An analysis concerning three organisations work with reducing child labour

- A case study within Peru’s mining industry

Marie Bergvall Bark
Sanaz Sheikholeslamzadeh
Abstract

Humanvetenskapliga institutionen
Internationella Samhällsstudier, C-uppsats
Handledare: Rolf Hugoson
Vårterminen 2007
Title: An analysis concerning three organisations work with reducing child labour
- a case study within Peru’s mining industry
Av: Marie Bergvall Bark och Sanaz Sheikholeslamzadeh

This thesis aim to describe and analyze different organisations’ work with reducing child labour. In order to understand the complex matter of child labour, a case study concerning children’s situation within the mining industry in Peru has been made. The first part of the thesis has been designed to be an introduction to the matter, with a description of the mining industry in Peru and the situation of child labour. The two following parts are more analytic in character. The second and third part discusses how the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) can be used as an instrument of reducing child labour. Further, top down and bottom up-theories will be discussed as different approaches and working methods for organisations.

In addition to find the answers to our questions, interviews have been conducted with employees of the organisations (ILO, UNICEF and Save the Children), articles and literature have been analyzed and finally Internet have contributed with information about child labour, Peru, the organisations, theories and the MDGs.

This study claims that child labour is a complex matter and one possible solution to reduce it can be through promoting education. This can only be viable if organisations work together with governments, using a combination of top down and bottom up approaches.

Keywords: Peru, child labour, MDGs, accountability, top-down and bottom-up approaches
# 1. INTRODUCTION ........................................................................................................................................ 7

1.2 PROBLEM .................................................................................................................................................. 8
1.2.1 BACKGROUND ......................................................................................................................................... 10
1.2.2 PURPOSE OF THE PAPER ....................................................................................................................... 11
1.2.3 QUESTIONS ................................................................................................................................................ 11
1.2.4 DISPOSITION ............................................................................................................................................. 12
1.2.5 DELIMITATIONS ....................................................................................................................................... 12
1.3 THEORY ....................................................................................................................................................... 14
1.4 METHODOLOGY .......................................................................................................................................... 15
1.4.1 QUALITATIVE/QUANTITATIVE METHOD AND CASE STUDY RESEARCH .................................................. 15
1.4.2 METHOD PROBLEMS ............................................................................................................................... 16
1.4.3 VALIDITY AND RELIABILITY ................................................................................................................... 17
1.5 SELECTION OF DATA ................................................................................................................................. 17
1.5.1 CRITICISM OF SOURCES ......................................................................................................................... 17

# 2. ACCOUNTABILITY ...................................................................................................................................... 19

2.1 ACCOUNTABILITY FROM WHOM/WHERE? .............................................................................................. 21

# 3. MINING INDUSTRY AND ECONOMY IN PERU ......................................................................................... 22

3.1 BACKGROUND ........................................................................................................................................... 22
3.2 THE MINING INDUSTRY ............................................................................................................................. 22
3.3 CHILDREN’S SITUATION WITHIN THE MINING INDUSTRY ..................................................................... 23

# 4. WHAT ARE THE ORGANISATIONS APPROACHES IN TERMS OF REDUCING CHILD LABOUR WITHIN PERU’S MINING INDUSTRY? ................................................................................. 25

4.1 UNICEF ......................................................................................................................................................... 25
4.2 ILO ................................................................................................................................................................. 27
4.3 SAVE THE CHILDREN ................................................................................................................................. 29
4.3.1 SAVE THE CHILDREN – A NGO ................................................................................................................ 30

# 5. WHAT ARE THE OPPORTUNITIES AND DIFFICULTIES OF REDUCING CHILD LABOUR THROUGH THE SECOND PARAGRAPH IN THE MDGS, WHICH ENTAILS EDUCATION FOR ALL CHILDREN BY THE YEAR 2015? ......................................................................................... 32

5.1. WHAT ARE THE OPPORTUNITIES WITH THE SECOND PARAGRAPH IN THE MDGS? ........................................ 32
5.2 MDGs, CAN IT BE REACHED? ..................................................................................................................... 36

# 6. THERE ARE DIFFERENT APPROACHES FOR UNDERTAKE DEVELOPMENTAL ISSUES, SUCH AS TOP-DOWN AND BOTTOM-UP APPROACHES. WHICH OF THEM ARE MOST EFFICIENT REGARDING THE MDGS AND THE EDUCATION AS AN INSTRUMENT TO REDUCE CHILD LABOUR IN PERU? ......................................................................................... 38

6.1 PERU AND EDUCATION ............................................................................................................................ 41

# 7 ANALYSIS ..................................................................................................................................................... 45

# 8 CONCLUSION .............................................................................................................................................. 48

REFERENCES ..................................................................................................................................................... 50
List of charts

Figure 1: Child work by quintiles of expenditure p.42
Figure 2: Key Relationships of Power: The Accountability Triangle p.44
Descriptions

**Human rights** - Refer to United Nations declaration on Human rights, from the year 1948.¹

**Child labour** - “Child labour refers to work that is mentally, physically, socially or morally dangerous and harmful to children; and interferes with their schooling: by depriving them of the opportunity to attend school; by obliging them to leave school prematurely; or by requiring them to attempt to combine school attendance with excessively long and heavy work. In its most extreme forms, it involves children being enslaved, separated from their families, exposed to serious hazards and illnesses and/or left to fend for themselves on the streets of large cities - all of this often at a very early age. Child labour is work that deprives children of their childhood, their potential and their dignity, and that is harmful to physical and mental development.”²

**ILO** - International Labour Organisation, was founded in the year 1919, and was initially working with labour standards, working hours and has developed to include even more issues. It works with a three partial method, which includes the employer, the worker and the government.³

**UNICEF** - United Nations International Children’s Emergency Fund, “UNICEF was created with this purpose in mind – to work with others to overcome the obstacles that poverty, violence, disease and discrimination place in a child’s path. We work in 191 countries through country programmes and National Committees.”⁴

**UNDP** - United Development Programme, “UNDP is the UN's global development network, an organization advocating for change and connecting countries to knowledge, experience and resources to help people build a better life. We are on the ground in 166 countries, working with them on their own solutions to global and national development challenges.”⁵

**Human Development** - “In seeking that something else, human development shares a common vision with human rights. The goal is human freedom. And in pursuing capabilities

4 [http://www.unicef.org/about/who/index_introduction.html](http://www.unicef.org/about/who/index_introduction.html)
and realizing rights, this freedom is vital. People must be free to exercise their choices and to participate in decision-making that affects their lives. Human development and human rights are mutually reinforcing, helping to secure the well-being and dignity of all people, building self-respect and the respect of others.  

**HDI** - Human Development Index is decided from UNDP's three perspectives regarding, education, health care and economic status.  

**Poverty** - The MDGs have poverty reduction at their core. The definition of poverty used in these targets is an economic one and the measurements used is a poverty line. People living on less than one US dollar per day are defined as being in “extreme poverty” and less than two US dollars per day are in “poverty”.  

**Acronyms**

**MDGs** - Millennium Development Goals  
**ILO** - International Labour Organization  
**UNICEF** - United Nations Children’s Emergency Fund  
**NGO** - Non-Governmental Organization  
**GDP** - Gross domestic product  
**UNDP** - United Nations Development Programme  
**ICISS** - International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty  
**GNP** - Gross National Product  
**EFA** - Education for All (second paragraph of the MDGs)  

---

7 Willis, p.13  
8 Willis, p. 13-14
1. Introduction

Child labour exists in several regions around the world and the International Labour Organisation estimated that in the year 2004:

“...there were 218 million children trapped in child labour, of whom 126 million in hazardous work...”

The children in our world need to be protected and supported in order to uphold their rights. Children have the right to a free life, childhood and education and that is why these rights must be preserved. Children should also be given the opportunity to receive an education and not be forced to work.

The kind of work which children are involved in varies between countries and geographical conditions. This thesis will examine perspectives of how three important organisations deal with child labour in mining in Peru, furthermore there will be a discussion and analysis regarding the theoretical and practical approaches of their work. The work intended to reduce child labour and how this is related to the Millennium Development Goals, will be declared in this thesis. A closing discussion regarding top down and bottom up-theories aim to give the reader a wider perspective on the matter of child labour.

Peru is interesting from both an economical and a developmental perspective. During the last ten years Peru has become a stable economy and many organisations have helped the country’s development through projects and programmes.

Katie Willis and Amartya Sen will both be in the centre of our theories and inspiration. The two authors both have strong opinions regarding development and personal freedom. Therefore, their work and studies will be essential for this thesis. It is important to declare the complexity in the matter of development. Finally the authors uphold a long history of researching and writing about these matters.

There are many organisations working with children’s rights and we have chosen three different international organisations for our thesis. The reasons to why we have chosen

---

10 Willis, p. 138
these organisations are; firstly, they work at different levels and with different methods. Secondly, they have slightly different directions concerning their aims. The organisations we have chosen are ILO, UNICEF and Save the Children. Their work in Peru will be studied in this thesis, from the perspective of children’s rights, education and development.

1.2 Problem

Child labour is not a new phenomena, it holds a long history throughout many countries in the world. In the Western democracies it has been on the agenda since the 18th century and the beginning of the industrial revolution. ILO is one of the organisations that have been dealing with these issues, since the year 1919.

There are different forms of child labour and ILO has defined some of them. Although in this thesis focus will be on domestic work. According to ILO the worst forms of child labour are:

"Slavery, trafficking, armed conflict, hazardous work and sexual exploitation."

Children who are involved with domestic work (domestic work regarding working in mining, is considered to be included in the term hazardous work. This because of the high risk of injuries and other health related issues) often face that their work interfere with their schoolwork. Mr Ndjonkou Director at the ILO office in New York has the following opinion:

“Firstly you have to address the problem with poverty in order to reduce child labour. Of course there is not a straight line between forced child labour and domestic work, but if the child is not in school, the question remains, where is it?”

Mr Ndjonkou's comment is interesting and focuses on the centre of the matter of child labour. The quote is referring to that child labour can never be discussed as a solitary problem but must be seen in a wider perspective, including traditions, poverty and development. This is one of the reasons why child labour can be related to the MDGs.

