Empowerment of Women through a Colourful slum-project

-A case of the slum-upgrading project in Kampung Tridi of Indonesia

Author: Christina Arvidsson
Tutor: Ezechiel Sentama
Examiner: Jonas Ewald
Semester: Spring 2019
Subject: Peace and Development
Level: Bachelor thesis
Course: 2FU33E
Abstract
This study aims to evaluate if a slum-upgrading project in 2016 in Malang, Indonesia lead to empowerment of the women living in the neighbourhood. The study uses the concept of Empowerment by Naila Kabeer as a theoretical lens and focuses on women’s resources, agency and achievement after the project was carried out. The study was conducted as a Minor Field Study, which relied mainly on semi-structured interviews, which were complemented with personal observation. The respondents were selected purposively: meaning only those who participated in the painting project. The study findings are limited to the case explored and do not thus aim to a generalization on other projects in Indonesia. Findings are however informative for similar projects in similar contexts.

The findings indicate that women were initially excluded from official decision-making during the project. In spite of this, however, the project enabled women to be more active in the economy to organize their own meetings and become responsible for the communal cleaning and events in the area. This participation led women to also have more to say in the community and they have been able to increase their savings and set goals for their families and children, which was impossible before the existence of the slum-upgrading in the area.

Keywords: Naila Kabeer, Empowerment, Indonesia, Women, Slum-upgrading

Words: 15259
Acknowledgements

I would like to thank the Swedish International Development Cooperation Agency (Sida) for granting me the Minor Field Study (MFS) scholarship.

I would also like to express my gratitude to my research assistant, translator and friend Rizqieta Ekky Hapsari for all the help and strong support during the field study, without you this study would not be possible to carry out. I would like to express many thanks to all the participants taking their time to invite me to their homes and participate in this study. Without your participation, I would not be able to complete this study.

I also want to thank my academic supervisor, Ezechiel Sentama for his guidance, support, and dedication through the process. Lastly, I would like to thank my friends and family for their support prior, during and after the research.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................................................. 2  
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................................................. 3  
Table of Contents .................................................................................................................................................. 4  
Abbreviations ......................................................................................................................................................... 6  
1. Introduction ....................................................................................................................................................... 7  
   1.1 Introduction to the subject ......................................................................................................................... 7  
   1.2 Country of Interest ...................................................................................................................................... 8  
   1.3 The case ..................................................................................................................................................... 9  
   1.4 Literature review ....................................................................................................................................... 11  
   1.5 Research gap ............................................................................................................................................ 12  
   1.6 Objective and Research Questions .......................................................................................................... 13  
   1.7 Structure of the Thesis ............................................................................................................................... 13  
2. Methodological Framework ............................................................................................................................. 14  
   2.1 Qualitative and abductive approaches ....................................................................................................... 14  
   2.2 Data Collection and sampling .................................................................................................................. 14  
      2.2.1 Purposive sampling .............................................................................................................................. 14  
      2.2.2 Sample size ......................................................................................................................................... 15  
      2.2.3 Semi-structured interviews ............................................................................................................... 15  
      2.2.4 Participant observation ...................................................................................................................... 16  
   2.3 Limitations and Delimitations .................................................................................................................... 17  
   2.4 Ethical Considerations ............................................................................................................................... 18  
   2.5 Evaluation of sources ................................................................................................................................ 18  
3. Analytical Framework ....................................................................................................................................... 20  
   3.1 Women Empowerment ............................................................................................................................... 20  
      3.1.1 Resources ........................................................................................................................................... 20  
      3.1.2 Agency ............................................................................................................................................... 21  
      3.1.3 Achievements ..................................................................................................................................... 21  
   3.2 Measuring Empowerment ........................................................................................................................... 22  
4. Research Findings ............................................................................................................................................... 24  
   4.1 Women participation in the slum upgrading project .................................................................................... 24  
      4.1.1 Participation in project’s official meetings ........................................................................................... 24  
      4.1.2 Participation in decision-making ......................................................................................................... 25
4.1.3 Participation in painting planning ................................................................. 26
4.1.4 Project activities carried out ........................................................................... 27
4.2. Outcomes from the repainting process ............................................................ 31
   4.2.1 Economic improvements ............................................................................. 31
   4.2.2 Environment protection ............................................................................ 32
   4.2.3 Social capital ............................................................................................. 33
   4.2.4 Autonomy/Self-confidence ........................................................................ 34
4.3 Capacity for planning the future ...................................................................... 36
5. Analysis .............................................................................................................. 38
   5.1 Resources ...................................................................................................... 38
   5.2 Agency .......................................................................................................... 40
   5.3 Achievements as Empowerment ................................................................... 41
   5.4 The overall connection to the theoretical framework .................................... 44
6. Conclusion .......................................................................................................... 45
Bibliography ........................................................................................................... 48
Appendices ............................................................................................................. 49
   Appendix A: Interview participants ................................................................... 49
   Appendix B: Interview guide .............................................................................. 51
Abbreviations

CEO- Chief Executive Officer

NGO- Non-Governmental Organization

UN- United Nations

UN-Habitat- The United Nations Human Settlements Programme
1. Introduction

This chapter aims to introduce the subject and its relevance, the study case as well as the gap that is to be addressed. In addition, the literature review aimed to highlight previous studies on the subject is provided, along with the study problem, objectives and research questions.

1.1 Introduction to the subject

With a fast-growing Urbanization more than half of the world’s population are living in cities, and the world bank estimate this number will increase over the next few years. Cities have always been the place for economic growth, innovation, and employment, and when they are well-managed cities have the potential to offer opportunities in economic and social development for its citizens (Cohen, 2006, p. 64).

However, large sections of people in cities today are excluded from opportunities in the cities based on their gender, age, race or ethnicity but also depending on where they live in the city based on income or status. All of this then affect social, cultural and economic spheres in life (UN Habitat, 2008). United Nations (UN) stated in 2008 more than 32 percent of the worlds urban population is today living in slums (UN Habitat, 2008, p. 75). The slum itself can be a poverty trap but usually also goes hand in hand with bad governance and poor policies from the authorities (Marx, et al., 2013, p. 188). With a large number of people living in slums inclusive and sustainable development is halted as a result of people not being able to use their full potential (UN Habitat, 2008, p. 75). UN-Habitat stresses the challenge for the international community, national governments, city politicians and civil society to act to be able to stop the increase of slum dwellers in the world (UN Habitat, 2003).

Improvement in living conditions is seen as a major factor to improve slums, but for the results to last and be successful this needs to be complemented with investments in human capital but also social and political inclusion for the most excluded (UN Habitat, 2008, pp. 22, 117). International Agencies as the UN focus more and more on capacity building in their slum programmes today. Recognising poor people should be actors who play key-roles to improve their lifesituation is today seen as a right but also as an important tool to create more effective policies all over the world. (UN Habitat, 2003, p. 28). In this context, it is even more important
to bring opportunities to women and girls. This as uneducated poor women are the most excluded today (UN Habitat, 2008, pp. 22, 117).

Participatory slum improvements are accepted by the UN among the best practices when it comes to house interventions but have so far only been adopted on a limited scale. Research shows, when upgrading policies have been implemented appropriate, the slums have increased economic development, improved income among the poor, better security and provided better social inclusiveness for the people. The problem is that success stories like this is still very few compared to the number of slums worldwide (UN Habitat, 2003).

As problems with urban problems have failed to be solved on national or state level, the trend shows more and more solutions towards urban problems are handled by the local level, leaving more and more pressure on local authorities (Cohen, 2006, p. 78). Also, today, more than 50 000 NGOs is working with poor communities in developing countries. This shows how many poor people in urban areas are dependent on NGOs instead of governmental services as health, education, housing, micro-credits, etc (UN Habitat, 2003). When UN looked at 10 different Asian slum cities it became clear it is when NGOs manage to work with grassroots empowerment and capacity building poor people also became more involved in politics (UN Habitat, 2008, p. 140). According to the UN the proportion of people living in slums worldwide is declining, at the same time as the actual numbers of people are increasing. Several countries have managed to improve the living standard for slum dwellers. Asian countries as China and India have been in the forefront and the countries together reached out to improve the life of 125 million slum dwellers between 2000-2010 (UN Habitat, 2008, p. 39). This suggests it is possible to reduce the urban division in the world’s cities.

