled as “highly successful”. The interesting part of this Précis was the critique directed towards the Bank in their collaboration and lack of understanding of NGOs, as the unsatisfactory results could be connected to the Bank’s limited knowledge of the NGOs work and therefore the partnership became strenuous which was later presented in the results.

In the study where the first 30 years of the Bank was examined, the emphasis on the collaboration with NGOs as being essential for the development of the Bank was made by high-ranked persons. According to the study, the president of the World Bank Jim Wolfensohn from 1995-2005 delivered a Bank that was open to learning, focused on quality and responsive to both governments and the civil society. Robert Picciotto, Director-General, 1992-2002 also highlighted the work with organizations and believed that time was the thief when new processes and agenda changes were introduced, and not the lack of ideas and people.

Although these high-ranking officials spoke so gloriously of the collaboration with organizations in the past, NGO involvement in the 2012 project on Improving Livestock
Production and Marketing was seen as a failure. Several years after the comments from Wolfensohn, the failure of recruiting NGOs was blamed on the lack of involvement by the NGOs and the PCU were presented as had made “several efforts”. NGOs were here described as not being involved enough and the World Bank as being the “savior”. The reason why the NGOs were lacking in involvement is not described in the rapport by the World Bank.

Two years after the failure of the Livestock and Marketing project, however, NGOs were successfully incorporated in the 2014 project Emergency Food Crisis Response and Agricultural Re-Launch. In this project, NGOs were part of developing the Emergency Food Security Assessment as well as involved in development to help both monitoring and evaluation in a collaboration with UN agencies and Government Technical Ministries. It is evident in this project that only two years after the previously mentioned project, NGOs have a large role in the development and treated as partners. What should be noted of this project is that it posed areas that were inaccessible to staff, making NGOs a invaluable resource.

The most recent project mentioned in this study where outside organizations are involved is the ongoing project of Southern Sudan Emergency Food Crisis Response Project. While the projects does not receive help from NGOs, they are working with INGOs as a reliable source to connect with those in need. There is a clear development between the projects that have been part of this research. The first one chosen provided information where the NGOs were to blame for lack of interaction, in the second one NGOs were treated as partners and part of developing plans in order to provide the best possible outcome for the project. Finally, the last project in Sudan, INGOs are seen given the responsibility to act as a source between the World Bank and the people affected by the project. This development clearly proves that when NGOs and INGOs are treated as partners and not only a “helping hand”, the project is more likely to be successful.

The relationship between NGOs and the World Bank has also grown as the NGOs have become more of a partner to the World Bank in projects, instead of an employee. The World Bank saw the potential in NGOs, whether it was because of the increase in successful projects or because of the knowledge NGOs possessed is undecided, perhaps it was a combination of both. Either way, the potential and hard work from NGOs to become a safe source to rely on
in countries of the projects has heightened the trust from the World Bank and therefore as a result, the power of the NGOs.

7. Conclusion and recommendations

The objective of this study was to examine the impact of NGOs on the World Bank on a deeper level than the overall international impact and thereby lessen the gap in the research made on NGOs impact on the specific level chosen namely the project level. The research set out to collect data in which NGOs were incorporated in Bank-financed projects and research the results of NGO interaction. By conducting this study, the gap between the previous research and the present development of NGOs is intended to be lessened and the growth of NGOs to be highlighted.

The findings presented a view on NGOs from a perspective mainly of the World Bank and their improvements while working with NGOs. What could be interpreted by the Bank is that they work hard on incorporating NGOs in projects and the development in their Bank-financed projects in order to streamline the end results of their work and the Bank did, in fact, see prominent improvements in their projects (Shihata, 1992:625). When NGOs were involved in projects, it was to ease the collaboration on site. This means, NGOs became a sort of communication between the Bank and the society they were working with as NGOs often had better knowledge of the land and the people. In a specific case, the Philippines Urban Projects, NGOs helped the Bank decrease the risks for hostile confrontations and uncooperative groups (Shihata, 1992:624-25).

What has been an obstacle in researching NGO involvement from the World Bank view is the definition that the Bank uses on “involvement”. When assessing the impact of NGOs in the Précis released by the OED, the word “involvement” was mentioned as being an obstacle for the researchers as well when conducting the fieldwork in countries where NGOs had been cooperating. When presenting the research, the success that had been presented in the real world did not match the data that had been found by the OED. Some of the recommendations from the OED included the partnership with NGOs and how the treatment of NGOs could play a vital role in how the end result comes out. Perhaps the NGOs had been treated as
“helpers” instead of “partners” in the projects, and therefore not been included in all decisions and predicaments by the Bank.

7.1 Research questions

From this, the research question “Has the efforts made by NGOs over time increased their impact on the World Bank?” simply be answered with: Yes. As NGOs have showed their strength on the civil society level, the World Bank has noticed the benefits that it brings. The question of “NGOs development” can, however, be a question of definition. In the research and projects presented, the World Bank view is prominent. The NGOs have grown as partners to the Bank only because the Bank has allowed the NGOs to be incorporated. With this being said, NGOs would not have had the possibility to work their way up in the cooperation with the World Bank if not for their rumours to represent the people. NGOs have fought their way to become a recognized power and asset in the World Bank, and their impact from being part of roleplays to now being part of large meetings of development did not come easy.