---

12 Hollander, “Barn och rätt”, p. 115
13 Ibid.
16 A World Bank country Study, “A New Social Contract for Peru”, p. 77
Within the UN there are two organisations that focus on children’s rights in various ways. UNICEF and ILO are two crucial organisations, and therefore their work needs to be evaluated and reviewed. What is their approach as regards to child labour in mining in Peru and is their work relevant? One of the world’s most famous NGOs working for children is “Save the Children”. They also play an important role in the work of reducing child labour. We often hear about these organisations in terms of endowment programs and support, nevertheless their actual work is seldom uttered in terms of how they work. Therefore it is essential to study the theoretical work as well as the practical work of these organisations. It is important to remember that their work is to some extent governed by regulations that they cannot control, and this is being confirmed in the thesis by explaining the role of the MDGs and its essence in these matters.

This thesis wishes to emphasize the surrounding problems such as, the issue of poverty, the global targets and the different approaches of the organisations. It is essential to comprehend how all these problems are connected and that none of them stands alone, each and every one of these problems leads to the other.

Theorists such as Amartya Sen and Katie Willis have both emphasized the different traditions within development issues. Both of them have had great influence on development theories, although they do not have exactly the same approach. Amartya Sen is promoting a more philosophical theory, which can be used as a foundation. This theory does not provide actual suggestions on how to reach development through increased freedom. Sen’s theory discusses the term development in a wider perspective than perhaps other previous research. On the other hand, Sen’s interpretation of the word development makes it almost impossible to measure.

Another theorist such as Katie Willis has a different view regarding development. Willis argues, presents and discusses different approaches and methods of working with issues related to development. Her theory includes an essential discussion concerning grass root development. This work holds interesting information and research about top down and bottom up-theories, even though her personal opinion is very clear to the reader. Willis is a supporter of grass root organisations and the bottom up theory.

Amartya Sen and Katie Willis argue why freedom and development is important. They also discuss various obstacles for freedom; one example is the matter of child labour. Our thesis
seeks to investigate further how child labour is related to development through different approaches. The discussion then leads further on to the matter of reducing child labour through the MDGs. As the MDGs are composed from a top down perspective, Willis continues with the following words:

“The issue of child labour is a particularly complicated one in development policies and is a good example of how policies need to be designed in particular contexts and based on the participation of groups that will be affected”.  

Should perhaps one of the goals in the MDGs, specifically concern the issue of child labour, instead of indirectly, with the present second goal? This is why our thesis becomes interesting, theories have been created concerning development and we intended to bring that discussion together with child labour and top down/bottom up-theories, by doing a case study in Peru’s mining industry.

1.2.1 Background

A report from 1999 showed that Peru had a population of approximately 25 million people; 10 million of them were children and during the same period it was found that 2 million of these children were working in informal settings. This high number of children working makes Peru an interesting example for our thesis.

Since Peru is a large exporter of minerals and metals, this generates many working opportunities. Unfortunately, this also leads child labour within the informal settings. The mining industry is important for the country’s economy and thereby also for the inhabitants. Many organisations such as ILO, UNICEF and Save the Children are working in the country in order to deal with the issue of child labour.

Children’s rights are often seen as an obvious part of society, despite this – many children around the world are not receiving the help they need or the education they is crucial for their personal development and their right to freedom. The issue regarding child labour holds a complexity, which entails a great amount of patience and will in order to be able to reduce it. Much still needs to be done and our thesis will describe and analyze some methods used.

17 Ibid. p. 138
18 http://www.ecpat.net/eng/ecpat_inter/projects/monitoring/online_database/index.asp
19 http://www.swedishtrade.se/landrapporter/?objectId=6773
in the struggle to reduce child labour. These analyses will be concluded from top down and bottom up-perspectives. The three organisations have tried various methods and approaches, which are supposed to achieve certain goals. The MDGs are examples of international goals, which are set to be a common guidance for both organisations and countries around the world.

1.2.2 Purpose of the paper

Our purpose with this thesis is to examine how three important organisations deal with the matter of child labour and their approach in their work of reducing it. The three organisations we have chosen work all over the world, and at different levels of decision. We found out that all these organisations are engaged in the work against child labour in mining in Peru, in one way or another. Consequently, Peru became an interesting target. Furthermore child labour in mining is not the most common sort of labour these days, and so this makes it even more interesting.

A campaign was conducted a few years ago by ILO (International Labour Conference) and UNICEF. The cooperation aimed to prevent child labour and promote children to go to school. This is only one example of what can be done in this issue. This matter is closely related to the second paragraph in the MDG's. In order for children to be able to have a compulsory education, they can not work at the same time. If the connection between education and the MDGs is to be possible, the work with reducing child labour is of great importance.

1.2.3 Questions

Our first question will examine what is being done by three organizations in this matter of child labour in mining in Peru. The second question will view how “education for all” is the key to reducing child labour in Peru, especially within the mining industry. We will also pose the question if the goal is reasonable or not. The third question will discuss the matter of responsibility, aid and theories.

http://www.unicef.se/nyheter/2005/06/15/utbildning_basta_sattet_att_forhindra_barnarbete/,
1. What are ILO’s, UNICEF’s, and Save the Children’s approach in terms of reducing child labour within Peru’s mining industry?

2. What are respectively, the opportunities and difficulties with reducing child labour through the second paragraph in the MDG, which entails education for all children by the year 2015?

3. There are different approaches for undertaking developmental issues, such as top-down and bottom-up approaches. Which of them are most efficient regarding the MDGs and the education as an instrument to reduce child labour in Peru?

1.2.4 Disposition

In order to understand the work against child labour, within the mining industry in Peru and how this issue is strongly related to the MDGs, we will begin the thesis with a short introduction concerning sovereignty. This is because of the fact that the work with reducing child labour often includes many actors. If an organisation is determined to work with this issue, the country’s government must be included at least as a dialogue partner. One could argue that the phenomenon called globalisation is affecting boundaries and relations between countries around the world. Therefore it is of great importance that all participants who handle policies are having a dialogue regarding accountability and sovereignty.

A short introduction of Peru will be made, with focus on the mining industry and children’s situation in the country. This will be followed by a description of the three organisations’ work in Peru. The thesis will continue with answering the second question concerning how child labour is related to MDGs, and an introduction together with clarification about some terms will be given, followed by a discussion about whether the goals can be reached or not. The third question will discuss top down and bottom up-theories from a responsibility perspective. Finally, an analysis and discussion will sum up the thesis.

1.2.5 Delimitations
We have chosen to focus on how these three organisations work to prevent child labour in mining in Peru. This area is interesting since it holds a long history and tradition of child labour. This specific type of child labour has been very common in western countries during the 19th century.21 Although the western countries have developed further, many countries around the world are still struggling with the problems of child labour. Our second delimitation concerns the geographical area which holds this problem. We chose the country Peru for many reasons. Firstly the fact that Peru is a large exporter of copper and other minerals in the world,22 secondly Peru is facing an interesting development concerning economical growth. Even though the country is known for having a strong economical development there are other issues regarding human rights and social rights, which needs to be dealt with, such as education and the literacy level.

Finally, we chose three different organisations which are well known within the international community; UNICEF, ILO and Save the Children. UNICEF and ILO are both operating within the UN; on the other hand they are working at different levels and partially with different issues. The different levels and approaches will be discussed later in the second and third question. UNICEF focus on children’s rights and child related matters while ILO manages labour and employee policies and rights. Therefore the two organisations are suitable for our thesis about child labour because the two organisations complement each other.

Our third organisation, Save the Children, is a worldwide organisation that also has a focus on children’s rights. Unlike from the other organisations, Save the Children is an NGO. They work under different circumstances and on different levels, as well as on different economical groundings, which will be explained in more detail further on. This thesis will not examine economical details that are connected to GDP (and GDP per capita). The main focus will concern HDI which will be coherent with the chosen theories and keep a consistency throughout the thesis.

21 Nygren, Barn och rätt, p.122
22 http://www.swedishtrade.se/landrapporter/?objectId=5284, 26 april 2007
1.3 Theory

The problems concerning child labour lies within poverty and development issues. There are many theories within this area, of which we have chosen two of them, “Development as Freedom” by Amartya Sen, and “Theories and Practices of Development” by Katie Willis. The theories are chosen from the perspective of development related to child labour. Both authors have strong negative opinions regarding measuring development in numbers and statistics such as GNP (Gross National Product). Willis has chosen a more distinct theoretical perspective, whilst Sen is more focused on moral philosophy and its practical implementations.

According to Sen, economical development can not only be measured through GNP. Political freedom, democracy and the individual's life and abilities must be taken into consideration as well.23 Sen argues that this perspective is too narrow and does not respect development as a theory. Instead technology and economic growth has become the main factors. Further on, Sen means that freedom is dependent on political and civil rights as well as economic and social welfare (e.g. the right to education and health care). In order to encourage development, one must first erase the obstacles for total freedom; poverty and tyranny must be abolished and poor economic possibilities must be prevented.24 The matter of freedom is essential in Sen's theory and it can also be related to child labour. The author is discussing child labour by saying:

“The worst violations of the norm against child labour occur typically through the actual situation of slavery for children in extremely exposed families and through the fact that they are forced into labour and there they are being exploited. This immediate matter of freedom is a part of the highly debated subject concerning child labour.”25

The author continues the discussion by saying that the problems concern the children’s lack of choice and that this forced labour prevents them to have the opportunity to receive an education.26

According to Katie Willis development is often measured in misleading ways. Features that are regarded as “basic needs” such as shelter, food or employment are not simple to

---

23 Sen, p.217
24 Sen, p.48
25 Sen, p.48
26 Sen, p. 165-166
measure; therefore there can be misleading reports. Development measures are in most cases quantitative (exposed in numbers), and therefore excludes individual needs and beliefs.

“......by focusing on quantitative measurement, the subjective qualitative dimensions of development are excluded. This means excluding the feelings, experiences and opinions of individuals and groups.”

The quantitative approach is also considered to emphasize what “outsiders” think about development, instead of the local inhabitants and their ideas about what it is and how it should be. Willis mentions different theories that discuss two important approaches; top-down and bottom-up approach. These two approaches clarify how development issues can be administered from organisations and governments. We will apply these approaches to the chosen organisations to show how they work and hopefully give an indulgent to why.

1.4 Methodology

This part of the paper is to give an insight of which research methods and theories we have chosen to complete our work with. Discussions regarding the methodological problems we have faced will be presented, which also lead to discussions about validity and reliability.