1.2 Country of Interest

Indonesia, with 260 million residents is the 4th most populated country in the world today. It’s also the largest archipelago state in the world, with more than 17,500 islands. During the last years, Indonesia has experienced rapid industrialisation and poverty is declining. But still half of the Indonesian population today in 2018 lives on less than 2 $/day (The World Bank, 2019). Together with India, China, Turkey, and Viet Nam, Indonesia was one of the countries in Asia who made significant improvements in slum conditions over the last decade. Within the country, the slum proportion of urban population fell from 34 percent in 2000 to 23 percent in 2010 (UN Habitat, 2008, p. 62). Most of the economic growth in Indonesia is centered in the
cities and Indonesia has one of the fastest urbanization rates in Asia and even if the percentage of slum population fell the conditions for the poor are getting worse in the cities with rising inequalities as results (Sutanudjaja, et al., 2018, p. 5).

1.3 The case
In Indonesia, the word Kampung is used to describe a neighbourhood or area and will be used in the paper and refers to the slum in this case. The paper will also use the words area, neighbourhood, village, and Kampung to refer to the case.

As stated before, the UN highlighted successful slum upgrading projects are still rare compared to the amounts of people living in slums today. In the report *Strategy for a Social City in Indonesia* by the Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung the Jodipan kampung in Malang was highlighted as a successful initiative due to its physical improvement of the environment and how this has contributed to a local economy within the area and reduced previous stigma earlier attached to the kampung (Sutanudjaja, et al., 2018).

In the middle of Malang city, the two slums Jodipan and Tridi Kampung are located. The two slums are only divided by Branta’s river and are 2 of 26 slum areas in Malang. The Kampung Tridi consists of around 220 households all nearby the river (Zakiyya, et al., 2017). The area was considered as one of the dirtiest and most densely populated in Malang before the project started (Noorsetya, et al., 2017). Also, the area had negative connotations for people in Malang and was famous as a “thug” village (GuysPro, 2019).

In 2016 the Jodipan village was re-painted as a slum upgrading-project by 8 students from the University of Muhammadiyah Malang in cooperation with a local paint company Indana Paint as a CSR-project. The student group was called GuysPro. As 90 percent of the inhabitants threw garbage in the nearby Branta’s river the main purpose was to change the habits of people by improving their living situation and thereby create higher awareness about the environment (GuysPro, 2019). Shortly afterwards the residents in Kampung Tridi was able to get funding from the same company and their area was repaint as well (Zakiyya, et al., 2017). This is recognised by the Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung, quoted below:
“This [Jodipan] kampungs success in transforming their environment influenced other neighbouring kampungs, and the concept of thematic kampungs achieved recognition at a national and international scale” (Sutanudjaja, et al., 2018, p. 14).

After the Jodipan village was implemented, the people in the neighbouring slum, Kampung Tridi realized the improvements and a second project was initiated. The main difference from the two slums was the first one was initiated by people from outside the area while the second was on behalf of the inhabitants in the area. The painting started in August 2016 the process took about 8 months to finish all done by people from the area, except the rooftops as the Indonesian air force was involved to provide equipment and people. The project involved to repaint all the houses in the area in colourful colours. All walls, doors, and windows were painted on the houses. The roofs were painted to look like a rainbow from above. The streets, stairs, and communal areas got repainted. On the walls on the residents’ houses, different graffiti’s and other paintings were painted. Different lookout were made for tourists to go and take pictures from and were painted colourful. Also, different decorations were made and hang up in the streets to look more beautiful and give a 3D experience. The main difference between the two slums is the second one, Kampung Tridi has emphasized to have different paintings and graffiti on the houses and to create a 3D impression of the paintings, thereby the name Kampung Tridi (3D). As the painting started, an initiative to clean up the area was created as well as a local artist group being responsible to maintain the paintings and to make sure old paintings gets renewed every 3-4 months (Setiawan, 2019). In both projects, the main sponsor was Indana Paint but due to limited resources, their involvement in Kampung was mainly to provide paint and painting tools. Today, the Kampung has a deal with Indana paint, whereby they get paint etc, with a discount and they are obligated to purchase all their paint to the houses from the company (Sugiharto, 2019).

Through media and social media, the story of Jodipan and Kampung Tridi gained both national and international attention. Today the neighbourhoods have become a tourist destination, and according to TripAdvisor it is now among the top 7 top activities in Malang (Tripadvisor, 2019). It is today one of the new tourist destinations for Indonesians and international tourists and on weekends several visitors from the region come to visit the place and take pictures of the houses and paintings.
Picture 1. On the pictures, one can see the Jodipan village to the right and Kampung Tridi to the left. The picture on the top if from August 2016 and the bottom picture is from November the same year as the paintings had started in Kampung Tridi. (Khulafaurus, 2016).

1.4 Literature review

Research on different kinds of slums all over the world is rigorous when it comes to social impacts in people’s life quality. Un-habitat has several implications of how slum upgrading programmes affect not only the physical conditions but also strengthen the social wellbeing and local networks. When upgrading programmes are implemented on a local scale by the inhabitants being active participants it also has the ability to empower people in the areas and reduce social inequalities (Habitat, 2019). This as different types of housing are a critical part of people’s identity and dignity. Therefore it can be an obstacle to reach prosperity as the housing itself hold people back as negative influence of their life (Chant, 2007, p. 17).

Previous research show when women get involved in programmes to deal with poverty in their communities it is a risk their burden will increase as they tend to deal with specific gender issues specific for women (Chant, 2007, pp. 22-24). There is also evidence the way women and men are involved differ, as men tend to be more active in political parties, sport- and trade unions and women tend to be more into education, art, religious and service organizations (Desai, 2010, pp. 49-50). Also, women in higher positions in urban governance are rare and UN-Habitat stress to be able to create more gender equal cities there is a need to promote more women taking part as active citizens (Chant, 2007, pp. 22-24). Chant adds one interesting perspective in the debate of empowerment. She argues it is important to see the difference
between empowerment as a tool for development, or development as a tool for empowerment of women (Chant, 2007, p. 121).

1.5 Research gap
As the Kampungs has gained some attention, some research has been done on the area about the outcomes. However, except the Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung report most research done is made by university students from Malang. The research has been focusing on improvements of water sanitation, tourism development and economic improvements (Zakiyya, et al., 2017), (Noorsetya, et al., 2017) & (Rani & Wulandari, 2018) (Sutanudjaja, et al., 2018).

However, the previous research done in Malang and the area has not been focused on women’s inclusion in the process and neither investigated the effects of the repainting from a woman’s perspective. There is thereby a research gap of the understanding of how the improvements have affected women’s life quality. The research aims to fill this gap by providing in-depth knowledge if women were left out from planning and to be able to take decisions and how this affected their status and economic status.

This research aims to fill this lack of understanding by evaluate the outcomes from a new theoretical angle to gain new insights of women’s inclusion in the project. The research also aims to fill the research gap in how slum-upgrading projects in Indonesia can lead to empowerment for women.

The research hope to give important insight to understand if and how women in lower socioeconomic neighbourhoods can create or get new opportunities within their area when they are not included in official processes and how their status in the Indonesian society affect their opportunities to make their own decisions due to life quality and if development can be a tool for empowerment.
1.6 Objective and Research Questions

The objective of this research is to understand if the slum-upgrading project in Kampung Tridi leads to empowerment for women in the area. The aim is to understand the process of the project and the outcomes and how this affects women’s opportunities towards empowerment. This to provide more knowledge for future slum-upgrading projects in the future. Therefore this study is not focused on whether women participated in the project, instead the study focuses on how they participated and the outcomes of their participation. This implies that women participants had to be only those who participated in the project. In other words, the study aims to explore if the participation of women in the painting project empowered them, which refers to how they participated and the outcomes from this participation.

The main research question is formulated as follows:

*Did the slum-upgrading project in Kampung Tridi lead to the empowerment of the women living in the neighbourhood?*

To answer the above all overall question, the following specific questions were explored:

1. *In what ways did women participate in the painting project process?*
2. *What have been the outcomes from women’s participation in the painting project?*

1.7 Structure of the Thesis

This study is divided into six chapters. The first chapter is the introduction, here the background to the research will be presented together with literature review, research gap and objective, and research questions. The second chapter in the thesis is the methodological framework and the researcher will explain the collection of data, limitations and ethical considerations for this study. In chapter three the chosen analytical framework for the study is presented as Empowerment by Naila Kabeer. In chapter four the findings from the case study will be presented and outlined. Thereafter in chapter five the findings will be analysed. Last, in the study, a conclusion is presented.
2. Methodological Framework

In this chapter, the methodological framework for the thesis is presented. The chapter first describes the abductive approach used. The chapter will then present the participation and data collection and analysis methods. The chapter ends by discussing its limitations and ethical considerations.

2.1 Qualitative and abductive approaches

This study was qualitative. The aim was to provide in-depth understanding of a research subject through the experiences of research participants, which is not what the quantitative approach would have provided. As this study aims to understand the perceptions and experiences from the participants in relation to their own life situation which can best be achieved through a qualitative approach.