The question “What impact does NGOs have on the World Bank?” did provide answers to the development and involvement of NGOs, yet issues were presented with the question as well. While it has been established that NGOs do have an impact on projects by the World Bank, defining both “NGOs” and “impact” can result in different outcomes. If “impact” was defined as presenting a majority of “highly satisfactory” numbers from the OED Précis, the NGO involvement could be interpreted as non-functioning. However, if “impact” is defined as being part of the projects and having a voice in the development in comparison to where they began, NGO impact could be deemed as highly successful. Judging “impact” as being included in projects, the answer to the question of NGO impact on the World Bank project is that their impact has become more evident throughout the years.

So are NGOs becoming more influential over time? Accounting for the previous research on the subject and adding the presented background, NGOs are gaining power throughout the years. Even in 1991, the development of NGOs was prominent in several sectors. Shihata writes about the statistics in which sectors NGOs were evolving in, counting as many as five
active involvement sectors. Even then, project implementation was the most prominent sector for NGOs in the World Bank together with environmental factor in sector-wide strategies. These statistics were presented when NGOs had been incorporated in over 200 Bank-financed projects.

Following the development of NGOs, the question of their influence over time can be interpreted as strong. They have grown from being invited on occasion by the World Bank, then working on over 200 projects and thereby gaining the trust of the World Bank to outform Operational Policies to include NGOs in the Bank. Later they became a strong influential factor in designing projects, employed as consultants and part of both financial as well as projects. Today, NGOs are even part of the seasonal meetings conducted by the World Bank where they are given the chance to evaluate and critique the work of the Bank.

This study indicates that there is a noticeable impact from the NGOs on the World Bank. The effects that the NGOs have on the World Bank projects is too beneficial for the Bank to ever be able to not have a collaboration with the NGOs. The way NGOs work with the World Bank helps the Bank to communicate with societies they are not familiar with, here the NGOs work as a middle-man in order to provide a safe, stable ground to work from. Following the observations made from this study, a conclusion can be made that NGOs do impact the World Bank, as the Bank relies on NGOs expertise for the success of their projects. The efforts made by NGOs over time has also impacted the World Bank, as their resilience in working with the Bank proved the knowledge NGOs possess. Finally, NGOs are becoming more influential over time as the journey that can be followed from this research shows the way NGOs have worked themselves from occasional invitations to being a major part of development meetings held by the Bank.

As a final remark, a possible improvement for the future in this research area is the transparency of empirical data. The rare existing data that can be found has helped this research, although difficult to sort out, the data is out there. If the empirical data would be easier to access, the job of keeping up with the development of NGOs in the World Bank projects would be made less difficult. In present time, the study of NGOs impact on the World Bank project is scarce, however, the hope of this research is to inspire the upkeep of
the development. In order for this research to be continued, it is a hope that data will be more accessible and the development of NGOs followed as they continue to be a strong force for the people.
8. References

8.1 Bibliography


8.2 Journals


8.3 Internet sources


https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/10fb/e6c1ff407ee97db995a1169eb60256cc494b.pdf 
[Accessed 2017-12-15]


http://scholarship.law.cornell.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1298&context=cilj [Accessed 2017-10-29]


http://lnweb90.worldbank.org/oed/oeddoclib.nsf/24cc3bb1f94ae11c85256808006a0046/096f027fdaa81b5e852567f5005d9327/$FILE/177precis.pdf [Accessed 2017-12-10]

9. Appendix I: Indicators of NGO impact on IGOs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hypothesis (Purpose of NGO Engagement by IGO)</th>
<th>Indicators (Empirical Variables)</th>
<th>Subindicators (Specific Changes at the IGO Traceable to NGO Pressure)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>H1 Defense</td>
<td>I1 Organizational Modification</td>
<td>a. IGO’s NGO Staff Size</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>b. Resources Devoted to NGO Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>c. Information Dispersion (Transparency)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>d. NGO Access to IGO Elites</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I2 Program Consultation</td>
<td></td>
<td>a. IGO Outreach to NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>b. Required IGO Outreach to NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>b. NGO-sought Programmatic Spending Changes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I4 Evaluation</td>
<td>a. Reviews of NGO Engagement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>b. Complaint Mechanism for NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>H3 ‘Democratic’ Appropriateness</td>
<td>I5 Legitimacy</td>
<td>a. Voluntary Inclusion of NGOs in Internal Decision-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>b. Rewording of IGO’s Formal Descriptions of NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>I6 Paradigm/Policy Change</td>
<td>a. Policy Dialogue with NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>b. NGO-sought Policy Change</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 5.1.1: In order to test these hypotheses, the empirical variables were compared with Specific Changes at the IGO Traceable to NGO Pressure together with the hypotheses presented in the text.
9.1 Appendix II: Outcome of NGO involvement in selected Bank-supported projects

**TABLE 1: Outcome of NGO Involvement in Selected Bank-Supported Projects**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>All Projects</th>
<th>Post-1995 Projects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No.</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Highly satisfactory</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Satisfactory</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unsatisfactory</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>