1.4.1 Qualitative/Quantitative Method and Case Study Research

Based on the interpretative approach in this paper, the method is mainly qualitative. There are many complex ideas like “sovereignty” or “child labour”, which requires a careful analysis and description. Therefore a qualitative method has been applied. In the thesis we will also demonstrate facts and figures connected to the mining industry in Peru, and this is also related to the issue of the economical development of the country. This is an example of the quantitative method we have been using. There are different perspectives when it comes to applying both a qualitative and quantitative method. Scientists have been saying that these two different strategies have different approaches and thus reach various theoretical conclusions. For that reason scientists are advised not to believe that they are

27 Willis, p.13
28 Ibid.
29 Ibid.
30 Willis, p.93
complementary.\textsuperscript{31} This is evidently not accurate in all cases. The results of combining the two methods are in most cases positive and often strengthen and confirm each other.\textsuperscript{32} The third method which actually is within the qualitative method is a case study research method. Preferences for a case study research method are used from the author Robert K. Yin. He defines the principles of a case study by saying:

“A case study is an empirical inquiry that investigates a contemporary phenomenon within real-life context, especially when the boundaries between phenomenon and context are not clearly evident”.\textsuperscript{33}

Referring to this quote, we consider our study to fulfil the significant part of this idea; it is empirical and highly contemporary. Our case study is what Yin calls an “embedded case study design”.\textsuperscript{34} Our case is Peru and further on we have embedded units of analysis which are the organisations (ILO, UNICEF and Save the Children.)

1.4.2 Method problems

One of the first problems we had to face was of linguistic character, due to the fact that, a lot of the information we found was in Spanish. Another problem was the matter of distance and the time perspective, regarding our contact with the organisations. Among other things we are referring to the e-mail contact with the organisations, which not always led to our acquirements. Our meetings with the organisations were arranged at an early stage of this thesis, therefore we were discussing child labour in a broader perspective and not specifically about Peru. This could clearly be considered to have a negative effect regarding the reliability (which will be mentioned below). Nevertheless it should be mentioned that the representatives are people that are working specifically with these matters, and even though they could not contribute with specific facts about Peru they gave us interesting views regarding child labour.

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{31} Bryman, Social Research Methods, s.409
\item \textsuperscript{32} Ibid., s.412-413
\item \textsuperscript{33} Robert K. Yin p.13
\item \textsuperscript{34} Yin, p.43
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
1.4.3 Validity and Reliability

Seeing that the organisations have been contacted and we have been given information from them gives the paper high validity and reliability. There were both general questions and more specific questions for the individual organisations. The downside has been that only the general questions have been answered and in some cases even referred to the web pages, and only in one case has the specific questions been answered (by Save the Children). This may give the paper a lower reliability. On the other hand, most of the questions have been found through other sources. This is considered being a positive aspect regarding the reliability due to the fact that we received proper facts and not only subjective facts and opinions. The organisations have one common goal, and that is the MDGs. Their effort in different countries should thereby be similar and therefore this study could be applied to other countries in comparable situations. As a result the study holds high validity and reliability.

1.5 Selection of data

The selected organisations’ websites have been attentively looked at and searched for information. Also reports have been found through their internet sites on the subject of child labour. Informal meetings were arranged with representatives from ILO and UNICEF in New York. We were unable to set up a meeting with Save the Children, therefore our contact with them was limited to email. These questions are not accounted due to the lack of information that was given to us regarding this subject. The majority of all the data we have used is contemporary. This includes the books, the reports, interviews etc, and according to us, we consider it to be a constructive feature.

1.5.1 Criticism of sources

In our research we have used various methods of gaining information and collecting facts and figures. The two most frequently used forms of sources have been literature (and reports) and the Internet. In order to receive correct information both different organisations own material have been used as well as other more objective sources, the two perspectives are meant to complement each other. This is to increase the scientific value of the thesis. The literature used in this thesis varies between older and more current publications. The
main argument for using literature from different years and decades is that some facts are always relevant and contemporary. A complication with using facts from the Internet is that homepages are constantly being updated. Although we have not been able to observe any dramatic change over time on the main pages we have used.

As a researcher there is always a discussion concerning the authenticity within the sources. Therefore we have carefully analysed all of our material and in some situations we tried to find the same information from additional sources, to make sure it holds scientific standard. A difficulty has been the lack of objective overviews, e.g. regarding the organisations’ work in Peru. This is also a matter of objective evaluation. This meaning that no one is responsible for evaluating different organisations’ work. The only reports we could find were from within the organisation itself. For that reason, it is important to be critical to that kind of information and consider this while reading the thesis.

A matter which is of great importance is the fact that the theory we have applied to this thesis is acknowledged and holds a high scientific standard. Both theorists are analytic and well-known; they both hold similarities and differences from each other. Amartya Sen has very strong opinions concerning development and freedom as a philosophical base of thinking. While Katie Willis describe and analyze development from a more practical perspective.

In both our thesis and this part of criticism of sources, we have analysed all material from a special perspective. Thorsten Thurén has written a book called “Criticism of Sources” (Sv. Källkritik) and he composed the four principles of critics:

1. Genuineness, the source is what it claims to be. 2. Time correlation, the longer time it is between the actual event and the source’s version of description, the stronger reason to doubt that source. 3. Independent, the source must have a special value, and not entirely be an abstract. 4. Freedom of tendency, the source must be beyond all doubt that it is telling its own truth, depending on economic, political or other reasons of not telling the “real truth”. 35

We chose Thurén’s model of working method, as we believed it best for our thesis and most appropriate for the forms of sources we were using.

35 Thurén, Källkritik, p. 13
2. Accountability

In the third question there will be a discussion regarding the approaches that are being applied in the work of child labour and development. However, it is extremely important to make clear the boundaries, regulations and policies that surround governments and organizations in their work. Therefore, in the following pages, there will be a discussion regarding accountability.

The matter of accountability has many faces. There could be an entire thesis on who is accountable towards whom, regarding development issues. In this thesis there are several agencies involved which each and one of them work in different ways. Firstly, there will be some general views regarding accountability and sovereignty. Secondly this matter will be further connected to the situation in Peru.

According to Gareth Evan’s and Mohamed Sahnoun’s report from ICISS, it is a matter of the “responsibility to protect” and not the “right to intervene”. They agree on the fact that responsibility lies within the sovereign states towards their citizens, but they also draw attention to the international community and their recognized responsibility. According to author and lecturer Mark Duffield, governments must be held responsible for violating human rights, but they must also be supported whilst trying to stabilise difficult conditions.

The responsibility is in other words in the hands of both the international community and the sovereign states, if to understand Duffield. Evan and Sahnoun would not necessarily disagree with Duffield. They mean that rather than talking about the “responsibility to protect” and not the “right to intervene”, the explanation becomes clearer.

“...this formulation implies that the primary responsibility rests with the state concerned. Only if that state is unable or unwilling to fulfil its responsibility to protect or itself the perpetrator, should the international community take the responsibility to act in its place.”

Without any doubt the supporters of sovereignty agree that there is nothing like boundless power to what one can do to its own people. Today it is recognized that the meaning of sovereignty involves responsibility in two ways; the respect toward other states sovereignty

---

36 The responsibility to protect, by Evans and Mohamed, 2002
37 Ibid.
38 “NGO relief in war zones: TOWARDS AN ANALYSIS OF THE NEW AID PARADIGM”, by Duffield, 1997
39 The responsibility to protect, by Evans and Mohamed, 2002
(externally) as well as the respect for human rights and the dignity of all people within a state (internally).  

Children’s rights are included within the human rights. They also have the right to freedom, security and should also be protected from inhuman treatment. Children working in mines are unquestionably classified as harmful work. There are several mines that belong to families and are private businesses and parents bring their children who then start working in the mines.  

But is West really taking responsibility in all matters? According to Duffield West is not capable to handle crisis which has led to impoverishment.

“The bottom line of international policy seems clear. The West is unable or unwilling to take comprehensive responsibility for alleviating impoverishment and instability in crisis regions. The only feasible alternative is to encourage political authorities and local institutions within the countries concerned, which has helped push relief and development policy in a self-help direction”.

Accountability has other meanings then just policy making. Duffield is also saying that the new ways West is operating in relief situations, is in actual fact non-political. But when countries import copper, silver and gold from mines where they do not know the conditions regarding children working in them or not, is that justifiable? For example, a small country like Sweden is a large importer of copper from Peru.

This discussion requires other views than just authorities and responsibilities. It is important not to forget the individuals and the actual people it might concern. Jean-Francois Vidal of the Action Contre la Faim could not have said it better:

“The problem with the traditional idea of humanitarianism is that it demands access for [NGO] workers to reach victims who then become the object of ‘our’ compassion. What I support is the victims’ access to their rights -- that is, a construction that makes them subjects, not objects”.

Sovereignty ought to be qualified by the responsibility to protect, but there must be a universal acceptance for the practical obligations it involves. There is a difference between

---
40 Ibid.
41 http://www.unicef.se/nyheter/2005/06/15/utbildning_basta_sattet_att_forhindra_bamarbete/
42 "NGO relief in war zones: TOWARDS AN ANALYSIS OF THE NEW AID PARADIGM", by Duffield, 1997
43 Ibid.
44 http://www.swedishtrade.se/landrapporter/?objectId=5284
45 Humanitarianism in cricis, Rieff, 2002
46 The responsibility to protect, by Evans and Mohamed, 2002
humanitarian action and human rights and it should not be forgotten that human rights is the foundation to everything.  

2.1 Accountability from whom/where?

The dilemma with accountability in a broad perspective is in most cases the principle of sovereignty. Human rights are being violated in everyday and everywhere and the UN cannot intervene all the time. The matter of sovereignty is complex so therefore it will be a short discussion regarding accountability of the local government in Peru. The matter of accountability must be taken into consideration at many levels in the society.

The laws in Peru recognize the rights of children; the dilemma however lies within the administration area. The protection and services that should be provided from the operational institutions are not being fulfilled and are very limited. The capacity and will for action does in fact depend on the national budget as well as the development of the institutional organisations.

"The Peruvian state spends, on each inhabitant, amounts very close to those of Chile and Costa Rica, and more than Mexico, Colombia and Venezuela. However, the results in terms of social indicators are greatly inferior."

Nevertheless, this issue is complex and might have several factors illuminating the differences. Despite of all the complexities, is it important to bear in mind that one of the factors might be a matter of priority of spending. The role and accountability of a government is relevant as regards the subject of priorities. Further (in question 3) it will be discussed more thoroughly of how the government could be more accountable as well the citizens’ role in the process.