In so approaching, the study employed an abductive approach, with the aim to use already known ideas and use them to new concepts or contexts. Abductive approach tries to explain and give alternatives to the case it explores as this is useful in social science as it can give a deeper knowledge to a certain case as it also tests and modifies theories to new cases (Danermark, et al., 2002, pp. 90-94).

This study thus aimed to collect new data in the case of women living in a neighbourhood previously defined as a slum that has been going through some major environmental upgrades. The aim is to analyse the data with the existing analytical framework of women empowerment to evaluate if the women were empowered by the project.

2.2 Data Collection and sampling

2.2.1 Purposive sampling

Purposive sampling was used to sample relevant participants for the research question to be answered, this is usually done, usually done by choosing suitable contexts or cases and thereafter participants within the context based on criteria set up by the researcher beforehand (Bryman, 2012, pp. 418-419). When the set of criterions is set a researcher can use snowball sampling in which the participants in the study give the researcher suggestions other participants relevant to the research (Bryman, 2012, p. 424). Therefore, since the study aimed to explore if the painting project empowered women, the researcher had to select women who
had already participated in the project and who were willing to take part in the study. The fact they participated was a fact, but how they participated, and the outcomes of their participation were the core themes. Therefore purposive sampling enabled the researcher to select only those who participated.

As the purpose was to understand if slum upgrading projects empower women, the researcher aimed to carry out the research in a set context with participants filling the requirements for the research question to be answered. The researcher had three mains criterions for the participants. They needed to be identifying themselves as a woman and must have been living in the area before the slum upgrading project took place and still be living there.

2.2.2 Sample size
One main question due to qualitative research is the sample size, and when saturation is fulfilled. Bryman further suggests theoretical saturation has been accomplished when the researcher finds no new data emerge in the category and no new insights will suggest more or new dimensions for the theory (Bryman, 2012, pp. 421,425). As there is no clear answer about the size it is up to the researcher to decide when saturation is fulfilled. Since this study was about empowerment of women, it follows that women participants had to be only those who participated in the project and who had expressed their consent to take part in the study. Therefore, purposive sampling was the method. With the aim to measure empowerment through how women participation was made (not participation per se, but how they participated), as well as the outcomes of their participation, seven women, who participated in the project and who expressed their consent, have been subject to the study, beside participants from the project in question—the Chief Executive Officer of the Paint company Indana, as well as one of the artists in the village.

2.2.3 Semi-structured interviews
This study relied on semi-structured interviews whereby the researcher had already a list of key open questions or topics, as an interview guide. The guide was flexible as this provided the participants with the ability to give rich and detailed answers to the questions they feel is important for them and want to develop further (Bryman, 2012, pp. 470-471). For the study, the researcher had an interview guide with the aim to cover the main research questions with help of 35 prepared questions covering the topics of economic resources, living situation,
participation in the repainting and plans of the respondents. The researcher used a female Indonesian translator from Malang who speaks Indonesian and English and has knowledge about the Indonesian culture. To be sure the questions were suitable and could be translated into the context the translator and researcher want through the questions beforehand to explain the main purpose of the study.

Bryman suggests using good quality recorder and to do the interviews in a quiet private setting, usually where the respondent feels safe (Bryman, 2012, p. 473). All the interviews with the women except one were conducted in the respondent’s homes with the translator, researcher and participant being present. The interview was not carried out at home took place at one of the entrances as it was the only time for her to attend. The translator was then used during all the interviews. The researcher first asked the questions in English, which were translated into Indonesian, the participants replied in Indonesian and then the answers were translated back to English before moving on to the next questions. This as the researcher would be able to immediately ask a follow-up question if needed. Due to the area being crowded and many of the houses are small, it could become noisy and sometimes the interviews were interrupted with people coming by to buy something or ask something. The interview was then paused until the participant had time and then it continued. Before the interviews all the participants were asked if they approved being recorded and if they wanted to be in any pictures or their houses being published in the report. No money was exchanged but due to Indonesian courtesy the researcher brought some fruit or snacks for all the meetings as a gesture of appreciation of their time. In total seven different women were interviewed in one- by one interview.

All interviews were recorded with a Samsung Galaxy S8 and later transcribed. All the interviews lasted between 40 -70 minutes.

As the researcher needed to talk to the CEO of Indana paint, this interview was conducted by phone using WhatsApp, and in the beginning of the interview the CEO got the request if he could be quoted. As the CEO spoke fluent English no translator was needed during this interview. Due to technical limitations, this interview was not transcribed but notes during the call were made. The interview lasted for 29 minutes.

2.2.4 Participant observation

Qualitative interviewing is common within research combined with participant observation. Participant observation usually refers to the researcher spending time in a setting for a limited time to observe the group (Bryman, 2012, pp. 383-384).
As a compliment to the interviews, the researcher did several visits to the area to observe the paintings, houses, and cleanliness. The researcher also visited several houses and the common bathrooms. As a part of the study, the researcher also spend some time in the entrance with the women while they worked. This to observe how people interacted with the people living in the area and to get the ability to ask about the entrance and souvenirs as they were working.

Also, the researcher got invited to participate in a women’s meeting together with the translator. At the beginning of the meeting, the president of the meeting presented the researcher for the group and the researcher explained the purpose of the study and asked for permission to record and take pictures. At the end of the meeting the researcher was able to ask questions arisen and got the opportunity to ask about the communal cleaning, the system with the books and savings as well as ask if more women were interested to be interviewed. This resulted in two women inviting the researcher to their houses for the study. At the end of the meeting the researcher observed small spiced for food being handed out and could also stay while some women started to make decorations together to hang up in the streets. The main purpose of the observations was to observe the social interaction in the area and the living conditions.

2.3 Limitations and Delimitations
Since this study was a case study, findings should consequently be limited to the specific case or should not be seen as an attempt to generalize to the Indonesian population (Bryman, 2012, p. 201). Since empowerment is context specific (Desai, 2010, pp. 7-9) the study is delimited to evaluate and analyse processes in the specific case from an empowerment analytical lens.

Also, one limitation of the research is the use of interpreter as the researcher did not speak Indonesian. There could be a risk some questions would be misunderstood due to language barriers. The interpreter may have also put her own values and change questions without the researcher being aware which could have affected the findings. To try to minimise misunderstanding the researcher gave clear instructions to the translator to try to translate word by word and not to put in her own values. The translator was a trusted female as well since the study was focused on women to minimise risk women would avoid certain issues as their relationship with their husbands and their involvement in the painting process.
2.4 Ethical Considerations
The study used Diener and Crandall’s guidelines to make sure the study follows ethical principles for social research (Bryman, 2012, p. 135). First, the study will make sure to do no harm to the participants, and the study will therefore keep all participants anonymous and not use their names. All the participants were 18 years and older. All the participants will be able to give their consent before each interview to take part of the study and the researcher will explain this is a small study for my Bachelor in Sweden. Since it will be qualitative semi-structured interviews the researcher is aware some participants might perceive the questions as an invasion of privacy, but they will then have the opportunity not to answer if they find the subject too sensitive to discuss. To keep the participants more comfortable the interviews will be in their homes or whey they feel comfortable.

2.5 Evaluation of sources
This thesis relied on both primary and secondary sources. The primary sources for the thesis refer to observations and interviews carried out by the researcher herself.

The interview with the CEO from Indana Paint can be a bit biased as he wouldn’t give negative information about the role of his company, however using him as a source has been mainly to be able to support earlier statements from the participants and the researcher find him being an important source. Independent from the CEO the student group GuysPro from the University of Muhammadiyah was contacted about the actual process of the projects. As they were the main actors the researcher understands their information to be correct and credible.

Previous research on the slum-projects in Malang are mainly from university students except one report from Friedrich-Ebert-Stiftung funded by the German government. The sources from the universities of Malang has some limitations as student thesis is rarely peer-reviewed. On the other hand, the papers gave some important insights of the actual process and show the importance for the city of Malang to continue evaluate the outcomes from the initiative on a local level. I state the sources as being reliable as they are from different departments but all state the same results and outcomes.

Research on different slum-projects has mainly been from UN and UN-habitat. This as the researcher recognise their research being widely accepted and their reports is a good complement to get a wider picture of the main problems and challenges in different slums worldwide today.
3. Analytical Framework

This chapter outlines the analytical framework for this thesis. The first part of the chapter the framework will be explained, and the second part will explain how one can measure the concept of empowerment.

3.1 Women Empowerment

The analytical framework to analyse the data in the study will be Dr. Naila Kabeer's theory of Women’s empowerment.

“One way to think about power is in terms of the ability to make choices: to be disempowered, therefore implies to be denied choice” (Kabeer, 2001, p. 18).

Empowerment is a process in change in where people's ability to make choices are available to an extent in which it used to be denied to them. There are different choices that have different impacts on people's life and Kabeer then distinguishes between first- and second order choices. First order choices are also called strategic choices as they frame the major decisions people take to form their way of life as who-or to get married, to have children or not, place to live and which friends to have. Once the strategic choices are made people take secondary choices daily which also affect the quality of life but does not have the same impact. In the empowerment theory, the focus is on the first order choices or better called strategic choices and whether the option to choose is available when it used to be denied (Kabeer, 2001, p. 19).

The concept of empowerment consists of three interrelated dimensions in how people make up their choices. The three dimensions are resources, agency and achievements.

3.1.1 Resources

The first dimension is called Resources, which can be material, social or human. Social and material resources are usually external resources. The material resources are usually economic such as owning land, own income or other material belongings. Social resources focus on connections and relations in which people can improve their life situation due to their networks around them. The networks interfere in different spheres of life such as private relations as professional networks which enable people with opportunities, they would not be able to gain on an individual level. Human resource is internal and is something people have within them as skills, knowledge, self-confidence etc.
Kabeer stress the allocation and access of resources are as important as the resources themselves. Different institutions, norms and rules in a society all affect how resources are channelled and how decisions are taken about them. For an example, a household might possess resources but only one in the household have access to decide over them which denies one partner to be able to make choices. (Kabeer, 2001, p. 20).

3.1.2 Agency
The second dimension is named Agency. Naila Kabeer explain this type of power as “the ability to define one’s goal and act upon them” (2001, p. 21). Agency represent the process of how decisions are being made, and the motivation behind it. It is also called the “power within” or individual decision making even if it can be collective. The dimension of Agency can be hard to measure or define as it can have positive and negative correlation to power. When people can set their own goals, they have power to set their own agenda. When someone else have power over someone else, usually with threats or oppression they have power over someone to set other people’s dreams and goals. It is also important to understand how social norms and behaviours in a society is a sometimes invisible force which itself reshapess and reproduce certain ideas of one’s desirable life choices (Kabeer, 2001, p. 21).

3.1.3 Achievements
The third dimension of power according to Kabeer is Achievements. This dimension is the outcomes of resources and agencies together. Amartya Sen would call resources and agencies combined as capabilities. Achievement is the product of people’s individual choices dependent on their capabilities (Kabeer, 2001, pp. 21-22). When someone fail to achieve something they wish to achieve due to lack of capabilities (resources+ agency) one can explain the underlying reason to be lack of power and is one manifestation of disempowerment (Kabeer, 2001, pp. 21-22). Researchers of policymakers who put a bigger emphasis on capabilities and achievements in line with Amartya Sen’s theory tend to focus more on individuals and draw policies focusing on self-reliance and entrepreneurship to change power structures (Hope in hard times, pp 6). To avoid the individualistic approach, this paper will bring a more feminist approach to the empowering framework which allow the researcher to focus on the structural and collective inequalities between men and women in a unequal system and how this affect the possible achievements in a process of empowerment (Desai, 2010, p. 7). It is more important to understand what people prioritise and Kabeer mean there is a need to shift the focus from basic functioning’s for survival to complex achievements as education and political representation. Since empowerment is concerned with inequalities in people’s capacity to choose and not their
actual choice it is important to understand the process of empowerment as complex and all the three dimensions are intertwined, connected and dependent on each other both on the individual, political and social level.

“The multidimensional nature of power suggests that empowerment strategies for women must build on the “power within” as necessary adjunct to improving their ability to control resources to determine agendas and make decisions” (Kabeer, 1994, p. 229).

3.2 Measuring Empowerment
There have been several challenges to measure empowerment, especially the agency and achievement dimension and it is agreed empowerment is context specific and varies between countries. It can mainly be measured through surveys or ethnographic studies to understand the complex transformation of empowerment (Desai, 2010, pp. 7-9). Malhorta et al (2002) suggest one way to measure empowerment is to use the six dimensions of economic, sociocultural, family, legal, political and psychological dimensions, all with different sub dimensions to grasp the process (Desai, 2010, p. 7).

Kabeer itself also discuss the challenge to measure the concept and the need to understand the difference between having access to resources and the ability to change the choices they make due to change in resources. She further explains the importance to use the concept of resources to understand how it can be a tool or potential for the agency and achievements to take off, rather than as a proof of empowerment itself. Only when women can act upon or make different choices the dimension of resources could be one of the tools in the empowerment process (Kabeer, 2001, pp. 30-31).

For the agency dimension of the framework, most scholars use “decision-making” agency as a measurement tool and usually the researcher asks woman about their role in different decisions taken in the family or community. These questions are usually context-specific and vary across different regions and economic situations. Common topics are usually decisions over food purchase, number of children, children’s education, health care spending etc. It is also important to understand the unofficial decision-making women often do in their marriage, but outwards
the image of the man as the head of the household must be kept intact. Usually here, it becomes clear what kind of decisions are exclusive or meant to be a part of one’s responsibility (Kabeer, 2001, pp. 30-32). In the UN report Hope in hard times: Women’s Empowerment and Human Development Moser (2007) use examples of household surveys and ethnographical studies as the most effective way to measure women’s own interpretation of what they perceive as important and changes in their own perspectives and knowledge has changed over time and their ability to make different decisions in the household due to economic and social decisions (Desai, 2010, p. 9) Again, with the concept it is important to understand and use indicators to measure and validate the inequalities in the abilities to make choices on a structural level, which is also important for the achievement dimension. Here, it is important for the researcher to understand and evaluate if different changes in resources and agency have positive outcomes and lead to achievements not possible before.

To understand empowerment of women, one must then analyse how the different levels are intertwined and influence each other. The study will then focus on if the participants in the study perceive other spheres of life being affected due to the change of the environment they live in, and if their agency has changed over time and if have helped them to achieve things they perceived as impossible earlier.
4. Research Findings
This chapter is about the study results in relation to the study of empowerment women who participated in the painting project. The reminded is that this study is not about whether they participated, instead the focus is on how they participated and what have been the outcomes of their participation. The presentation of empirical data thus begins with how women participated in the painting project and ends with the outcomes of their participation.

4.1 Women participation in the slum upgrading project
This section refers to ways in which women participated in the repainting project. Within the framework of measuring empowerment, the focus is on whether they were involved in decision-making and planning activities of the project.

4.1.1 Participation in project’s official meetings
When the women were asked about their role in the process of the neighbourhood being repainted into a colourful village, all the women except one say they were not invited to any kind of meetings about the process taking part. Two of the women explain all the meetings was only for men and if women had meeting then they would have been unofficial.

One explains it has nothing to do with her being a woman but rather it has to do with the hierarchy in the society and all the decisions was made from people with more power. Two women explain since the repainting process was funded by a sponsor (Indana paint), the decisions taken was made from the company itself. Also, here, another explanation is given why one felt left out, and she explain the new organization set off by the artists in the beginning of the process did not invite leaders of the community.

Woman 1:
“The official meeting was only for male, so the male ones are the ones having the meetings and everything like that”

Woman 5:
“They want to help, but since they were not involved in the meeting, they do not know when or what colour it should be”
Woman 7:

“Not even the husband is making any decisions at all, the painting was decided by the sponsor and the artists, so they don’t make any decisions”

To understand if the women had perceived the process accurate, more sources involved in the process independent of each other was asked about the neighbourhood. Here, the researcher spoke to the leader of the artist organization in Kampung Tridi and the CEO of Indana paint, both men.

When the researcher asked the CEO of Indana about the process of the Kampung Tridi, he explained as the community already had some painters and artists in the area they gave the responsibility to the artists living in Kampung Tridi and trusted them and only provided paint and then help from the military air force to repaint the roofs.

“They had a lot of artists living there, so when I wanted to paint I told them I have limited money, they said they have artists who live here if you provide the paint, so I did and they painted from their own people” (Sugiharto, 2019).

The man being secretary and responsible for the three artists doing all the graffiti and paintings on the walls in the area explained they usually show people a catalogue where people can choose what they would prefer on their house. Depending on the patterns people choose, the job is divided among three artists who gets paid by the community for their job as they keep doing new paintings as they get old. Here he talks about Deco fresh, which is Indana’s product and explain the process.

“For the rooftop it is officially coming from the sponsor, Deco fresh and then, but the whole painting and the whole colour is coming from the men in the village” (Setiawan, 2019).

4.1.2 Participation in decision-making

However, when the researcher asked about the colour of their houses, four of the seven women gave the answer they got asked about preferred colour of their house and could decide the colour
together with the painter. Some of the women was also involved to decide which design and picture they preferred on their house. One woman explain how she could decide to have a Panda, and another explained as she lives on the main road, she had some saying about what kind of paintings she thought would look nice on her house. The widow explained she did not have anything to do with the paintings as her husband had already passed away, but also say she did not want any responsibility and was happy to get her house more colourful. One woman also explained, none of the residents in the village had anything to say when it came to the colours of the roofs as the pattern from above should look as a rainbow.