---

47 Humanitarianism in Crisis, by Rieff, 2002
49 Ibid. p.13
50 Ibid. p.14
3. Mining industry and economy in Peru

3.1 Background

Peru's economy reflects its varied geography; the country is situated in the northwest corner of Latin America. Peru borders to Brazil, Chile, Bolivia, Colombia and Ecuador and the country's relationship with its neighbours is varied, throughout the history conflicts concerning the maritime boundaries have been on the agenda. Especially with Chile and Ecuador, the boundaries are important for the fishing industry and Peru is one of the largest exports of fishing products in the world. Along with fishing products and agriculture (mainly coffee and cotton), mining is an important factor in Peru's export.

3.2 The mining industry

After the year 1530 Peru became a colony of Spain and since the country was rich of minerals and metals, it developed to be one of Spain’s most important colonies. It was mainly the resource of silver that Spain wanted to take advantage of. During the years 1821-1890, the country's economy was very unstable because of the many different political leaders. The various leaders had different ideas on how to run the economy in Peru. In the early 20th century, the economy was growing through increased investments in both agriculture and the mining industry. Today, Peru is considered a solid economy and international mining firms have begun to reconsider the country as a business partner.

Although voices have been raised regarding all the foreign investors which are settling down in Peru, one example is:

“As the government continues to invite foreign investment, there are some questions as to where the liability lies for past environmental abuses, and what plans will be put in place to insure future behaviour is responsible and not environmentally damaging.” The history of foreign investors in the mining sector started after the Second

---

54 http://www.swedishtrade.se/landrapporter/?objectID=5284
55 Ibid.
56 http://www.britannica.com/ebi/article-206308
57 Ibid.
58 http://archive.idrc.ca/books/reports/1996/34-01e.html
59 http://www.american.edu/TED/perumine.htm
World War, although it stopped in the early 1970's during Peru's nationalization and most of the mining operations turned over into public agencies.\(^{60}\)

With poor administration and planning of the industry, the country had to invite foreign investors once again to rescue the economy in the late 1970's. The economic development in Peru has faced many challenges, but is now heading toward a steadier path.

The Swedish Trade Union reported last year following:

"The Peruvian stock market was the most rapid growing market in the world during the year 2006 (with 137%). This depends mainly on the high price of copper and the fact that Peru's strongest export market is USA.\(^{61}\)"

These numbers indicate the importance of a strong export market and good international relations, with other foreign countries. According to the latest research on an information webpage about mining, 218 companies are active in Peru.\(^{62}\) Examples of the companies are: ChapleauResources LTD., CIA. Minera Algamarca S.A and Equionx Minerals LTD.\(^{63}\) A large number of the country's universities are having programs, especially designed for students who want to work in the mining industry.\(^{64}\) This indicates that the industry is growing and it creates both economic stability and work opportunities.

### 3.3 Children's situation within the mining industry

Peru is an important exporter of copper and gold. And a large percentage of the export is products from mining.

"In 2001, Peru's mining revenues of 3,2 billion dollars represented 45,1 % of 7,1 billion dollars in total export.\(^{65}\)

Peru is the largest producer of gold in Latin America\(^{66}\), therefore this industry have a great influence on both the economy in the country and obviously also on the inhabitants. Child labour is common in both quarrying and mining\(^{67}\), which is a problem for the welfare of the

\(^{60}\) [http://www.britannica.com/ebi/article-206308](http://www.britannica.com/ebi/article-206308)
\(^{61}\) [http://www.swedishtrade.se/landrapporter/?objectId=6773](http://www.swedishtrade.se/landrapporter/?objectId=6773)
\(^{63}\) Ibid.
\(^{64}\) Ibid.
\(^{65}\) [www.infomine.com](http://www.infomine.com)
\(^{66}\) [www.mbendi.co.za/indy/ming/sa/pe/p0005.htm](http://www.mbendi.co.za/indy/ming/sa/pe/p0005.htm)
country. When school is expensive and children are working instead of attending at school, this will, in a long-term perspective, create a population without any experience of education.

A report from 1999 showed that Peru had a population of approximately 25 million inhabitants, and 10 million of them were children. During the same period it was found that 2 million of these children were working in informal settings. Many organisations are working in the country in order to deal with the issue of child labour. In order to work against child labour, it is of great significance to help children to receive an education.

“A report from January this year, show that many children in Peru do not complete primary school, only 70 percent of the children do. Of those who went to secondary school only 50 % graduated.”

Ann Veneman at UNICEF emphasizes the importance of education for children:

“We have to abolish the exploitation of children at the places of work. To get the children into the schools is our best defence against child labour today and for coming generations”.

The work in mining is dangerous from many perspectives, e.g. physical injuries, long working hours, inhaling dust, working in unstable structures, crawling in narrow tunnels and so on. The conditions are carrying many risks and the children are often being injured and they are rarely taken to hospitals to get professional medical care. The children working in the mining industry are often very young and exposed for situations that more suitable for adults.

“On the national level, 20.8% of those between the ages of 6 to 17 years were employed. 11.6% of the children between 6 to 11 years participated in the labour market, whereas of those between the ages of 12 and 17 years, 30.3% were economically active.”

In addition, to be able to work with the matter of child labour, there is much to be learnt from the history. For example, in the Western Europe during the 1900 century and the industrial revolution, child labour was very common. Children were working in the factories, with agriculture and in the mining industries. In Sweden e.g. there are statistics that show

---

68 http://www.ecpat.net/eng/ecpat_inter/projects/monitoring/online_database/index.asp
69 http://www.crin.org/docs/CRC41_Peru.doc
70 http://www.unicef.se/nyheter/2005/06/15/utbildning_basta_sattet_att_forhindra_barnarbete/
72 Ibid.
73 ILO, Yearbook of Labour Statistics, 2001
that children (younger than 15 years old) were working over 90 hours per week.\textsuperscript{74} These conditions were not rare and the employers were well aware of the situations. It was not until the end of 1900 century, that the employers began to abolish child labour and the Swedish schooling reform was implemented in society.\textsuperscript{75} Then the children were forced to attend school, and were unable to work at the same time.

It is therefore understandable that organizations are promoting schooling, at the same time as they are preventing child labour. The Western world has had its difficulties and experience of child labour, now it is time to share that knowledge with the rest of the world.

4. What are the organisations approaches in terms of reducing child labour within Peru’s mining industry?

4.1 UNICEF

UNICEF is working with stabilising children’s rights in Peru, through different programmes. The organisation is also working with helping the government with financing development projects for children.\textsuperscript{76} Some of the projects are closely related to the UN MDG’s, with focus on the second paragraph concerning education. In a report from 2005, the organisation declares that there are children who are active within the mining industry and that these numbers are constantly increasing.\textsuperscript{77} UNICEF reports that this increasing number of children working within the mining industry has always been higher in the rural parts of the country, but new figures show that this difference between rural and urban areas are now levelled out.\textsuperscript{78} In their report, it is described what is being a done and future plan.

"The Government continues to need support to make a better analysis of the immediate and underlying causes of the violation of children’s rights and to maintain current efficiency and effectiveness, the use of the human rights approach and results-based management should be continued in the 2006 -2010 country programme."\textsuperscript{79}

This suggested support can be given by different organizations. UNICEF also emphasizes the importance of further cooperation with the government of Peru and other UN agencies, in

\textsuperscript{74} Hollander, Barn och rätt, p. 123
\textsuperscript{75} Hollander, Barn och rätt, p. 124-125
\textsuperscript{76} http://www.unicef.org/evaldatabase/files/english_peru_cpe_final_2004.pdf
\textsuperscript{77} http://www.unicef.org/about/execboard/files/05-PL6_Pe.pdf
\textsuperscript{78} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{79} Ibid.
order to strengthen children’s rights and to give children a voice of their own. Another suggestion given in the report is to:

“...ensure that regional governments develop the capacity to promote child rights; (c) mobilize sources of child-oriented development financing, deriving from the Peruvian treasury, IFIs, the private sector (mainly mining, tourism and international commerce) and international cooperation...”

Much needs to be done, although UNICEF is hopeful and encourages local actors, partners within the private sector and international partners to contribute with financial aid, which will enhance children’s rights and make sure that these rights are protected. The current working partners for UNICEF in Peru, regarding child labour, are: WHO/PAHO, UNFPA, UNAIDS, ILO, the World Food Programme and the United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organisation. Although UNICEF does not have campaigns against child labour in mining at present, many projects are being implemented to help the children in Peru and to improve their childhood. Some projects have been so successful that they are now being implemented in the neighbouring countries as well.

“Staff members from the Office of UNICEF in Peru, working with partners, built up temporary schools, provided clothing for infants and football balls for children, etc., actions that were relevant and highly appreciated. As a result of this experience, the Office took all adequate steps to strengthen its structure for emergency responses, which has been since a model within UNICEF for other programmes in the region.”

The organisation has been working on both governmental level and with other organisations. Their work has received high international recognition. UNICEF has discovered following, which makes it possible to further work with these issues.

“...to the Government’s commitment towards democratization and decentralization of institutions and processes in terms both of openness and creating spaces for all Peruvians, particularly women, children and adolescents living in isolated areas and marginal urban areas.”

UNICEF speaks of respectful cooperation with the Peruvian government and sees many successful projects. Nevertheless the development must continue and children’s rights must be preserved and respected. It can be concluded that some improvements have been done, but much still needs to be improved.

---

80 Ibid.
81 Ibid.
83 Ibid.
4.2 ILO

ILO has been working with both labour standards and child labour in Peru. The country ratified in 1990 the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC).\textsuperscript{84} One of the comments from investigators in the report from 2006\textsuperscript{85} reads as follows:

“There were concerns about the authority and effectiveness of inspectors, especially outside the cities where there were few inspectors. Concerns were also voiced about child domestic workers and children of 5 to 17 working in dangerous circumstances. The delegation explained that in rural areas parents sent their children to work for families in cities to give them a better life.”

The report shows that Peru has not at all completed their obligations to the CRC. The government must work even harder for children's rights in the rural areas and more resources are needed.

ILO has constantly reported that the numbers of working children in urban areas are increasing.\textsuperscript{86} Many of these children are involved in hazardous work, which can lead to serious physical injuries. Positive progress in Peru was made through the establishing of the National Committee for the Eradication of Child Labour, in 1997.\textsuperscript{87} It was founded by the Ministry of Promotion of Women and Human Development.

ILO has a unique idea of handling the matter of child labour:

“Seeing child labour as a product of market forces – supply and demand - has been a fruitful approach, taking in the behaviour of employers as well as of individual households.”\textsuperscript{88}

In small-scale mining, which is made up of mainly informal settings and employments, child labour is common.\textsuperscript{89} Of course, not all small-scale mining contains child labour, although statistics from ILO show that it is more common amongst these forms of mining, rather than the industries run by large international companies.