4.1.3 Participation in painting planning

Woman 1:

“But she helped small things like the door. Not a lot of women did that, because they kind of like put the responsibilities to the artists, they do not want to mess up”

The women were not invited to meetings, but some could decide the colours of their houses and painting on the walls. During the painting, only one of the women painted on her house. She explained she helped with smaller tasks as the door and windows but said most women did not. This in confirmed by the rest of the women as none of them helped with the painting and three of them say they do not want to be in the way of the painter and give this as the reason for them not to paint their houses.

Woman 4:

“The role is to make some food for the painter. She is afraid she is getting in the way of the painter because she does not know how to paint. I am going to do some food and let you do your job”

At the same time, when the painter painted their houses four of the seven women explain they provided snacks, tea and cigarettes for the painters as they painted their houses.

Since the women give different explanations of why they were not involved or invited to meetings the information to the women about the process has not been cohesive and clear and
indicate women has been left out from official meetings and the information provided to the habitants in the area has not been clear. But when it comes to decisions about the design of their own houses, they got invited to make some decisions about the design. It is also clear, as six out of seven women did not do any painting that this was nothing for the women to do and their role was to provide snacks, drinks and cigarettes for the men repainting. This is confirmed by the CEO of the colour company sponsoring the process and one of the responsible men for the design of houses and paintings in the area.

4.1.4 Project activities carried out
Participation in decision making and planning is one thing. But participation in the implementation of planned activities is another thing, and an aspect measuring empowerment. This study explored whether, and how women got involved in activities in the community.

4.1.4.1 Organizing weekly women meeting
As found, every Wednesday, the women in the neighbourhood gather for a meeting at the community service local. As the women arrive at the meeting, all the women bring a notebook with their name on and bring 10 000 rupiah. The money is collected by the meeting secretary. At the end of the meeting the collected money is used as jackpot in a lottery and one of the women at the meeting get a bigger amount of cash, usually around 300 000 rupiah. Once one has won the jackpot, they still need to put in cash but cannot win until the jackpot has been shared among all members of this lottery. The community also have their own lending service for the women for small amounts, which must be returned within two weeks without interest rate. Later, it was explained this is a common tradition in Indonesia, but for the community this was not possible before the repainting as people rarely had money.

During the meeting, issues in the community is discussed such as the entrance service, community events and environmental issues. The meeting is first lead by a R.T and later it is only women at the meeting. At the end, when the meeting is finished and the money is shared women stay and create different decorations to hang in the streets, all bought by the money from the entrance.

At the Wednesday meeting the researcher attended the treasurer was handing out 3-4 free samples of rice spices to all the women at the meeting, she later explained the sometimes get some sponsoring nowadays from different brands. All of this was something which had started after the village got painted. Three of the women also explained the community bring food
packages for the families in the area every sixth month. The package contains some rice, oil and sugar and is paid by the community with the money from the entrance of visitors. This was confirmed by the CEO of Indana paint.

*Picture 2. Books for weekly payments collected at the weekly meetings. (Arvidsson, 2019)*

*Picture 3. Beginning of a meeting. Women hand in their notebooks and give their weekly contribution to the secretaries of the meeting. (Arvidsson, 2019).*

### 4.1.4.2 Collecting entrance fees

To enter the area there is two main entrance points. One is from a heavily trafficked road, and the other entrance it connected to the Warnu Warni Kampung (Also called Jodipan Village) by a bridge. When visitors enter, they need to pay the 3000-rupiah entrance fee and will get a key ring as a souvenir and ticket. Both the entrances are staffed by two-three women. If visitors enter by scooters or bikes, they will pay extra for the parking and get a ticket by the men who is responsible for the parking lot. This was confirmed by all the interviews by all seven women, and by the CEO of the Indana paint.

During the first interview it became clear it is some women in the village manufactures the souvenirs for the entrance, and thereby earn some money for their contribution to the community. This was later confirmed by the rest of the respondents.

The system was explained more in depth by the treasurer in charge. She was the one who started the initiative to manufacturer small souvenirs in December 2017. As the originator she also got elected as treasurer and responsible for the system. When they started with the initiative it was possible for women interested to be a part so lend some money from the community to buy their first bulk of cotton and fabrics to start making keychains, they then sell the keychains back to
the treasurer in bulk of 100 pieces and get 500 rupiahs/keychain and pay back the loan monthly in their own pace and she invites women to participate.

Woman 7:

“For the keychain, every time you do the batch you get the money immediately”

One of the first women to participate in the keychain manufacturing was woman 4. She explains in the beginning they were about 8 women but as the demand is growing it is about 30-40 women involved as they try not to make a monopoly of the earnings, they also take turns when to hand their batches. Out of the seven women interviewed, 3 of them made souvenirs. Woman 6 described she got invited to make keychains if she learned how to make them properly and explained each woman must make their own patterns to have a wide variety.
4.1.4.3 Making Decorations

The women did not explain in any of the meetings about their role in decorating the area. However, during an observation at a Wednesday meeting it became clear they have a role for the street decorations. After each meeting some women stay and create different decorations as flowers, butterflies etc. The decorations are handmade by felt fabric, rubber fabric and are glued together and changed over time when they get timeworn.

4.1.4.4 Environmental Protection

The cleanliness is one major difference for the habitants in the neighbourhood. All the women emphasised the importance of the communal cleaning day, taking place every Sunday morning. During Sundays the female responsibility is cleaning, and the men do different kind of maintenance in the area as different viewpoints in wood or bamboo which was explained by five of the women. At first it seemed as this was solely volunteered but two women explained if one miss out of the cleaning, they are not allowed to sell tickets or sell their batches of key rings that week as an economic incentive from the treasurer in the area. Also, one of the women was responsible to supervise one of the areas during the cleaning to make sure it is done properly. Another woman explained some people do not participate due to lack of involvement for the community good but did not explain why these people feel left out at the same time as she wanted to explain some people do not change even if the area does. Her answer gives a clear indication not all people in the area feel welcomed to be a part of the community.

Woman 4:

“The ladies will be cleaning the area, and the men will make some maintenance to see if it something wrong with the bridge and the three houses as a community, but the women are for cleaning the area and men do the maintenance”

Woman 6:

“But there is a rule and penalty, when the ladies are not cleaning the communal cleaning, they are not able to submit their work for that week. It’s a really good rule, it forces a discipline towards other people”
4.2. Outcomes from the repainting process

Measuring Empowerment also refers to looking into the outcomes of participation. It is in this perspective that this study explored the outcomes or achievements of women’s participation in the repainting project.

4.2.1 Economic improvements

Six of the seven women expressed an increase in economic terms after their village was repainted. Three of them as increase of their business in their shops outside their house. One of the women as she changed from working as a tailor with her husband and now as a treasurer. Two of the women expressed they now had their own income. The last woman expressed her income due to making souvenirs was less than her previous job which she had to quit before the repainting as her husband did not allow her to keep the old job, this was her only opportunity to having an income.

Woman 4:

“because back then it was not enough for a month to live with her children. Now at least she can be able to better food and enough to buy some clothes as well, which is luxury”

Of the three women in the study who owned a small shop inside the village, two of them had opened it before the village was repainted while one woman had opened it after the repainting. The two women who had their shops for a longer time both expressed an increase of customers in their shops due to tourists entering the village compared to before the repainting of the neighbourhood. Both women also expressed the purchase power of the customers had increased the last years. The third woman with a shop explained she opened the shop due to the increase of people passing by her house and had the shop as her third source of income next to her other two jobs. One woman explained due to more families had jobs in the village they were able to buy more expensive food as chicken and fish more often than before, which increased her income and as a result she was also able to eat better food. The difference in food quality was confirmed by 2 other women express they are now able to buy better food for their children for example lunch for school.

Woman 1:

“Because before the transformation the only customers were the children among this area and these children did not have a lot of pocket money as well, the business was stagnant, and the
store was not improving. After the transformation the children can buy more and different snacks. After the transformation I was able to buy the refrigerator and put some drinks in it”

Woman 6:

“Yes, they can buy more, and she give example of herself she is able to make some really nice food for their children, and her husband is delivering lunchbox for the children. So, she can make lunch for children with good meal rather than before”

Woman 3:

Then before the Tridi village people are buying Tempe, tofu and vegetable. Fish and chicken are rare occurrence. But now, now people can buy chicken, fish on a regular basis because they have jobs making keychains and the husband do the parking. They have more income to buy more food for their families.

4. 2.2 Environment protection

All the women highlighted the environmental changes as one of the biggest differences next to economic improvements compared to before the repainting of the area. All women express the standard of cleanliness as the main change. One woman explained how people used to be sick during the rainy season because of the water but as more people come together and clean each week this problem has decreased. Two of the women explain it used to be the habitants of the neighbourhood who threw garbage in the street but as they all go together weekly to clean people are more aware to keep it clean, instead it is tourist who throw garbage and trash in the street while they are visiting the area. This was something which was confirmed by all the women during interviews. Also, since the houses are more colourful and have different paintings the women say the area look more beautiful as a neighbourhood which makes people happier.

One woman explain as the village has been able to gain some income from the entrance a new electronic pump has been installed to ease the burden and reduce time each day for collecting water. The same woman also explained how the communal bathrooms have been renovating the last two years with a better standard which has been important for a lot of families as most households do not have their own toilets in their house. As more and more visitors enter the
area, the need for more bathrooms resulted in a new communal bathroom being built as well as
the old one being renovated.

Woman 6:

_The made a new one [Bathroom], close to the main road because a lot of visitors need to go to
toilet, so they need a new one. But the communal bathroom in this area, the just renovated it. Then also there is a pump that people, to produce more water in the communal bathroom. They did not have that, they had to pull it by themselves and now they have pump, so they can click the pump and the water comes up._

4.2.3 Social capital

As mentioned before, the women in the village now go to weekly meetings only for women. The women explained the meetings is a good way to talk to neighbours and bring women more together as it is a place to discuss and share problems and thoughts. One woman explains the meetings is the place for women to plan and organize events for the community and explain the women to be more proactive pushing for the community being better.

One important subject for 5 of the 7 women was the social safety net between neighbours if people get sick or pass away. The women explained how the community help with money or food when someone get sick or pass away. This was made in smaller scale before the project between the closest neighbours but now more people go together and help in sickness or death situation which brings the community closer.

Woman 7:

_“because people help each other when they get sick or pass away. This community get more tight together”_
4.2.4 Autonomy/Self-confidence

4.2.4.1 Improved relationship with husbands

When the researcher asked the women about their relationship with their husbands all the women had different answers if the relationship was changed. Two of the women said it was the same but now they did not have to ask for money now, so they were not so dependent on their husbands and hence it was more equal now. One woman expressed she and her husband was fighting more now when she had more responsibility and worked more. The woman who was not allowed to work outside the village expressed she are grateful for what this project has managed to do for other people but does not describe the changes as positive for her as she is still not happy.

Woman4:

“In Javanese, we are not allowed to order our husband to clean the house. It is the highest offence you can say to your husband. But their husband is also a human, so they are able to feel if the wife is suffering. She never in her mind try to ask her husband to help sweep the flour because that is not how we are raised.”

Woman 4:

“It is more equal now. Back then the women had to ask for money from their husbands or partners, and they don’t have self-esteem. It is not self-esteem, but more like the women does not have the bravery to ask for more. But then now, when they have some works, make some cakes they are not stuck in their house they have some business it creates a way of: Yes, I can do this, and can do something outside. And now, they have the bravery to buy some things from their pocket money than ask their husbands”

4.2.4.2 Self-positive image

When the researcher asked the women of how people react when they tell them where they live, all the women expressed a change of attitudes towards their area. It used to be a stigma about the neighbourhood. One woman explained how the neighbourhood used to be called “Kampung Cumu” which can be translated to nasty/dirty village. Before the village was repainted some of the women did not even want to tell people where they live or go with the children to school because of a shameful feeling. Two of the women gave the ambiguous answer as they explain they did not use to care what people thought about them and their place of living. They both explained people judged them, but they did not let it affect them as they should not be shameful.
where they live, at the same time they said they are proud today to tell people where they live. Also, all the women confirm the attitude from people of other parts have changed as people are friendlier now and being curious about the women’s life and living standard in the village.

Woman 5:

“She actually never enjoyed herself when she wanted to apply for jobs to be comfortable enough to tell her address. A lot of people have a stereotype that the people living here is bad people. She did not want to tell her neighbourhood”

Woman 7:

[People]  “They say why do you live in that slum area? And then after village got painted, I gain more and more positive vibes”

In an interview with the CEO of Indana paint, it was confirmed people used to have preconceptions about people living in the kampung.

“Before the transformation people did not have money and did not work and now, they have work and job and become friendly. ... We can see the changes, It was dirty and now it is a tourist attraction, people change both moneywise, But also their attitude with strangers, before they did not like strangers, They have a better attitude and are welcoming and they have changed their habits” (Sugiharto, 2019).

4.2.4.3 Privacy gain

Even as the women describe the stigma of the neighbourhood to be less today than before, due to the increase of people entering the village each day two of the women describe the negative effect of people seeing the area as a tourist attraction their personal space is less. One of the women describe how busy days make her uncomfortable to leave her house as the streets get very crowded and she feels locked into her home. Another woman describes how some tourist do not respect the people’s homes and sometimes walk into their houses without permission and being rude to the inhabitants of the village.
Woman 6:

“I do not have the freedom to go outside because does not want to go outside. It makes the street claustrophobic. A lot of people go on this street and I am not able to go outside because, let them pass”

Woman 3:

“People from that are just drop the peacefulness, sometimes they go into someone’s house without saying excuse me”

4.3 Capacity for planning the future
As the researcher asked about future plans none of the women had any clear goals but expressed it more as the future will tell what will work out and it is better to go with the flow and hope to be health and still alive and the translator had to explain the question a few times sometimes as this was seen as bit of an odd question to ask.

Woman 6:

“She does not have her own personal dream, but she wants her children to get the highest education as they can get so they don’t have to end up as their parents”

At the same time all except one mentioned their children’s future as their top priority. The main concern for the women was to be able to send their children to university and give them a better education than they had. Two of the mothers explained they did not hope their children to have the same faith as them and there for their children going to a higher education was an important dream. One mother explained she was not able to send her oldest daughter to university but now as her family shop was bringing more money this could be possible for their second daughter if they managed to apply for a scholarship. The widow which children was now adults expressed herself different. She explained her son was disabled and as a result she wished to be able to help him more by earning more money in the store. But she also explained as one of her wishes in life was to go the short pilgrim to Mecca one day. Earlier days, she never thought it would be possible, but she felt torn between being the good mother and help her son or save some more money and do the pilgrim.
Two of the women explained before they had repainted the neighbourhood they planned or wanted to open small shops in other parts of the city but as the economy grew and the village became more popular, they no longer wanted to have a store outside the area.

Two of the women was also talking about buying a house, for them or for their children in the future. This was something they said was never something to dream of before, but now it was possible to think about it. The first woman said their house was too small for nine people so it would be nice with a bigger house and the second lady explained this was something she wished her children will be able to do when they get older, to live in a nice neighbourhood and have a comfortable life.

Woman 4:

“before she does not even have any dreams, but she was just being realistic. I cannot even save some money every month. How can I dream about something but now, she is thinking of finding a house”

However, two of the women felt a wish to change their life situation but both felt they was unable to do so because of different circumstances. The first woman working as a treasurer express her wish to step down from her job as a treasurer and start working together with her husband again as a tailor as the job was too demanding but could not do so if no one else wanted to take over her position.

Woman 7:

“But she came here to be married to her husband and then one thing she really want it that her children will not have the same faith as her”

The second woman wanted to start working outside the village again in the factory she once had worked in. She expressed she wanted to but was unable since her husband did not allow it and said at least she hope her children will face a different faith.

All the women also expressed they wished the neighbourhood to continue to attract visitors as it was helpful for the community and people were happier as a community now than before. It is also clear the focus for the future for all the women is their children.
5. Analysis
This chapter aim to answer the research question if the slum-upgrading project in Kampung Tridi lead to empowerment of the women living in the neighbourhood by analysing the findings through Kabeer’s framework of empowerment. The chapter will first focus on the three main concepts of resources, agency and achievements to be able to answer the question if the slum-upgrading project in Kampung Tridi empower women living in the neighbourhood. This will then be answered later in the chapter. Last in the analysis the researcher will discuss the relevance of using the framework of Empowerment in this study.

It is important to remember the Naila Kabeer’s main idea about empowerment as stated before. “One way to think about power is in terms of the ability to make choices: to be disempowered, therefore implies to be denied choice” (Kabeer, 2001, p. 18)

5.1 Resources
In the findings 6 out of 7 women explained they had an increase of income since the project started, three of them since they had their own shop and the rest of them as they were selling souvenirs or working in the entrance. The food packages and the weekly savings was also considered increase of resources. Also, since all houses has been painted their material living standard increased as well as the communal bathroom was renovated, and the pump was installed the communal resources increased over time.