\textsuperscript{84} http://www.crin.org/docs/CRC41_Peru.doc
\textsuperscript{85} State Party Examination of Peru's Third Periodic Report, 2006 by ILO
\textsuperscript{86} http://www.i-lo.org/public/english/standards/ipec/about/factsheet/facts08.htm#02
\textsuperscript{87} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{88} ILO report, “The End of child labour: within reach”, 2006
\textsuperscript{89} http://www.i-lo.org/public/english/dialogue/sector/sectors/mining/concern.htm
“The absence of employers' and workers' organizations in small-scale mining puts a special responsibility on the State.”

It is partially the lack of responsibility and overview that concerns ILO. If nobody can be held responsible, then ILO has no one to discuss the issue with. Furthermore, if there is no one to discuss the matter with, no future improvements can be made. ILO is just as UNICEF aiming for the UN MDG’s. In order to aim for the paragraph regarding education, in the MDG’s and ILO must have someone to have a dialogue with. Which, they do not always seem to have, especially concerning small-scale mining. Even though, the organisation has very high ambitions, regarding child labour and how to reduce it:

“The aim is to withdraw children from hazardous work and rehabilitate them through education, skills training and other support services. Activities are being carried out to sensitize and mobilize the mining communities to take action against child labour. Parents of working children are also being trained and capacitated to seek and engage alternative income generating activities. Advisory services are being provided to the mining communities and operators on the appropriate technology and processes that will facilitate transition to child labour-free mining services.”

ILO is working with the three-partial method, which means that they engage in dialogue with workers, employers and the government. The organisation always first consults with the country’s government, before they begin their projects or programmes in a specific area. They are using the top-down theory as an initial form of work. This design of work is unique for ILO and it is considered to be a successful method. The theory behind top-down origins from the 1950’s and 1960’s:

“...because policy-makers believed that this development path had worked in the North so could work elsewhere”.

Perhaps the theory and construction behind this approach, is not that simple. Instead it must be adjusted to be suitable for the specific country. ILO have not yet founded a dialogue with Peru’s government concerning the child labour in mining and be given clear results, but much have been done in the work of reducing hazardous work that involves children.

---

90 Ibid.
91 http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/ipec/about/factsheet/facts08.htm
92 Willis, p. 46
4.3 Save the Children

Save the children is a worldwide organisation which makes it difficult to chart all the work that is being done within this area. The national organisation Save the Children Alliance, consist of approximately 28 member organisations. Each of these member states work in different regions and with different programs.

In the matter of child labour within mining in Peru most, countries are aware of the problem and have mentioned it in their reports. On the other hand, there are at the moment no current projects that Save the Children is in charge of. This is also confirmed by Gina Solari who is working with Save the Children Sweden in Peru, and has been provided some information regarding this issue. There are programs relating to child labour in mining in parts of Africa but unfortunately not in Peru at the moment. What has been discovered is that, at this moment in time, the focus on the matter of child labour in Peru and the rest of South America is on sexual exploitation. Nevertheless, Gina Solari has provided good answers regarding the situation in Peru. Although they are not working with a campaign on their own, they are and have been supporting other projects, specially one particular project (EduFuturo) initiated by the organisation World Learning. Save the children had an important impact on that project, which was essential for preventing child labour in mining, in Peru.

"World Learning for International Development (WLID) has extensive experience working with stakeholders at the local level. The EduFuturo project began as an effort by World Learning to leverage this experience in order to lower the incidence of child labour in the Puno Region of Peru. With funding from the U.S. Department of Labour, WLID educated parents, community members, schoolteachers and administrators about the dangers of child labour and attempted to build support for innovative education initiatives."

Save the Children Canada is one of the organisations who lately have focused on Peru. Although they mention child labour programs, they are quite indistinct regarding their expressions on what they mean by child labour. The term “domestic work” is used which

---

93 http://www.savethechildren.net/alliance/contactus.html#member
94 http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/scuk/jsp/resources/details.jsp?id=2218&group=resources&section=project&subsection=details
95 http://www.savethechildren.net/alliance/where_we_work/MS/mapPE.html#a76e3
96 Including Children as Key Stakeholders in Child Labor Prevention: The EduFuturo Experience A World Learning Monograph, Ernesto Garcia, Naoko Kamioka and Mason Ingram, 2006
97 Including Children as Key Stakeholders in Child Labor Prevention: The EduFuturo Experience A World Learning Monograph, Ernesto Garcia, Naoko Kamioka and Mason Ingram, 2006, p.3
98 http://www.savethechildren.ca/wherewework/southamerica/peruprojects.html

29
can include several areas, such as mining, since many families work together in the mines.\(^{99}\) Therefore there is no clear information if their work includes reducing child labour in mining or not.

4.3.1 Save the Children – A NGO

It is important to remember that NGO’s work under different prerequisites due to the fact that they are free-standing organisations. Nonetheless, this does not mean that they do not cooperate with other organisations. Gina Solari was asked if they cooperate with other organisations in Peru. She answered:

- Yes, *Save the Children Sweden works mainly in partnership with local NGOs because the aim is to strengthen the civil society where we work and in order they can advocate for the children rights before the national authorities who are accountable regarding this. In some cases, when is necessary we collaborate also with some public institutions, for example: Congress, Ministries, Police, Municipalities, Universities, etc.*

Also at the main webpage (Save the Children Alliance) it says:

"We work with children and their families at a community level, finding solutions together. We support and strengthen schools, community health-care systems and other infrastructures in the long term by giving local people appropriate skills and resources such as specialist training and good quality buildings."\(^{100}\)

By other means, Save the Children work according to a grassroots approach, or in other words, a bottom-up approach.\(^{101}\) That is to say that they focus on the children at a level where help is aimed directly at them and is implemented quickly.\(^{102}\) Within the bottom-up theory lays the concept of “basic needs”. The concept became known at ILO’s World Employment Conference in 1976, and consisted of a policy which was meant to aim directly to the poorest people.\(^{103}\) The basic needs included “essentials for physical survival” (e.g. shelter, clothing and food) as well as “access to essential services” (e.g. clean water, education and healthcare).\(^{104}\) This has also been associated with the increasing of NGOs.\(^{105}\)

---

99 Gina Solari, *Save the Children Sweden in Peru*
100 http://savethechildren.net/alliance/about_us/approach/index.html
101 Willis, p.93
102 Ibid, p.99
103 Ibid, p.93
104 Willis, p.94
105 Ibid, p.97
Different NGOs have different approaches and even though Save the Children has made it clear that they mainly work at a community level, they still cooperate with governments in some cases.

“We cannot achieve change alone. We work with governments and with local, national and international organisations to improve children’s lives directly or to influence the policies and practices of others.”

Due to this information, Gina Solari was asked if the government of Peru was aware of the problem with child labour within mining and, if yes, did they cooperate to reduce the child labour? She responded that, they do not cooperate in this specific matter and she also said:

“- In these last years it has had a grow in the demand of minerals and the prices have been increased; for that reason a greater number of children are being recruited to work in the mines mainly by informal and artisan exploitation of mines. Unfortunately, government authorities are not doing anything about this. They only have signed international agreements with ILO but they don't follow up them or implement the laws against people who are exploiting mines working children. Sometimes the actions that government takes are to persecute children and the consequences are they have to hide and work in worst conditions”

There is an obvious disappointment against the government of Peru, and in this particular situation the organisation has not found a way to cooperate. A grassroots approach does not mean that NGOs do not cooperate with governments, it only indicates that most organisations are firstly interested in what the people’s opinions are and what kind of help they need. This information is important to forward to the governments which might result in some kind of cooperation.

Although it has come to our knowledge that Save the Children subsist in Peru to achieve a better life for children, it has not been clear that they specifically are focusing on mining. The reasons for children working in mines are many which also means that it can be tackled in various ways. Save the children works worldwide and they also have a world wide aim, and that is education. To educate children and their families is fundamental within the bottom-up approach.

One thing that has been clear regarding the work of Save the Children is that they together with other countries, organisations and the UN work towards the MDGs. Given that they

106 http://savethechildren.net/alliance/about_us/approach/index.html
107 Willis, p.94
focus a great deal on education, the second paragraph in the MDGs becomes more interesting compared to the other goals. This will be examined in the following chapter.

5. What are the opportunities and difficulties of reducing child labour through the second paragraph in the MDGs, which entails education for all children by the year 2015?

5.1. What are the opportunities with the second paragraph in the MDGs?

In order to answer this question, one must first declare the relation between the four terms: development, freedom, education and the MDGs. These terms are often used in various ways and in this thesis it will be explained how they are linked to each other and the main discussion about child labour.

Development

The United Nations have a certain department which works intensively with development issues; the department is called The Economic and Social Council (ECOSOC).

“Education is typically seen as a means of narrowing inequalities, and among those who receive it, that purpose are served; however, education also represents a medium through which the worst forms of social stratification and segmentation are created. Inequalities in educational attainment often translate into differentials in employment, occupation, income, residence and social class.”

As the quote indicates education is linked to both development and freedom. Development can not be achieved, if the foundation which a country is depending on is unstable and filled with inequality.

“The world today is far from equal, however, as evidenced by growing gaps between the rich and the poor. These gaps exist not only in income and assets, but also in the quality and accessibility of education, health care and employment opportunities, in the protection of human rights, and in access to political power and representation.”

108 http://www.savethechildren.net/alliance/resources/mdg/
109 UN - Report on the World Social Situation, 2005, p. 79
110 Ibid. P. 21
The discussion concerning development is strongly related to the matter of freedom, Amartya Sen has explained that the theory of development consists of several different issues, which all can be seen as obstacles in the way of freedom.

**Freedom**

As we explained in the chapter regarding methodology, Sen have expressed his opinion regarding child labour and freedom in following words:

“Especially the freedom to go to school is being decreased not only by the weakness in their school systems, but also by the fact that the children (and their parents) do not have a choice.”

The quotation indicates how forced labour and family situations are being effected by child labour and the fact that their children are unable to attend school. The free choice is not an alternative for these families. It is most often a matter of income, when the family is suffering from poverty, it helps if the children are working and contributing to the family’s economy.

“In environments of extreme poverty, every family member must contribute something, and so children are expected to do their share.”

In order to reduce child labour, organisations must support the poor families with other sources of income.

“Poor families pull their children out of school to provide labour in the face of an income shortfall. Parents put children to work as part of a survival strategy to minimize the risk of an interruption of the income stream (which may be caused by failed harvests or loss of employment of an adult household member). Interruption in the income stream is naturally more severe for poor households, as it can be life threatening.”

As the quote intend, families need guarantees and help in order to change their situations.

111 Sen, p. 165-166
112 http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/ipec/about/factsheet/facts08.htm#02
113 Human Geography, p. 489
114 “Millennium Development Goals and Child Labour”. Bjørne Grimsrud October, 2003, p.11
Education

According to Sen, development is related to people’s right to total freedom over their own lives. If a family does not have a free choice of whether their children should go to school or not, development could never be achieved.

“Poor education limits occupational choice and, ultimately, results in lower income.”

Furthermore, from the perspective of the three organisations, they all relate the matter of development and reducing child labour to the right to education. They all argue that if child labour is to be reduced, they must have the freedom to go to school. UNICEF and ILO have both been involved in educational programmes, for instance:

“The Basic Education Programme transfers to the new Basic Education Project all projects strictly educational, while assigning all elements related to health and early development and social communication to the new projects focused specifically on those areas. This transformation seems to be oriented to basic education as it is understood since Jom Tien; that is to say, as permanent education to all people — children, young people and adults, “Education for All” — oriented to the achievement of basic life skills. However, the new project activities are limited to primary school and do not address other basic education areas.”

That is an example of UNICEF’s activities, while the following is an example of ILO’s work in Peru:

“An educational programme has been developed with the NGO “Fe y Alegria”, which is known for its alternative teaching methods based on the public education system for the lower socio-economic sectors, especially oriented to children with a very high risk of leaving school. This programme utilizes educational materials formulated by Fe y Alegria and is directed towards 57,000 children, 2,700 educators and 42 schools nationwide.”

The most obvious difference between the two organisations, implementation of their work, is the fact that ILO is working more closely with the Peruvian government, which is apparent in the large scale of their projects and that it is used in state-financed schools. The school programme, which ILO initiated, has been proved to be successful in the aim to reduce child labour and they encourage NGO’s to further continue their combat against this matter.

115 Human Geography, p. 484
117 http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/ipec/about/factsheet/facts08.htm#02
118 Ibid.
Further, according to the World Bank, Peru is not spending as much money needed on education.\textsuperscript{119}

The World Bank has conducted a study concerning education in Peru and how to achieve good relations between the three main actors in a country:

“(a) the \textit{State} (including regional or sub national levels), which includes politicians and policymakers in both the legislative and executive branches... (b) the \textit{service providers} (including organizations such as the ministerial bureaucracy, regional bureaucracies... (c) the \textit{citizens or clients of the system}.\textsuperscript{120}

This model creates a distinct scheme of participants and their role of responsibility. So it is clear to the viewer, who is responsible and for what.

\textbf{MDGs and opportunities}

The previous discussion brings the subject of child labour back to the UN. The Millennium Development Goals (MDGs) was composed at summit with the world’s leaders.

“In September 2000, at the UN Millennium Summit, world leaders agreed to a set of time bound and measurable goals and targets for combating poverty, hunger, disease, illiteracy, environmental degradation and discrimination against women. Placed at the heart of the global agenda, they are now called the Millennium Development Goals. The Summit's Millennium Declaration also outlined a wide range of commitments in human rights, good governance and democracy\textsuperscript{121}.

The UN describes the importance of the MDGs as following:

“The agreement of the MDGs has been justly hailed as an important milestone. Not only the UN but all its associated organizations including the world Bank, member states, and a broad swath of civil society actors have railed around them. The MDGs are probably the most important UN goals ever promulgated.\textsuperscript{122}

What the quote emphasis, is the international importance and influence which the goals are aimed to have.

\textsuperscript{119} A New Social Contract for Peru: An Agenda for Improving Education, Health Care, and the Social Safety Net (World Bank)
\textsuperscript{120} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{121} www.un.org/MDGs-FACTSHEET1.pdf
It is the second goal, which is the most important for this thesis. The goal aims to “Achieve universal primary education”\textsuperscript{123}; this is an initiative which encourages countries around the world to really work with this matter. As mentioned earlier in the thesis, education is strongly linked with child labour. The MDGs create an opportunity for countries and set a goal to reach. If children are given an education, they can not work fulltime. This is where the matter of MDGs is linked to child labour. The terms development, freedom, education and MDGs are all linked together and in this meaning of our thesis, hard to separate. It is meaningful to understand the importance of these terms. Following part will problematise the MDGs and the possibility to reach them.

5.2 MDGs, can it be reached?

“At the UN Millennium Summit in September 2000 the 189 states of the United Nations reaffirmed their commitment to work towards a world in which eliminating poverty and sustaining development would have the highest priority. The Millennium Declaration was signed by 147 heads of state and passed unanimously by the members of the UN General Assembly.”\textsuperscript{124}

In addition it was also accepted by many NGOs who decide to achieve the parts which interested them. Save the children is an example and they are focusing on the second paragraph; all children going to school.\textsuperscript{125} Organisations do not only work to achieve the goals, the also try to influence politicians through their own experiences. Save the Children:

“Using a child focused approach, Save the Children analyses the European Union’s efforts to realise the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs)”\textsuperscript{126}

There have been several reports written by e.g. Save the Children where they have made recommendations on how to achieve the MDGs at different levels, in this case, a European Union level.\textsuperscript{127}

The second paragraph was limited to the year 2015 which is becoming quite distressing. Save the Children UK distributed quite recently a report regarding their concern on reaching the goals.\textsuperscript{128} UNESCO has also shown their concern in their report regarding Education for All

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{123} http://www.un.org/millenniumgoals/
\item \textsuperscript{124} Report from Save the Children, “MDGs off track: 17.5 million children have died waiting for change”, 2/5-07
\item \textsuperscript{125} http://www.savethechildren.net/alliance/resources/mdg/
\item \textsuperscript{126} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{127} Ibid.
\item \textsuperscript{128} Report from Save the Children, “MDGs off track: 17.5 million children have died waiting for change”, 2/5-07
\end{itemize}
(EFA) from the year 2002. Gina Solari was also asked if Save the Children thought that the goal was realistic. Her answer was that it is not realistic, and that is why many countries are changing their goals.

One of the fundamental ways to take the EFA back in progress is money and has always been. 20 donor countries out of 22 have failed to give their fair share of funds to be able to reach EFA by 2015.

“France, Switzerland, Spain, Japan, US, Austria, Italy and Germany are the worst donors for committing their fair share of aid for education and for supporting education in countries affected by conflict.”

In 2005 there were US$ 3 billion donated for education, but compared to the estimated US$ 9 billion it was considered a big failure. Unfortunately the numbers keep increasing and since the MDGs began, 80 million children have died. According to UNESCO one third of the world’s population are living in countries where “achieving the EFA goals remain a dream rather than a realistic proposition, unless a strong and concerted effort is made”. UNESCO has estimated that 22 countries in Latin America have already achieved or have high chances to achieve the second goal in the MDGs. Simultaneously; Peru was ranked last among 41 countries concerning literacy, the education quality was considered as being very poor. There are many implausible thoughts and opinions regarding the accomplishment of the MDGs and specifically the second goal. According to Michael Clemens and Todd Moss at the Centre for Global Development, the goal is measured as a real target, but it has started to be considered more like a tool than a practical target. The goals in general have served its purpose to some extent:

“Goals generate discussion, focus attention, and help assign accountability. The MDGs have doubtlessly served these purposes to some degree.”

UNESCO, Save the Children and other scientists like Clemens all agree on the amount of aid that must be attained to be able to reach the goal. Education is the key to development, and

---

129 UNESCO- “Education for all, is the world on track?”, Global Monitoring Report, 2002
130 Gina Solari from Save the Children Sweden, Peru
131 Report from Save the Children, “MDGs off track: 17.5 million children have died waiting for change”, 2/5-07
132 Ibid.
133 Ibid.
134 UNESCO- “Education for all, is the world on track?”, Global Monitoring Report, 2002
135 Ibid.
136 http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/ipec/about/factsheet/facts08.htm#02 and Gina Solari
137 “What’s Wrong with the Millennium Development Goals?” by: Michael Clemens and Todd Moss (http://www.cgdev.org/content/publications/detail/3940/)
138 Ibid.
development gives us a better understanding which hopefully reduces such elements as child labour. If aid is the answer to the problem and Western countries do not donate the money that is needed, then in what direction is the development going?

Whilst many scientists, writers and politicians argue that funds must be raised to able to reach the EFA goal, many NGOs point out the importance of involving the civil society. They need to be concerned regarding the implementation of the education policy.

6. There are different approaches for undertake developmental issues, such as top-down and bottom-up approaches. Which of them are most efficient regarding the MDGs and the education as an instrument to reduce child labour in Peru?

The two approaches have been discussed, and there are different perspectives to why each and one of them ought to be applied regarding the work for child labour. The thesis has exposed the two main different approaches which are being implemented through different programs and by different organizations. This third part aims to analyze different views on top-down and bottom-up approach as well as connect them to Peru and the problems of education in the country.

The MDGs are applying a top-down approach and the decisions are being made at the UN-level which many are starting to criticize, though not necessarily the targets that have been set, but the approach that is being applied to reach these targets. It is being said that dramatic changes needs to be made regarding the top-down approach to reach the MDG and its substantive policy.

"The MDGs are set within the wider framework of values and principles encapsulated in UN conventions on economic, social and cultural rights. This is fundamentally important given the current approach that risks making no distinction between best practice and bad practice."139

It is being said that the MDGs should distance itself from:

"Top-down donor policy, conditionality and unfulfilled donor pledges, as well as on the principle of subsidiary which asserts that policies must be designed and owned at the level at which they are implemented."140

139 MDGs require a genuine partnership for their achievement, Statement by International Cooperation for Development and Solidarity (CIDSE) in Consultative Status with the UN Economic and Social Council, 2005
140 Ibid
The view regarding aid is also supported by others. According to Dr. Pauline Rose, it is very important that donors try to break out of their conventional way of working, when it comes to achieving the education for all goal. To be able to reach the targets, countries need more than allocation of resources, they also need assistances.141

Governments make agreements on reaching the MDGs when local problems might be as important. Reasonably the targets are set to help and create better conditions; however global targets do not suit every country and government. They all have different needs and prerequisites. It has been said that, in order to have a positive effect of the MDGs it is required a:

“...radical change in the current top-down approach to development that ignores local knowledge, participation and solutions in the name of a global agenda and global targets. The MDGs must not become a new conditionality that binds governments to international goals and targets, regardless of their own national priorities. The MDGs must be set squarely within the context of macroeconomic policy-making and the power imbalances underpinning such policy formulation.” 142

The government’s accountability should primarily be intended to their people; therefore the international policy making ought to take into account the realities of local politics. According to political economist Patrick Bond, the targets that are supposed to be reached by 2015 are less important than the actual social struggles, and the obsession with the MDGs is a diversion of solidarity. 143 In other words, governments should be accountable to their people regarding social policy and the UN should take in to consideration the local policymaking.