One could then argue material resources on the individual and communal level increased since the slum was upgraded (Kabeer, 2001).

The second external resource Kabeer emphasise is the social sphere in where women can make new connections impossible before (Kabeer, 2001). Here the women now had weekly meetings within the neighbourhood to discuss common problems and plan different events. As these meetings did not occur before the painting this connection and social network was a new social resource. As 5 out of the 7 women also mentioned how the neighbours nowadays helped each other if someone got sick or passed away their social security net had increased the last years after the paintings occurred in the area. This also goes together with the communal Sunday cleanings in which the women cooperated to maintain the area, their connection within the neighbourhood got deeper.
Since the area became a tourist destination, the women also met people from different parts of Indonesia as well as foreigner. Even if the women did not mention this as an impact of their networking the researcher observed this as an opportunity for the women to get more connected to the global world today and being able to meet people from different social classes and countries. One could argue it goes together with the fact the women felt less ashamed of their Kampung as the social stigma had decreased and thereby their chances to connect with people from other parts of Malang also increased their opportunities to make new connections impossible before.

Human resources are internal and refers to skills, knowledge and self-esteem (Kabeer, 2001). Even as the women expressed themselves different, all of them confirmed the previous negative attitudes towards their neighbourhood has declined and instead of being negative more people outside the neighbourhood was positive towards the area as a result of the process. This affected the women both on the individual and structural level. This as they did not feel ashamed to be living in the area nowadays and could be proud of what they had accomplished. As women confirmed in the study, they were not being ashamed of telling people where they live nowadays, Chant’s statement of housing being linked to well-being is confirmed.

Two of the women also expressed they did not need to ask their husband for money anymore which made them more self-reliant and independent in their marriage which one could argue is a tool towards better self-esteem. As 3 women was also making souvenirs for the community their skills had also increased.

However, it is important not to underestimate the negative effect as the personal freedom was in one way decreased as people entered the area and the women could feel trapped inside their own house as the streets got crowded in the weekends and this was nothing the women felt they could do anything about since the positive outcomes from the tourism was valued higher than personal space. Here, one could argue the communal well-being as economic improvement was valued higher than personal freedom for the women itself.

One could argue all the resources mentioned above had increased over time which according to the theory is one major step towards empowerment. However, one must also take into consideration if the improvement of the resources themselves lead to the ability to make strategic or secondary choices and how the allocation of resources been divided which will be discussed later in the chapter.
5.2 Agency

The second level of empowerment is the Agency. Naila Kabeer explains it with “the ability to define one’s goal and act upon them” (Kabeer, 2001, p. 21).

When we start to discuss the agency of the women, we now can discuss and problematize the exclusion of the women before and during the painting of the neighbourhood in 2016. As all the women and the other sources confirmed women were left out of official meetings they were disempowered during the process. This as they had no saying if the area should be repainted or how it should be carried out to maximise the positive outcomes for all the inhabitants in the Kampung. The women did not get the chance to define their goals with the repainting and as they felt they did not have the skills needed to repaint their houses they could not act to get their voices heard. However, they could choose the colours of their houses and the paintings on their walls, but they did not have the ability to not get their houses painted or to change the path of the project. One woman argued it had nothing to do with them being women, but more to the fact they do not have the right social status being lower class citizens while the other women explained is was due to women is not supposed to be in the official meetings. They became participants rather than active agents during the repainting as the active agents was the men in the neighbourhood. In the case of Kampung Tridi, as we will discuss later, this did not lead to women being dis-empowered as they later in the process became active agents but the project itself could have led to negative outcomes from the women’s perspective being left out.

After the houses was repainted and the Kampung started to have an entrance fee, something else happened and the women became active agents in the community. As the woman in the study being the treasurer for the community came up with the idea to start making souvenirs for the visitors entering, she was able to set a goal and act upon it. One could argue this specific initiative has itself being an important factor for more women to get involved in the community and set their own goals as making souvenirs, open more shops and work in the entrance. This as the initiative was made by a woman for women to take part which made them less dependent on their husbands and could start setting own goals as saving money or buying a house.
5.3 Achievements as Empowerment

The third dimension in the framework is achievements. Achievements is the resources and agency combined (Kabeer, 2001). Achievements is therefore the dimension to use to answer the research question if the slum-upgrading project in Kampung Tridi lead to empowerment of the women leading in the neighbourhood. Here, the researcher will start with some arguments pointing towards the process being empowering for the women, but as well discuss some arguments against it.

Also, as the women are having their weekly meetings every week, they can now set goals and act towards them as a community. In the meetings they get the chance to plan different events, give out food packages and with the savings each week it also allows women to get some extra money and decide what to do with them. As the women also create different decorations to hang up in the community, they can set their own goals of how the neighbourhood should look like. The decorations are a very important detail, as none of the women mention themselves as being active agents and making decisions of the area except the cleaning as maintenance is a responsibility for men. But even if the men is doing maintenance and have their own meeting and make more official decisions for the community, the women in the area is acting as active members in the community and setting goals for the area while they are doing decorations and hanging them in the streets. One could then wonder why the women did not highlight this activity in the community. One argument is because it is not official meetings and one does not need permission from the men to hang the decorations in the street and the women does not see the big impact the decorations has for the area but tend to focus on bigger projects as rebuilding and maintain the houses and structures in the area, and as the men does it, it automatically is seen as more important.

As this project then show similarities with previous research defined by UN-habitat about how men and women tend to be involved in different spheres of issues (Desai, 2010, pp. 49-50) it is also important to highlight how the gender-roles in the community plays a vital role of how the women express their wishes and goals. As the women are focused on decorations and cleaning in the area and sees it as their task the previous gender-roles the women expressed as the men being the breadwinner and women are not supposed to ask their husbands to help with cleaning. They expressed this set of structures as a Javanese tradition and did not question it. With this mind-set the women tend to see their role as women as a cleaners and caretakers and the community itself keep implement this way of thinking by keeping dividing tasks between
women and men, which also affect the agencies of one’s goal and none of the women expressed a will to change this way of thinking.

Two women expressed their goal for the future was to give their children a higher education. One woman mentioned she now saw the ability to apply for scholarship for her daughter as possible compared to before the repainting as it would not been possible as her first daughter never had the chance to get higher education. The second woman also expressed her biggest wish was to give her children a better life than hers and mentioned education as the important way. As the women set goals for their children and see the opportunity to act towards the goal shows their ability to set own goals has increased over time. Even if the goals are as mothers to provide a good life for their children, the goals are still within reach during their lifetime and the underlying way of thinking becomes clear, the mothers want to provide a better life with more opportunities than they had.

However, two women in the study did not feel their ability to set goals and act upon them was increased. The first woman, the treasurer expressed she had goals and wanted to go back to her old job working with her husband but did not have the ability to act and quit her job as a treasurer. This is important for the theory as it shows how more resources does not always lead to a stronger ability to set your own goals. The second woman also expressed she wished to go back to her old job which she had to quit as her husband did not allow her to work to far from home and therefore, she now worked within the community. This gave her a small income but did not give her the ability to act upon her goals, she still felt she needed to do as her husband suggested and decided was best for the family and the project did not give her a higher chance to set her own goals and act upon them, and one could argue the project itself might could lead to her being more trapped within the area as there are now job opportunities in the Kampung and from her husband’s perspective there would be no need for her to seek other jobs outside the area which in the long term give her less personal freedom.

Two women also expressed a will to buy a house outside the Kampung. Both women explained this dream could be possible in the future if they continued to save money. They had the ability to set a long-term goal and strive for it.

Last, but not least is the communal agenda. As a group the women expressed, they wished this Kampung would gain more attention to keep tourists coming and visit the area. Here, it might
be due to the meeting, or the positive outcomes the women did not only set an agenda for their own families but also wanted to work as a community to achieve more within the group.

The women in the study have been able to start save more money and set new goals, which they believed being impossible before. As they mentioned buying houses and sending their children to higher education due to the increase of savings, they have achieved to use their increase of economic resources to achieve dreams impossible before.

One lady managed to achieve opening a shop due to the increase of people visiting the area since the project gained international attention. This gave her and her husband increased income and the shop itself is an achievement due to the project.

The 3 women who now was making souvenirs and selling them to the community had also managed to set their goal to gain economic benefits as the community gained more attention and saw the opportunity to earn some money and getting their own source of income. As the opportunity to earn money by selling souvenirs to tourist became possible after the repainting of the area this achievement brings evidence to the process being empowering for the women in the study.