It is believed that the MDGs need a partnership. The top-down approach should be revised and a bottom-up approach should be taken into consideration in a more efficient way.144 Local knowledge and participation is mentioned as important matters, therefore the approach is known as being enhanced.145 People need to be given better awareness regarding child labour and the bottom-up approach is known to help people at their level, for an example in their own villages or schools. Amartya Sen’s theory about freedom can be

141 Is there a ‘fast-track’ to achieving education for all? Pauline Rose, Centre for International Education, Sussex School of Education, University of Sussex, Brighton BN1 9QQ, UK
142 MDGs require a genuine partnership for their achievement, Statement by International Cooperation for Development and Solidarity (CIDSE) in Consultative Status with the UN Economic and Social Council, 2005
143 http://www.opendemocracy.net/node/2104/print
144 Ibid.
145 MDGs require a genuine partnership for their achievement, Statement by International Cooperation for Development and Solidarity (CIDSE) in Consultative Status with the UN Economic and Social Council, 2005
mentioned as further discussion regarding the own will of an individual. Sen claims that personal freedom is highly important, when development is being debated.

Willis mentions two approaches regarding grassroots development; one is empowerment and the other participatory approach. Grassroots development includes the help from NGOs, but NGOs cannot empower communities. The empowerment must come from within the people and NGOs can provide the framework and its process for making the empowerment possible. Nevertheless, empowerment concerns peoples will to learn. 146 One of the methods through which empowerment is intended to be realized is ‘participation’.

“Participation is usually used as an umbrella term to refer to the involvement of local people in development activities, often NGO based.” 147

NGOs are using different methods regarding participation to be able to gain more understanding about local inhabitants. One of the participatory methods is to involve local people in the actual setting of agenda regarding development. An example perhaps, is that Save the Children is having courses for parents in Peru so they get a better indulgent as regards child labour. Further, the organisation also has programs for improving schooling and the quality of primary education. 148 The agenda ought to be set by the communities more willingly than outside agencies. 149 Another example is UNICEF; they have tried to educate mothers in Peru about nutrition, health care and the importance of educating their children. 150 UNICEF clearly expresses two main components which carry importance and aims for their work in Peru:

” - Local initiatives for social inclusion that contribute to the participatory development of strategic interventions with an emphasis on equal access to quality and culturally relevant social services, and
- The exercise of citizenship and adolescent participation. This includes promoting and monitoring rights and operates nationally aiming to strengthen access to information and knowledge, and commitment to and participation in establishing inclusive public policies to realize children’s and women’s rights.” 151

NGOs has been placed at the forefront of such actions, participation has been promoted as a concept for giving the local people more influence and power.

146 Willis, p.103
147 Ibid. p. 103
149 Ibid. p.104
150 http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/peru_13196.html
151 http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/peru_1645.html
“We must end exploitation of children in the workplace,” Ann Veneman at UNICEF said. “Getting more children into school is our best defence against child labour today and for the next generation.”

As the quote expresses, the focus no matter what approach - must be set on securing and protecting the children’s rights.

### 6.1 PERU and education

As it has been confirmed above, the MDGs have been criticized as encompassing too much of a top-down policy and the bottom-up approach is to be preferred. Regarding Peru, there are several notions concerning education enhancement as well as poverty reduction.

The literacy amongst youths in Peru is relatively high. According to UNESCO Institute of Statistics 97.1 percent youths (15-24 years old) in Peru are literate. Then again, there are issues regarding quality and equity of the education in Peru as well as the role of the government. The government’s budget for education has for the past 30 years remained quite constant, furthermore the costs per student has decreased which consequently have deteriorated the quality of the education. Comparing to other Latin American countries Peru lags behind with 18 percent (of public spending per student) comparing to 31 percent in e.g. Chile and Brazil. Furthermore, Peru also has a low ranking concerning the standard of education in contrast to other countries (in Latin America) with similar levels of GDP.

The accountability of the government regarding education has been widely discussed, especially concerning the differences between rural and urban areas. The government spending is known to be higher in urban areas which affect children’s education in rural areas.

“Children who live in rural areas spend just 250 hours in the classroom annually, even though the required minimum is 1,050. They complete only 4.4 years of education in the same time that students in urban areas complete an average of 8.7 years, since they spend 500 to 600 hours in the classroom.”

---

152 http://www.unicef.org/media/media_27328.html
155 Ibid., p.7
156 Ibid., p.7
This is rather worrying since a large amount of child labour occurs in rural areas. The figure below will illustrate the disparity between children working in rural and urban areas.

**FIGURE 1: CHILD WORK BY QUINTILES OF EXPENDITURE**

![Bar chart showing child work by quintiles of expenditure](image)

*Source: Figure 4. Young Lives Preliminary Country Report: Peru, September 2003*

However, it has been stated that the quality of education is low as well as the economical spending are not equal, (it must be pointed out that this perspective might clearly vary depending whom is asked). The priorities of the government have been questioned since there is a large gap between the poor and the non-poor, which has also made an impact on the educational level. In the Andes region, the central and regional government is known to be more or less absent along with providing barely minimal education.\(^{157}\) Due to the lack of the government’s ability, the support of NGOs have been recognized and required further. The Young Lives Preliminary Country Report has been made with approximately 13 partners such as: Institute Of Development Studies at the University of Sussex in the UK and Centre for Economic and Social Studies (CESS) in India. Regarding schooling in Peru they have uttered:

“The literacy and numeracy tests given to the eight-year-olds in Peru indicate that quality of schooling is a big problem, affecting rural and poorer children in particular. [Sic] Programmes to improve the quality of education, paying particular attention to rural and poorer areas of the country, should be given priority.”\(^{158}\)

\(^{157}\) Including Children as Key Stakeholders in Child Labor Prevention: The EduFuturo Experience A World Learning Monograph, By Ernesto Garcia, Naoko Kamioka and Mason Ingram, September 2006

\(^{158}\) *Young Lives Preliminary Country Report: Peru, Javier Escobal et al., September 2003, p.48*
There are several associates which have expressed the importance regarding development in Peru. Amongst them The United States Agency for International Development has set importance to grassroots projects which functions on a local level collectively with the governments and local NGOs.\textsuperscript{159} The empowerment of the civil society has become further known as a powerful tool for strengthening the civil society. Local participation is viewed as a reliable way of increasing the quality of education in many ways such as the parents’ acknowledgement regarding their children’s education, as well as the teachers’ performance.

“Civil society is playing a relatively active role in development in Peru. Peru has followed the international trend of NGOs becoming more active in development, and government and donors are now seeking stronger ties with NGOs.”\textsuperscript{160}

The number of NGOs in Peru is in fact increasing; however the importance of empowerment and the lack of accountability must be recognized.\textsuperscript{161} Therefore, it will firstly be emphasized why empowerment regarding children’s education is important for increasing the quality of education, and secondly, how this is strongly related to the issue of accountability.

One explanation to the poor quality of learning in Peru might be that the government at some point in the need of wanting to expand the school coverage neglected the policy standards for education.\textsuperscript{162} Examples of how that has been done are the decrease of hours in school per day in order to have more “shifts” in school. Furthermore, the training standards of teachers have been lowered in order to have more teachers available.\textsuperscript{163} The main dilemma is that there are no specific goals for setting the high standards; in addition, as long as parents are not aware of the lack of accountability they are content with their children’s education. As long as parents are pleased with their children’s education and the quality then empowerment cannot be relied on. Hence, NGOs must help parents to be informed regarding the violation of their rights and what they are entitled to.\textsuperscript{164} The “voice” mechanism is important as regards the accountability of the government. Consequently, standards are needed to be able to “measure” accountability. Accountability can be forced by

\textsuperscript{159} Poverty Profile Executive Summary Republic of Peru, February 2001, Japan Bank for International Cooperation, p.6
\textsuperscript{160} Ibid. 7
\textsuperscript{161} Ibid., 7
\textsuperscript{163} Ibid. p.4
\textsuperscript{164} Ibid. P.92
the people who must empower themselves (in this case with help of NGOs). If people know their rights they will be able to claim them as well.\textsuperscript{165}

“Parent bodies need training in how to hold schools accountable for performance to standard and for budgetary and financial issues. This should include the development of reporting formats, and the training of parent bodies in how to use the formats to put pressure on schools. On the other hand, a clear distinction between a governance or accountability role, which is positive, and a daily management role for parents, which is likely to be negative, needs to be drawn, and both parents and principals need to be educated about this.”\textsuperscript{166}

The connection between power and accountability has been presented in a figure which is called: The Accountability Triangle.

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=\textwidth]{accountability_triangle.png}
\caption{Key Relationships of Power: The Accountability Triangle}
\end{figure}

\textbf{Source:} Figure 1.10. Cotlear


\textsuperscript{166} Ibid. p.104
The figure illustrates that people as students in school are also clients of services. There is a relationship with the frontline providers which in this case are the schoolteachers. However there are no direct accountability between the providers and the users. People can through “voices” influence policy makers, and that is a long route to accountability, still this is not enough. A short route of accountability need to be established from the providers towards the users, and the policymakers must be the ones who can assure that.¹⁶⁷

“Even if people can reach the policymaker, services will not improve unless the policymaker can ensure that the service provider will deliver services to them. This relationship between the policymaker and the provider embodies the creation of laws and regulations and the provision of resources.” ¹⁶⁸

Hence, what are the connections with the MDGs and the different approaches? This part of the thesis has tried to emphasize firstly, how different organizations as well as theorists believe that a bottom-up approach is the most efficient way to development. Furthermore, it has been recognized that there are numerous of criticism towards the MDGs and in this case the second goal EFA. Secondly, it has been illustrated what types of problems the education system in Peru stands before. Even though Peru is trying to enroll as much children as possible in school, they are still lacking behind in since they cannot assure good quality of education. Thus it has been emphasized that better quality in education which will lead to better development can ensue together with empowerment and participation which will also lead to a demand for accountability. NGOs will play a crucial role in this segment.

7 Analysis

The reason for this thesis has been to look into the matter of child labour and how three organisations approach this phenomenon. During the research we found that these organisations, are working from various perspectives and that they have different approaches to reducing child labour. There is one thing that all the three organisations have in common; they are all having human rights as a foundation for their work. We also wanted to use child labour in the mining industry in Peru as a case study. This was to make the matter of child labour clear and realistic to the reader. In order to really explain the complexity of this issue and the actors involved, we chose to display this through the example of Peru.

¹⁶⁷ Cotlear, p.23
¹⁶⁸ Ibid. P.24
Our aim was to analyze and find out how the selected organizations (UNICEF, ILO and Save the Children) work and implement their goals. Their methods are related to what approach they choose to work from. A summary of the results will follow.

UNICEF is the organization which is a kind of exception when it comes to the structure of the organization. They are a part of the UN system and are therefore working on the basis of UN's decisions as a typical top-down approach. On the other hand UNICEF is also trying to encourage local communities and strengthen grassroots-development. This makes the organization special since it is combining top-down and bottom-up approach. Since they have the MDGs on their agenda, we have found that a top-down approach has been the most common regarding their work in Peru.

ILO is a ‘tripartite’ UN agency, which means that they are having dialogues with governments, employers and workers. They also work on the basis of the MDGs; therefore their approach becomes a top-down approach. Since ILO is depending on a dialogue partner and always discuses with a countries government first, they can not always implement their work. This can be seen from two perspectives, either that the government is not taking full responsibility or those ILOs working method is too specific and is not open for alternatives. As mentioned before on the section concerning the work of Save the Children, this was commented by Gina Solari at Save the Children in Peru:

"Unfortunately, government authorities are not doing anything about this. They only have signed international agreements with ILO but they don’t follow up them or implement the laws against people who are exploitation mines working children"[69]

Gina Solari is in this quote referring to the problem regarding child labour in mining in Peru. Though ILO is a well known organization regarding labour issues, this confirms that their approach needs to be overlooked. Perhaps ILO must find ways around the discussions with governments, if and when the dialogue is unsuccessful. This is clearly the case in Peru and therefore must be prioritized.

Save the Children is a typical NGO which practice a bottom-up approach. Though it is known that they work at a community level and strengthen the civil society, it has been difficult to recognize their actual projects or programmes in Peru.

[69] Gina Solari, Save the Children, Peru
The MDGs have been designed to be influencing organisations and governments, how they choose to work with the goals is up to each and every part. MDGs are intended to be a global foundation for poverty reduction and to strengthen democratic values. The targets are set to be reached by the year 2015, but this has come to be extremely criticized as the countries around the world do not have the same foreground concerning development. Peru is a suiting example of this, since the country did not develop a stable economy until the 1990s.

In this thesis the second goal has been the most important one from the perspective of child labour. According to MDGs children are suppose to receive an education and this can not be done while working in mines. As it was mentioned before, both Sen and Willis argues that other sources of income must be found in order to reduce child labour. Education is also the way to strengthen the development both financially and socially. Amartya Sen emphasizes the importance of personal freedom, and forced child labour erases the possibility of freedom to education. The thesis claims that education is the key to reduce poverty and which also reduces child labour. Sen mentions instrumental roles of freedom such as political freedom, social freedom and etc. Within the social freedom there is freedom to education and he declares that, education is important for gaining a better life and a greater freedom. Sen also claims that illiteracy is an obstruction concerning the development and hinders the participation in the society.

Katie Willis has given a diverse description regarding development theories. Willis makes clear that while some see development as economic growth and wealth (top-down), others consider it to encompass a way for greater autonomy (bottom-up). Despite the fact that there are different theories and approaches, it has been verified that grassroots-development has constantly altered and been implemented more throughout decades. This is also what the thesis has realized; reduction of child labour must be tackled in many ways, but global goals are not one of them. The government of Peru has apparently difficulties with implementing agreements regarding child labour, nevertheless in times when earthquakes and other natural disasters occur, other things are prioritised. Willis also agrees on the actuality that the MDGs do not achieve what it is meant to:

---

170 Sen, p.165
171 Sen, p.57-58
172 Willis, p.200
"While there have clearly been successes, the fact remains that the Millennium Development Goals are a reflection of the relative failure of development practices to provide even the most basic levels of food, shelter, healthcare and education for millions of the world's people.”

The MDGs might be understandable; however it does not supply the tools for achieving them.

In conclusion, the organisations that have been explored have in fact different approaches in their work in Peru, some of them more successful than others. Furthermore, their approaches are also being criticised or given support by the theories. The difficulties as well as the opportunities with the MDGs have also been discussed. It was argued that the problems with the MDGs should be revised and looked upon. In addition the approach should also be modified since it applies a top-down theory instead of a bottom-up, which is considered to be a more effective approach. In the final question a last effort has been made to give an idea on why a bottom-up approach is preferred. This is also supported by both Sen and Willis, but also by a range of other people, which have been verified.

8 Conclusion

The problems that surround child labour are complex and hold a long history. Many conflicts and struggles around the world effects children in an inhuman way which should not be allowed. But child labour is not a problem which simply can be reduced through agreements and conventions. Who is to be held accountable is still the question. Regulations can be set but the will and understanding needs to be reached before anything can be accomplished.

This thesis has been an interesting journey along with exciting meetings and contacts with compassionate people within different organisations. Our understanding for the matter has increased, both in a positive and negative way. This meaning, that we have gained greater knowledge about the subject, nevertheless realised all the obstacles and complications in the matter.

The database of information is various and vast, however relevant information which provides us with clear answers have been problematic to find this because of the complexity with this issue. No straight answers can be given, there are no universal laws and rules.
concerning reducing child labour. What we have tried to find is the advantages and disadvantages with two various approaches. The top down approach has one obvious advantage, it can provide accountability and be used as a foundation for cooperate work. On the other hand we found that the disadvantages were more frequent.

There are several reasons to why we believe that child labour must be managed with a grassroots-approach. Given that there are many forms of child labour around the world and with different motives, they have to cope with individually. Today most of the research concerns trafficking which includes prostitution and sexual exploitation of children. Although these problems are very significant, we chose to focus on child labour within the mining industry. This can appear to be “old fashioned” problem, but in the industrialised and a globalise world – coal, copper and silver still place a very important role. Therefore we consider this kind of child labour in Peru being relevant as well as it might risk to be placed in the background. As we have mentioned before, Sweden is large importer of copper from Peru, this is an example of how countries besides global goals can be accountable. To keep a track on the market, the workers and also to be certain that the human rights are not being violated is crucial for the work against child labour. This is obviously a question equally for the international arena as each individual government.

A further discussion can be made regarding the West’s accountability concerning reducing the global poverty. We have intentionally chosen to not develop this matter. Since this is an issue containing controversial arguments, such as the West gains a lot from keeping the poorest parts of the world poor. It is from those parts of the world that West can gather cheap labour and materials. It is depressing to declare this theory but this can perhaps shed some light on the frequently asked question, why is nothing happening? What do we think is the answer to these problems? Politicians, governments, organisations, they all claim that more money is needed. This is only one part of the truth. As we have mentioned several times, the tools for knowing how to manage the money and how they should be spent efficiently is lacking. According to Sen aid should not be a part of development at all; the development should come from within. It is important to build a school, but is even more important that people understand the significance of education and the contribution to the individual autonomy and economical development. Development cannot be built upon dependence; it must grow by itself from freedom.

Literature:

- Thurén Torsten, “Källkritik”, Liber AB, 2005

Reports:

- UNESCO – “Education for all, is the world on track?”, Global Monitoring Report, 2002
- “MDGs off track: 17.5 million children have died waiting for change”, 2/5-2007
- ILO report - “State Party Examination of Peru’s Third Periodic Report, 2006
- A World Bank country study, “A New Social Contract for Peru”
- “What’s wrong with the MDGs?”, by Michael Clemens and Tod Moss (www.cgdev.org/content/publications/detail/3940)
- Poverty Profile Executive Summary Republic of Peru, February 2001, Japan Bank for International Cooperation

Articles:

- Gareth Evans and Sahoun Mohamed, “The responsibility to protect”, Foreign affairs, volume 81, nr 6, p. 99-110, 2002
• MDGs require a genuine partnership for their achievement, Statement by International Cooperation for Development and Solidarity (CIDSE) in Consultative Status with the UN Economic and Social Council, 2005

• Is there a ‘fast-track’ to achieving education for all? Pauline Rose, Centre for International Education, Sussex School of Education, University of Sussex, Brighton BN1 9QQ, UK

Internet:

ILO
http://www.ilo.org/public/english/standards/ipec/about/factsheet/facts08.htm

UNICEF
http://www.unicef.se/nyheter/2005/06/15/utbildning_basta_sattet_att_forhindra_barnarbete/
www.unicef.org/infobycountry/peru_13196.htm
www.unicef.org/infobycountry/peru_1645.htm
www.unicef.org/media/media_27328.html

Save the children
www.savethechildren.org.uk/en31_61.htm
www.savethechildren.net/alliance/contactus.html#member
www.savethechildren.net/alliance/where_we_work/MS/mapPE.html#a76e3
www.savethechildren.ca/wherework/southamerica/peruprojects.html
www.savethechildren.net/alliance/about_us/approach/index.html
www.savethechildren.net/alliance/resources/mdg/
http://www.savethechildren.org.uk/scuk/jsp/resources/details.jsp?id=2218&group=resources&section=project&subsection=details

United Nations
www.un.org/milleniumgoals
www.unesco.org/education/efa

Other organisations
http://www.crin.org/docs/CRC41_Peru.doc
www.antislavery.org/homepage/antislavery/childlabour.htm
www.foreignpolicy-infocu.org
www.worldlearning.org
http://www.foreignpolicy-infocus.org/

Government related WebPages
Educational WebPages
http://www.britannica.com/ebi/article-206308
http://archive.idrc.ca/books/reports/1996/34-01e.html
http://www.american.edu/TED/perumine.htm
http://www.demokratitorget.gov.se/content/1/c6/01/94/41/383ecbad.pdf
www.infomine.com/countries/peru.asp
www.mbendi.co.za/indy/ming/sa/pe/p0005.htm
http://www.ecpat.net/eng/ecpat_inter/projects/monitoring/online_database/index.asp
www.american.edu/TED/perumine.htm
www.opendemocracy.net/node/2104/print

Interviews

- Mr. Ndjonkou, Director at ILO office, New York, 27th March and 30th March 2007
- Ms. Solari, Save the Children, Peru