As the women in the study had an increase of income, was being active members in the community meetings and the communal cleaning they had increased their power as women on the structural level in the community. This as they now worked more coherent as a group and managed to bring out food packages, plan events and determine how they are should be decorated. Even if this was not seen as official decision-making the women now had more to say within the community as they were active community members and they did set the agenda of what to focus on when it came to the local environment and activities within the community. They were also contributing more in the local economy as they now could afford better food and did not have to ask their husbands for money when they wanted to go to the market which gave them stronger purchase power within the household as well.

So, as the women had more to say, increased their income and had achieved things they saw as impossible before the project the answer of the research question “Did the slum-upgrading project in Kampung Tridi lead to the empowerment of the women living in the neighbourhood?”

Yes, the outcomes of the slum-upgrading project lead to empowerment of the women living in Kampung Tridi. This since before the project the women did not have the same abilities to make choices and act upon them, and as the repainting in the area was done and more opportunities
became possible for women to act upon their process of empowering started and three years after the slum was upgraded, women have more to say in the community, they earn better income and they have been able to achieve things impossible before.

5.4 The overall connection to the theoretical framework
There is some limitations in the analysis of empowerment on this Kampung, as empowerment is locally based the risk is the researcher see the change in the livelihood of the women from a western feminist approach which could lead to oversimplify the processes which is a limitation for the researcher as well as the theory as there is no simple solution to this but to be aware of the local circumstances when applying the theory to a research problem.

Even though these limitations might affect the findings the researcher aimed to evaluate a slum-project from a feminist approach to evaluate different women’s perspectives on local development in their area. The framework proved to be a successful tool to be able to evaluate the outcomes from the project as it gave the researcher the ability to evaluate different aspects of the project and as the framework itself is based on being locally based it also give the researcher the ability to find out what the women in the study themselves consider being important for them and what changes in their day to day life they valued as the most important.

The theory proved to be valid in the case of Kampung Tridi as the aim with the theory is to explain different kinds of spheres in life and how it all is connected to people’s life quality. The theory was then very useful to use to be able to focus on external and internal resources, living standard, inclusion or exclusion from decision-making and be able to link all of this together to evaluate a project to see if development itself can bring power to people.
6. Conclusion

The aim with this study was to investigate whether the slum-upgrading project in Kampung Tridi in Malang, Indonesia lead to empowerment of the women living in the area and whether they were involved in decision-making during the project. The slum-upgrading of the area was to repaint all the houses in the area in colourful colours with different paintings on the walls, the roofs painted as a rainbow to attract tourists to the area. The aim was to evaluate from a gender sensitive approach and therefore Naila Kabeer’s theory of Empowerment was used to as a lens of the processes and outcomes of the project.

The study was conducted as a case study based mainly on interviews with women living in the area to understand their perception of the process and outcomes for them as individuals and as a community.

The study revealed that the slum-upgrading project empowered women who participated in it even though they were excluded from official meetings before and during the repainting of the area. They were able to take part in the painting activities whereby the houses were painted by the men and some local artist while the women provided snacks and drinks during the repainting process. After the repainting was finished and the neighbourhood started to have an entrance for visitors the women became much more involved probably through the communal cleanings on Sundays to keep the area clean for the visitors and for the residents.

One woman suggested to make souvenirs for visitors and as a result, women in the area started to make small keyrings to sell to the community which pay them for the job. The community then used the keyrings as entrance tickets for visitors and as a result, women in the area got a new opportunity to gain their own income. As some women was also working in the entrance, another new economic opportunity became available for the women as well as the shops started to bring in more income for the residents. The project also had some positive effect on the community in general. As more people earned more income the social security net got wider as more could help when people died or got sick. After some time, the women also started with weekly meetings in where they discussed problems within the area, planned events and had a small savings-service for the women. In the meetings the women also made decorations and handed out food packaged from time to time.
The research showed the women got more financial resources, but it also showed the women got more to say in the area as they now had weekly meetings, planned different events and took care of the communal cleaning. For the researcher it became clear the women got a more important role in the community even if it was clear it was still very gender-based. The gender structures within the area did not change over time, but rather some activities as women being responsible for cleaning, decorations and entrance made gender-roles even more set-in stone.

As a result of the neighbourhood got more famous and attracted visitors from Indonesia and from abroad, the social stigma and negative prejudice connected to the Kampung started to dissolve the self-esteem of the women increased which had positive effects on the women’s well-being. But with more visitors in the area some women felt a lack of privacy as a negative consequence. Also, the women had different agendas today compared to before the project as they now explained the opportunity and plan to get their children to attend university and some dreamed about buying a house, which they explained was not possible before due to lack of resources.

The researched showed, the positive outcomes of the project had together lead to empowerment of the women as individuals as well as a group as they now had more resources, they could set their own agenda to some extent and they had been able to achieve things they felt impossible before, but this was all after the actual repainting project and more as a result of the area becoming famous than during the slum being repainted.

The study will be important for future research as it confirms women are still excluded from decision-making and left out from political and social projects and the women confirm this if based on stereotypes and culture is used as an explanation to keep women out from being active participants in their areas. However, the study also shows that when women get the opportunity to become active citizens within the city, they could increase the income for their households and community and different project in a slum can have positive outcomes for the inhabitants when they can be active. The research also suggests that women tend to be more active in the community in the unofficial sphere and their impact is not always highlighted.

This research show the need to keep evaluate how women and men have different opportunities to make decisions for their community and more research needs to be done on more slum-
upgrading project to understand how women can be more included and how the outcomes for the whole community thereby can be improved even more. The researcher suggests more research with focus on women’s perspective will give a deeper understanding how to make our cities more inclusive in the common goals to decrease poverty.
Bibliography


GuysPro, 2019. Indonesia: Instagram.


Setiawan, P. N., 2019. [Interview] (11 04 2019).


## Appendices

### Appendix A: Interview participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Interview participants</th>
<th>Date of interview</th>
<th>Location of interview</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Interview 1, Woman 1 -Shop owner</td>
<td>April 8(^{th}), 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 2, Woman 2- Treasurer</td>
<td>April 8(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 3, Woman 3- Shop owner</td>
<td>April 9(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 4, Woman 4- Souvenir maker</td>
<td>April 10(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 5, Woman 5 – Shop owner</td>
<td>April 10(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Participant observation- women weekly meeting</td>
<td>April 11(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 6, Woman 5 – Shop owner</td>
<td>April 11(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 7, Woman 6- Souvenir maker</td>
<td>April 11(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 8- Man, local artist</td>
<td>April 11(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 9- Woman 7 – souvenir maker</td>
<td>April 12(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Kampung Tridi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 10- Man, CEO Indana Paint</td>
<td>April 16(^{th}) 2019</td>
<td>Phone-interview- Malang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interview 11 – GuysPro</td>
<td>April-May 2019</td>
<td>Instagram/WhatsApp</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix B: Interview guide

Information to all the participants

I am a student from Linnaeus University in Sweden conducting a research here in Indonesia. My study wants to understand how the transformation of your neighbourhood have affected your living situation.

I will ask you some questions on the topic, and you do not have to answer them if they make you feel uncomfortable or if you simply do not want to. Nothing you say will be used in other purposes than for this research. You are all anonymous and can stop the interview whenever you want.

Socio-demographic characteristics

Age:

Marital status:

Number of people in household:

Schooling:

Resources:

1. Do you have your own source of income?
2. How much is your share of the household income?
3. How are decisions taken about spending and savings?
4. How do you and your husband share the responsibilities? (cooking, children etc)
5. Has you relation with your husband changed since they repainted?
6. Do you have your own phone, and what do you use if for?
7. Are the phones a big cost?

Job/resources

8. How is a normal day for you?
9. Do you have a job?
10. IF no, why not?
11. If yes, how did you get this job?
12. How do people react about you working?
13. What gave you the opportunity to be able to open your shop? How did you afford it?
14. Do you have the same income today as before they painted?

Living situation

15. Did you grow up here or did you move here? Why?
16. How do you feel to tell people where you live?
17. How do people react when you tell them where you live?
18. Is your relationship with your neighbours different now?
19. (Do you feel safe here?)
20. How is the safety different from before?
21. What are the biggest dangers for you?
22. What has been the negative effects?

**Participation**
23. Did you participate in the painting project on your own decision?
24. If yes, did you participate in the whole process (planning, meeting, implementation? how)
25. Did someone ask you to be a part of the project?
26. If they requested and asked you, would you have done it anyway?
27. Did the RT (Neighbourhood association) invite all the people?
28. Did you talk at the meeting or mostly listen?
29. Did they listen to you?
30. Do you feel more prone to give suggestions in the meetings now?
31. Would you ever consider to be a RT-leader?
32. What are the biggest challenges for women in your area?
33. Have you made new social relations/connections that were impossible before the project?

**The future**
34. What plans do you have for the future?
35. How do you think your life will look in five years from now?